

# Contents

<b>1 Introduction: An Interdisciplinary Analysis of the Mission of European Higher Education Institutions and Potential External Constraints</b> . . . . .	1
1.1 Introduction . . . . .	2
1.2 Examining EU Law Constraints on HEIs. . . . .	3
1.3 Historical and Theoretical Background . . . . .	5
1.3.1 The Original Non-economic Purpose of European HEIs. . . . .	6
1.3.2 The Republican University in the United States . . . . .	7
1.3.3 Gradual Commodification of European HEIs . . . . .	8
1.3.4 HEIs in the EU in the Context of European Integration Theory . . . . .	12
1.4 Conclusion . . . . .	15
References. . . . .	15
<b>2 The Position of Higher Education Institutions in EU Policy and Law</b> . . . . .	21
2.1 Introduction . . . . .	22
2.2 Locating HEIs in European Policy. . . . .	22
2.2.1 Supranational EU Policy on Education and Research and Development . . . . .	23
2.2.1.1 EU Education Policy . . . . .	24
2.2.1.2 Diploma Recognition . . . . .	25
2.2.1.3 EU Research and Development Policy. . . . .	26
2.2.1.4 Interim Conclusion on Supranational EU Policy. . . . .	27
2.2.2 EU Soft Law: The Lisbon/Europe 2020 Strategy. . . . .	28
2.2.3 The Bologna Process . . . . .	29
2.2.4 Interim Conclusion: The Location of HEIs in EU Policy . . . . .	30
2.3 Spill-over from Directly Applicable EU Law . . . . .	32
2.3.1 Union Citizenship. . . . .	33
2.3.1.1 Union Citizenship and HEIs. . . . .	33
2.3.1.2 The Infringement Procedures Against Austria and Belgium . . . . .	35

2.3.1.3	Interim Conclusion on Union Citizenship and HEIs. . . . .	37
2.3.2	The Free Movement Provisions . . . . .	38
2.3.3	The Competition Rules. . . . .	40
2.3.4	Public Procurement Law . . . . .	40
2.4	Conclusion . . . . .	42
	References. . . . .	43
<b>3</b>	<b>Higher Education Institutions and EU Competition Law. . . . .</b>	<b>47</b>
3.1	Introduction . . . . .	48
3.2	Application of EU Competition Law on HEIs?—The Notions of ‘Undertaking’ and ‘SGEIs’. . . . .	49
3.2.1	The Notion of ‘Undertaking’ . . . . .	50
3.2.2	Anti-competitive Regulation of Markets by Member States. . . . .	52
3.2.3	SGEIs . . . . .	54
3.2.3.1	Terminology . . . . .	54
3.2.3.2	The Development of SGEIs . . . . .	56
3.2.3.3	The Application of Article 106(2) TFEU . . . . .	56
3.2.3.4	Interim Conclusion on SGEIs . . . . .	59
3.2.4	HEIs . . . . .	59
3.2.4.1	Higher Education . . . . .	61
3.2.4.2	Research . . . . .	63
3.2.4.3	Interim Conclusion on HEIs. . . . .	67
3.2.5	Interim Conclusion. . . . .	68
3.3	Consequences Resulting from the Application of EU Competition Law on HEIs . . . . .	69
3.3.1	Market Definition . . . . .	70
3.3.2	Article 101 TFEU. . . . .	73
3.3.2.1	Price Fixing . . . . .	76
3.3.2.2	Market Foreclosure or Disturbance . . . . .	81
3.3.2.3	Market Division . . . . .	83
3.3.2.4	Research Co-operation . . . . .	85
3.3.2.5	Limiting Markets . . . . .	86
3.3.3	Article 102 TFEU. . . . .	86
3.3.3.1	Exploitative Abuses . . . . .	88
3.3.3.2	Exclusionary Abuses . . . . .	90
3.3.4	Mergers. . . . .	92
3.3.5	State Aid Law. . . . .	94
3.3.5.1	Hidden Aid . . . . .	100
3.3.5.2	Public Funding of Higher Education and Research. . . . .	103
3.3.5.3	Aid Through Knowledge Transfer . . . . .	106
3.3.6	Interim Conclusion. . . . .	108

3.4	Conclusion	109
	References	110
<b>4</b>	<b>The Structure of Research Funding in Germany, the Netherlands and England (UK)</b>	<b>115</b>
4.1	Introduction	116
4.2	England (UK)	119
4.2.1	General Overview	120
4.2.1.1	Public Research	120
4.2.1.2	Non-public Research	122
4.2.2	Research in Public HEIs	123
4.2.2.1	Research as a Statutory Task of HEIs	123
4.2.2.2	Public Research Funding	125
4.2.2.3	Non-state Funding	128
4.2.2.4	Full Costing	130
4.2.3	Interim Conclusion on England	131
4.3	The Netherlands	132
4.3.1	General Overview	132
4.3.1.1	Public Research	133
4.3.1.2	Non-public Research	135
4.3.2	Research in Public HEIs	136
4.3.2.1	Research as a Statutory Task of HEIs	137
4.3.2.2	Public Research Funding	137
4.3.2.3	Non-state Funding	140
4.3.2.4	Full Costing	141
4.3.3	Interim Conclusion on the Netherlands	142
4.4	Germany	143
4.4.1	General Overview	144
4.4.1.1	Public Research	144
4.4.1.2	Non-public Research	147
4.4.2	Research in Public HEIs	148
4.4.2.1	Research as a Statutory Task of HEIs	148
4.4.2.2	Public Research Funding	149
4.4.2.3	Non-state Funding	152
4.4.2.4	Full Costing	154
4.4.3	Interim Conclusion on Germany	155
4.5	HEI Research in the Three Countries and EU Competition Law	156
4.5.1	Potential Tensions with Competition Law	157
4.5.2	Exemptions	161
4.6	Conclusion	161
	References	163
<b>5</b>	<b>Empirical Study</b>	<b>169</b>
5.1	Introduction	171
5.2	Methodology	172

5.2.1	Strategic Sampling . . . . .	172
5.2.2	Interviews . . . . .	174
	5.2.2.1 Interview Guide . . . . .	174
	5.2.2.2 Access and Interview Situation . . . . .	178
5.2.3	Ethics . . . . .	180
5.2.4	Data Analysis . . . . .	180
5.2.5	Interim Conclusion . . . . .	181
5.3	England . . . . .	182
5.3.1	Awareness of Competition Law . . . . .	184
5.3.2	Economic Activity . . . . .	184
5.3.3	Full Costing . . . . .	187
5.3.4	Market Foreclosure . . . . .	189
5.3.5	Refusal to Enter into Contractual Relations and Preferred Partners . . . . .	189
5.3.6	Economically Unjustified or Discriminatory Contract Conditions . . . . .	190
5.3.7	Anti-competitive Use of IPRs . . . . .	191
5.3.8	Anti-competitive Research Co-operation . . . . .	193
5.3.9	Market Division . . . . .	194
5.3.10	Limiting Markets . . . . .	195
5.3.11	Commissioning of Research . . . . .	195
5.3.12	State Aid Through Staff Knowledge . . . . .	196
5.3.13	Exemptions . . . . .	197
5.3.14	SGEIs . . . . .	199
5.3.15	Interim Conclusion . . . . .	200
5.4	The Netherlands . . . . .	201
5.4.1	Awareness of Competition Law . . . . .	203
5.4.2	Economic Activity . . . . .	203
5.4.3	Full Costing . . . . .	206
5.4.4	Market Foreclosure . . . . .	208
5.4.5	Refusal to Enter into Contractual Relations and Preferred Partners . . . . .	208
5.4.6	Economically Unjustified or Discriminatory Contract Conditions . . . . .	209
5.4.7	Anti-competitive Use of IPRs . . . . .	210
5.4.8	Anti-competitive Research Co-operation . . . . .	211
5.4.9	Market Division . . . . .	211
5.4.10	Limiting Markets . . . . .	214
5.4.11	Commissioning of Research . . . . .	214
5.4.12	State Aid Through Staff Knowledge . . . . .	214
5.4.13	Exemptions . . . . .	215
5.4.14	SGEIs . . . . .	216
5.4.15	Interim Conclusion . . . . .	217

- 5.5 Germany . . . . . 218
  - 5.5.1 Awareness of Competition Law . . . . . 220
  - 5.5.2 Economic Activity . . . . . 220
  - 5.5.3 Full Costing . . . . . 223
  - 5.5.4 Market Foreclosure. . . . . 224
  - 5.5.5 Refusal to Enter into Contractual Relations  
and Preferred Partners . . . . . 225
  - 5.5.6 Economically Unjustified or Discriminatory  
Contract Conditions . . . . . 226
  - 5.5.7 Anti-competitive Use of IPRs . . . . . 227
  - 5.5.8 Anti-competitive Research Co-operation . . . . . 228
  - 5.5.9 Market Division . . . . . 228
  - 5.5.10 Limiting Markets . . . . . 229
  - 5.5.11 Commissioning of Research. . . . . 229
  - 5.5.12 State Aid Through Staff Knowledge . . . . . 230
  - 5.5.13 Exemptions. . . . . 231
  - 5.5.14 SGEIs . . . . . 232
  - 5.5.15 Interim Conclusion. . . . . 232
- 5.6 Conclusion . . . . . 234
- References . . . . . 236
- 6 Conclusion: Higher Education Institutions in the EU  
Between Competition and Public Service . . . . . 239**
  - 6.1 Introduction . . . . . 240
  - 6.2 European HEIs and EU Law . . . . . 241
  - 6.3 Competition Law Constraints on Research in Germany,  
the Netherlands and England . . . . . 244
  - 6.4 Constraints Faced by the HEI Sector . . . . . 250
  - 6.5 Tentative Alignment of Research Policy and State Aid Law  
as a Way Forward? . . . . . 255
  - 6.6 Towards an EU Level HEI Policy Beyond Economic Integration . . . 258
  - 6.7 Final Conclusion . . . . . 263
  - References . . . . . 264
- Annex: Interview Questions . . . . . 267**
- Index . . . . . 271**



<http://www.springer.com/978-94-6265-167-8>

Higher Education Institutions in the EU: Between  
Competition and Public Service

Gideon, A.

2017, XXXIII, 272 p. 1 illus., Hardcover

ISBN: 978-94-6265-167-8

A product of T.M.C. Asser Press