

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Leading Change in Educational Organisations	2
1.2	The Fallacy of Innovation and Transformational Thinking in the Pursuit of Excellence	4
1.3	Sense-Making: Using Technology as a Trigger for Finding Organisational Meaning	9
1.3.1	Sense-Making Is Social in Nature	9
1.3.2	Sense-Making Is Grounded in Identity Construction	10
1.3.3	Sense-Making Is Retrospective	11
1.3.4	Sense-Making Is Enactive of Sensible Environments	12
1.3.5	Sense-Making Is Ongoing	12
1.3.6	Sense-Making Is Focused on and by Extracted Cues	13
1.3.7	Sense-Making Is Driven by Plausibility Rather Than Accuracy	15
1.3.8	Sense-Giving	15
1.4	Scenarios as Tools for Sense-Making and Sense-Giving	17
1.5	Framing Technologically Catalysed Change in Higher Education as a Wicked Problem	20
1.5.1	Problem Formulation	21
1.5.2	Relationship Between Problem and Solution	21
1.5.3	Testability of Potential Solutions	22
1.5.4	Finality of Problem Resolution	23
1.5.5	Tractability of Problem Elements	23
1.5.6	Explanatory Power of Problem Characteristics	24
1.5.7	Level of Analysis	24
1.5.8	Reproducibility of the Problem	24

- 1.5.9 Replicability of the Problem . . . . . 25
- 1.5.10 Responsibility for Problem Resolution . . . . . 25
- 1.6 Structure of the Book . . . . . 29

**Part I Making Sense of the Context for Change in Higher Education**

- 2 Part I Introduction . . . . . 33**
- 3 The Scale and Scope of Higher Education . . . . . 47**
  - 3.1 Globalisation and International Education . . . . . 51
  - 3.2 Élite, Mass and Universal Higher Education . . . . . 57
    - 3.2.1 Access to Higher Education . . . . . 60
    - 3.2.2 Educational Careers . . . . . 62
    - 3.2.3 Curriculum Shifts and the Increasing Scope of  
Higher Education . . . . . 63
    - 3.2.4 Relationships with Academic Faculty . . . . . 64
    - 3.2.5 Organisational Implications of the Shift to Mass  
and Universal Modes . . . . . 67
    - 3.2.6 Coexistence of Élite, Mass and Universal Models . . . . . 68
    - 3.2.7 Impact on National Education Systems . . . . . 71
  - 3.3 Conclusion . . . . . 74
- 4 Internal and External Stakeholders in Higher Education . . . . . 77**
  - 4.1 Students, Parents, Alumni and Donors . . . . . 79
  - 4.2 Academic Faculty . . . . . 82
  - 4.3 Managers, Administrators and Professional Staff . . . . . 85
    - 4.3.1 The Third Space . . . . . 87
  - 4.4 Institutions . . . . . 87
  - 4.5 Employers . . . . . 88
  - 4.6 Vendors . . . . . 89
    - 4.6.1 The Business of Online Programme Management  
OPM . . . . . 91
  - 4.7 Government . . . . . 95
  - 4.8 Society . . . . . 96
  - 4.9 Non-consuming Stakeholders . . . . . 97
  - 4.10 Stakeholder Saliency in Élite, Mass and Universal  
Education . . . . . 97
  - 4.11 Conclusion . . . . . 101
- 5 Financial Challenges, Constraints and Consequences  
of Funding Higher Education . . . . . 103**
  - 5.1 What Does a Degree Cost? . . . . . 104
  - 5.2 Wealth, Inequality and Student Debt . . . . . 109
  - 5.3 Higher Education and Productivity Growth . . . . . 112
    - 5.3.1 Personal Economic Benefit of Higher Education . . . . . 113

5.3.2	National Economic Benefit of Higher Education . . . . .	116
5.3.3	Sustaining the Economic Benefit of Higher Education Over a Lifetime . . . . .	118
5.4	Higher Education’s Cost Disease . . . . .	119
5.5	Conclusion . . . . .	120
<b>6</b>	<b>Qualifications as a Defining Feature of Higher Education</b> . . . . .	<b>123</b>
6.1	Qualifications as Positional Goods . . . . .	124
6.2	Qualifications as Material Goods—The Myth of Human Capital Theory . . . . .	128
6.3	Systemic Responses to the Growing Complexity of Qualification Systems . . . . .	131
6.4	The Declining Value of Formal Qualifications . . . . .	133
6.5	Conclusion . . . . .	138
 <b>Part II Technology</b>		
<b>7</b>	<b>Part II Introduction</b> . . . . .	<b>143</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>Technology as a Catalyst for Change</b> . . . . .	<b>147</b>
8.1	The Social Impact of Technological Change . . . . .	149
8.2	Predicting the Future of Technology in a World of Accelerating Change . . . . .	155
8.3	The Cognitive Challenge of Multiple Time Horizons . . . . .	160
8.4	Technology as a Platform . . . . .	162
8.5	Conclusion . . . . .	166
<b>9</b>	<b>Lessons from the Failure of the Virtual University</b> . . . . .	<b>167</b>
9.1	Failures . . . . .	170
9.1.1	Knowledge Universe, UNext and Cardean University . . . . .	170
9.1.2	AllLearn . . . . .	171
9.1.3	Fathom . . . . .	172
9.1.4	Jones International University . . . . .	173
9.1.5	US Open University . . . . .	174
9.1.6	The UK eUniversity Worldwide . . . . .	174
9.1.7	Babson Interactive, NYUOnline and Virtual Temple . . . . .	176
9.1.8	Universitas 21 Global . . . . .	177
9.1.9	Global University Alliance . . . . .	179
9.2	Successes . . . . .	180
9.2.1	University of Phoenix . . . . .	180
9.2.2	Western Governors University . . . . .	181
9.2.3	Capella University . . . . .	182
9.2.4	eCornell, Penn State World Campus and UMassOnline . . . . .	183

- 9.3 Making Sense of the Virtual University . . . . . 184
  - 9.3.1 The Race to Be the First to Succeed . . . . . 185
  - 9.3.2 Not All Qualifications Are Created Equal . . . . . 186
  - 9.3.3 The World Is Not That Flat . . . . . 188
  - 9.3.4 IT Doesn’t Matter . . . . . 189
  - 9.3.5 Sustaining the Cost of Business in a Dynamic World . . . . . 190
  - 9.3.6 Managing Collaborations with Diverse Partners . . . . . 191
  - 9.3.7 Reputations and Brands . . . . . 192
  - 9.3.8 Faculty Engagement . . . . . 194
  - 9.3.9 Strategic Vision and Leadership . . . . . 195
- 9.4 Conclusion . . . . . 196
- 10 Technology and Modern Students—The Digital Natives Fallacy . . . . . 197**
  - 10.1 The New Literacies of the Digital World . . . . . 199
  - 10.2 The Practice Effect . . . . . 202
  - 10.3 Multitasking . . . . . 204
  - 10.4 Conclusion: Deconstructing the Technocratic Narrative of the Digital Native . . . . . 209
- 11 Open Education: A Parable of Change in Higher Education . . . . . 213**
  - 11.1 What Does ‘Open’ Mean? . . . . . 215
    - 11.1.1 Open Technology . . . . . 215
    - 11.1.2 Open Societies . . . . . 218
    - 11.1.3 Open Democracy . . . . . 222
    - 11.1.4 Open Economies . . . . . 223
    - 11.1.5 Open Speech . . . . . 223
    - 11.1.6 Open Reasoning . . . . . 225
    - 11.1.7 Open Provision . . . . . 227
  - 11.2 Massive Open Online Courses . . . . . 227
    - 11.2.1 The Race to Be the First to Succeed . . . . . 229
    - 11.2.2 Sustaining the Cost of Business in a Dynamic World . . . . . 231
    - 11.2.3 IT Doesn’t Matter . . . . . 233
    - 11.2.4 Faculty Engagement with MOOCs . . . . . 234
    - 11.2.5 Managing Collaborations with Diverse Partners . . . . . 235
    - 11.2.6 The World Is Not That Flat . . . . . 236
    - 11.2.7 Reputations and Brands . . . . . 238
    - 11.2.8 Not All Qualifications Are Created Equal . . . . . 238
    - 11.2.9 Strategic Vision and Leadership . . . . . 241
  - 11.3 Badges and Micro-credentials . . . . . 243
  - 11.4 Conclusion . . . . . 247

**12 The Modern Technological University** . . . . . 253

12.1 The Impact of Technology on Scholarly Work . . . . . 254

    12.1.1 Technology Enabled Academic Communities . . . . . 255

    12.1.2 Technology and Academic Use of Knowledge . . . . . 256

12.2 Technology and the Evolution of University Teaching . . . . . 258

    12.2.1 Technology and Numbers . . . . . 259

    12.2.2 Learning Management Systems and the No  
Significant Difference Phenomenon . . . . . 260

    12.2.3 Clickers and Classroom Feedback Systems . . . . . 262

12.3 Technology and the Evolution of the University  
Infrastructure . . . . . 264

    12.3.1 Learning Spaces and the Affirmation of the Physical  
Campus in a Digital World . . . . . 264

    12.3.2 Cloud . . . . . 267

    12.3.3 BYOD: Staff and Students Creating Their Own  
Infrastructure . . . . . 269

12.4 Technology and the Administration of Universities . . . . . 271

    12.4.1 Learning and Academic Analytics . . . . . 272

    12.4.2 Ethical and Organisational Challenges Raised  
by Analytics . . . . . 276

12.5 Conclusion: The Role of Technology in the Systemic  
Change of Higher Education Organisations . . . . . 278

**Part III Sensemaking and Change in Higher Education**

**13 Part III Introduction** . . . . . 283

**14 Making Sense of the University’s Purposes, Values  
and Culture** . . . . . 289

14.1 Organisational Values and Culture . . . . . 291

14.2 Organisational Purposes . . . . . 295

14.3 Defining the Core Ideology of the University . . . . . 298

14.4 Organisational Structure and the Management of Higher  
Education . . . . . 300

14.5 ITP-Z Case Study . . . . . 303

    14.5.1 Reversing the Decline in Capability . . . . . 306

    14.5.2 Strategic Investment in Key Programmes . . . . . 306

    14.5.3 Sense-Giving Models . . . . . 307

    14.5.4 Staff Skills Development . . . . . 307

    14.5.5 Impact of the Change Activities . . . . . 309

    14.5.6 Key Lessons . . . . . 310

14.6 Conclusion . . . . . 312

**15 Quality as Sense-Making** . . . . . 315

15.1 Gresham’s Law, Trust and the Unintended Consequences of  
Misaligned Quality Systems . . . . . 319

- 15.2 Stakeholder Influence on the Definition of Quality . . . . . 325
- 15.3 Quality Models and Frameworks . . . . . 329
- 15.4 Quality as Sense-Making . . . . . 337
  - 15.4.1 Social . . . . . 338
  - 15.4.2 Identity . . . . . 338
  - 15.4.3 Retrospective . . . . . 339
  - 15.4.4 Enactive . . . . . 339
  - 15.4.5 Ongoing . . . . . 339
  - 15.4.6 Cues . . . . . 339
  - 15.4.7 Plausibility . . . . . 340
  - 15.4.8 Sense-Giving . . . . . 340
- 15.5 Defining a Framework for Quality as Sense-Making . . . . . 341
- 15.6 Conclusion: Starting the Quality Sense-Making  
Conversation . . . . . 345
- 16 Using Evidence to Guide Sense-Making . . . . . 349**
  - 16.1 Quality Indicators . . . . . 354
  - 16.2 Validation of Quality Frameworks and Indicators . . . . . 355
  - 16.3 Quality Ranking of Educational Institutions . . . . . 361
  - 16.4 Total Quality Management . . . . . 365
  - 16.5 Capability Maturity Models . . . . . 367
  - 16.6 Case Study: Using the EMM to Analyse a Sector . . . . . 372
  - 16.7 Collaborative Benchmarking . . . . . 383
  - 16.8 Conclusion . . . . . 384
- 17 Making Sense of Change . . . . . 387**
  - 17.1 Why Change? . . . . . 392
  - 17.2 Organisational Change Theories . . . . . 394
    - 17.2.1 Systems Change Models . . . . . 396
    - 17.2.2 Biological Change Models . . . . . 397
    - 17.2.3 Rational or Teleological Change Models . . . . . 398
    - 17.2.4 Institutional, Resource and Contingency Change  
Models . . . . . 399
    - 17.2.5 Political and Psychological Change Models . . . . . 399
    - 17.2.6 Social, Postmodern and Cultural Models  
of Change . . . . . 400
  - 17.3 Sustaining and Disruptive Change . . . . . 401
  - 17.4 Conclusion: Change Leadership . . . . . 406
- Part IV Leading Change in Higher Education Through Sense-Giving**
- 18 Part IV Introduction . . . . . 411**
- 19 Strategic Planning as Sense-Making . . . . . 413**
  - 19.1 Strategy and Uncertainty . . . . . 415

- 19.2 Porters Five Forces as a Tool for Sense-Making . . . . . 419
  - 19.2.1 Porter’s Threat of Substitute Products . . . . . 419
  - 19.2.2 Porter’s Threat of New Entrants . . . . . 421
  - 19.2.3 Porter’s Bargaining Power of Buyers . . . . . 425
  - 19.2.4 Bargaining Power of Suppliers . . . . . 426
  - 19.2.5 Rivalry Among Existing Competitors . . . . . 427
- 19.3 Using the Cues from MOOCs to Illustrate Strategy as Sense-Making . . . . . 429
  - 19.3.1 Threat of Substitute Products . . . . . 431
  - 19.3.2 Threat of New Entrants . . . . . 432
  - 19.3.3 Power of Buyers . . . . . 433
  - 19.3.4 Bargaining Power of Suppliers . . . . . 434
  - 19.3.5 Rivalry Among Existing Competitors . . . . . 434
- 19.4 Conclusion . . . . . 435
- 20 Futures Scenarios as Tools for Sense-Giving and Sense-Making . . . . . 437**
  - 20.1 An Introduction to Scenario Modelling for Change . . . . . 439
  - 20.2 Scenario Modelling Applied to Higher Education Through the Lens of the Forces for Change . . . . . 441
    - 20.2.1 Adam Smith’s Invisible Hand . . . . . 441
    - 20.2.2 Cardinal Newman’s Educational Theocracy . . . . . 447
    - 20.2.3 The Chinese Dragon . . . . . 449
    - 20.2.4 Dr. Strangelove’s Solution . . . . . 450
    - 20.2.5 The Digital Agora . . . . . 452
    - 20.2.6 The Economic Powerhouse . . . . . 454
    - 20.2.7 The Expanding Universe of H.G. Wells . . . . . 455
    - 20.2.8 The Ivory Cybertower . . . . . 457
    - 20.2.9 The Malthusian Collapse . . . . . 459
    - 20.2.10 Marxist Collective Ownership of Education . . . . . 461
    - 20.2.11 The Modern Academy . . . . . 463
    - 20.2.12 Rousseau and the Spiritual Malaise . . . . . 464
    - 20.2.13 The Star Trek Academy . . . . . 466
    - 20.2.14 The Technological Singularity . . . . . 468
    - 20.2.15 Xanadu . . . . . 471
  - 20.3 Conclusion . . . . . 473
- 21 Sense-Giving and Leadership . . . . . 479**
  - 21.1 Bringing a Diverse Group of People with You . . . . . 480
  - 21.2 Leadership Sense-Giving Strategies in Response to the Forces for Change . . . . . 481
    - 21.2.1 Scale . . . . . 483
    - 21.2.2 Stakeholders . . . . . 484
    - 21.2.3 Finance . . . . . 485
    - 21.2.4 Qualifications . . . . . 486

- 21.2.5 Technology . . . . . 487
- 21.3 Sense-Giving Leadership as an Antidote for Transformation Thinking . . . . . 489
  
- Part V Conclusion**
- 22 Conclusion** . . . . . 495
  - 22.1 Summarising the Wicked Problem . . . . . 495
  - 22.2 Engaging with the Wicked Problem . . . . . 501
  - 22.3 Realising a World Without Educational Limits . . . . . 509
- References** . . . . . 511





<http://www.springer.com/978-981-10-7619-0>

Shaping the University of the Future  
Using Technology to Catalyse Change in University  
Learning and Teaching

Marshall, S.J.

2018, XVIII, 592 p. 32 illus., 13 illus. in color., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-981-10-7619-0