# Contents

## 1 Introduction

1.1 The Social Importance of Professional Education ........................................ 2
1.2 Patterns in Professional Work: Introducing Epistemic Forms and Games ................. 4
1.3 Seeing Through the Changing Surface of Professional Work and Knowledge ................. 6
1.4 Research on Education, Learning and Expertise: From Shifts in Fashion to an Integrated Account ........................................ 7
1.5 Our Empirical Research ............................................................................. 7
1.6 Overview of the Book: Key Ideas .............................................................. 8
   1.6.1 Part 1 .................................................................................................. 9
   1.6.2 Part 2 .................................................................................................. 10
   1.6.3 Part 3 .................................................................................................. 12
   1.6.4 Part 4 .................................................................................................. 16
1.7 Reading the Book: Online Glossary and Abbreviations ........................................ 17
References ........................................................................................................ 17

## 2 Professional Work in Contemporary Contexts

2.1 Professions and Professional Work ............................................................. 20
2.2 Demands of Contemporary Professional Work ............................................. 26
   2.2.1 Workplace Readiness ........................................................................ 26
   2.2.2 Managerialism, Performativity and Organised Professionalism .............. 28
   2.2.3 The Mounting Demands of Epistemic Work ........................................ 30
2.3 Preparation for the Professions in Higher Education ........................................ 32
2.4 Approaches within Professional Education .................................................. 33
   2.4.1 Case-Based Learning ....................................................................... 35
   2.4.2 Problem-Based Learning .................................................................. 36
   2.4.3 Inquiry-Based Learning .................................................................... 37
   2.4.4 Internships ...................................................................................... 37
3 Defining the Problem: Four Epistemic Projects in Professional Work and Education

3.1 Crafting Expert Practitioners

3.2 The Reflective-Rational Project: From Rational Knowledge to Reflective Practice to Rational Reflection

3.3 The Reflective-Embodied Project: Skill and the Ontological Turn in Practice

3.4 Representational and Performative Accounts and the Need to Cross Boundaries

3.5 The Knowledge-Building Project: From Practice as Knowledge Transfer to Knowing as Epistemic Practice

3.6 The Relational Project: From Individualistic to Relational Expertise

3.7 Combining the Four Epistemic Projects: Knowledge for Doing and Knowledge for Innovation and Learning

References

4 The Shapes Taken by Personal Professional Knowledge

4.1 What Knowledge Is

4.2 Public, Personal and Organisational Knowledge

4.2.1 Public Knowledge

4.2.2 Personal Knowledge

4.2.3 Organisational or Group Knowledge

4.2.4 Sociopolitical Knowledge

4.3 Doing and Understanding

4.4 Knowledge and Knowing

4.5 Tacit Knowledge and Explicit Learning

4.6 Actionable Knowledge

4.6.1 An Example: Knowledge in Teaching

4.6.2 Drawing Some Implications for Professional Education

References

5 Professional Knowledge and Knowing in Shared Epistemic Spaces: The Person-Plus Perspective

5.1 Relational Expertise and Inter-professional Work

5.2 (Re)presenting Knowledge and Shared Epistemic Labour

5.3 Continuity of Practice and Innovation: Knowing with and Through Objects

5.4 Linking Epistemic Practice with Knowledge Culture
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Knowledge Space and Epistemic Assemblage</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Creating Assemblages for Local Knowledge Work</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Knowledge and Knowing in Shared Epistemic Spaces</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Understanding the Mind</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Understanding the Human Mind and Learning: Experience, Brain, Environment and Culture</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>From Cognition as Structure to Cognition as Coordination and Enaction</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Learning and Conceptual Change: Formal Concepts and Experiential Knowledge</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>Negative Rationalism: Students’ Experiential Knowledge Seen as a Problem to Be Overcome</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>Positive Empiricism: Students’ Experiential Knowledge as a Productive Resource</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>Conceptual Change: Coherent Structures and Knowledge-in-Pieces</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4</td>
<td>Summary: What Changes in Conceptual Change?</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Troublesome Knowledge and Threshold Concepts</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>Issues with Threshold Concepts from a Grounded Perspective</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Grounding Conceptual Knowledge in Experience: Situated Concepts</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Conceptual Understanding and Actionable Knowledge</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Transfer</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.1</td>
<td>The Model Perspective</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.2</td>
<td>The Module Perspective</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.3</td>
<td>The Modality Perspective</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Dynamic Expertise, Transfer and Innovation</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.1</td>
<td>Dynamic Expertise as Coordination</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.2</td>
<td>Dynamic Transfer and Innovation</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Epistemic Thinking</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Knowledge and Knowing as an Open System</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Personal Epistemology, Epistemic Thinking and Epistemic Resources</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Personal Epistemology: Classical Accounts</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1</td>
<td>Epistemological Development</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2</td>
<td>Epistemic Beliefs and Theories: Multiple Dimensions</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.3</td>
<td>Commonalities and Extensions</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Personal Epistemology Research: Critique and New Directions</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.5 The Division of Cognitive Labour: Epistemological Implications ................................... 174
7.6 The Changing Scope of Epistemic Cognition .................................................. 176
7.7 The Epistemic Resources View ........................................................................ 181
7.8 Epistemic Affordances ....................................................................................... 183
  7.8.1 A Distributed View of Affordances ............................................................. 184
  7.8.2 Pragmatic Affordances and Epistemic Affordances .................................... 185
7.9 Cognitive and Epistemic Flexibility .................................................................... 186
References .............................................................................................................. 191

8 Objects, Things and Artefacts in Professional Learning and Doing ............................................ 195
  8.1 Assessment Tasks in Professional Education ...................................................... 195
  8.2 Knowing Through Objects: Objectual Practices in Learning and Work ............... 198
  8.3 Motives, Objects and Things ............................................................................. 201
    8.3.1 Predmet and Objekt ............................................................................... 202
    8.3.2 Objects and Things ............................................................................... 203
    8.3.3 Motive, Material Object and Thing ......................................................... 204
    8.3.4 Knowledge Work, Epistemic Objects and Epistemic Artefacts .................. 206
  8.4 Finding Objects for Professional Education and Reifying Them in Material Artefacts ........................................... 207
  8.5 A Case: Assembling Objects and Things in an Epistemic Artefact ......................... 212
  8.6 Perception, Skill and Artefact .......................................................................... 215
  8.7 Understanding Tasks and Artefacts ................................................................... 219
  8.8 Knowledge Work and Conceptual Artefacts from the Perspective of Professional Practice ........................................... 222
    8.8.1 Materiality, Embodiment and Context ...................................................... 224
    8.8.2 Hidden Knowledge Work ....................................................................... 225
    8.8.3 Materiality of Inscription ....................................................................... 226
References .............................................................................................................. 228

9 Epistemic Tools and Artefacts in Epistemic Practices and Systems .............................................. 233
  9.1 Epistemic Practice ............................................................................................. 234
  9.2 Epistemic Tools ................................................................................................. 237
    9.2.1 Tools and Symbolic Signs ...................................................................... 238
    9.2.2 Epistemic Tools as Bridges Between Physical and Mental Worlds ........... 241
    9.2.3 How Epistemic Qualities of Tools Arise in Practice .................................. 243
  9.3 Action, Meaning and (Epistemic) Practice ......................................................... 244
9.4 Understanding Epistemic Qualities of Artefacts: Results from Artefact Analysis .................................................. 248

9.4.1 Epistemic Qualities of Artefacts Produced by Students .................................................. 250

9.4.2 A Case: Constructing the Nursing Guidelines .................................................. 252

9.5 Epistemic Openness: Knowledge Practice Systems .............................................. 255

9.5.1 Science and Research .................................................. 256

9.5.2 Education .................................................. 256

9.5.3 Organisation and Profession .................................................. 258

9.5.4 Commonalities Across Science, Education and Profession .................................................. 259

References .................................................. 261

10 Inscribing Professional Knowledge and Knowing ............................................. 265

10.1 Inscriptions in Professional Work and Learning .................................................. 268

10.2 Functional Properties of Knowledge Inscriptions .................................................. 270

10.3 Skill for Seeing, Inscribing and Knowing the World .................................................. 273

10.4 A Case: Becoming a School Counsellor Through Inscribing Students’ Behaviour .................................................. 275

10.4.1 Some Insights This Case Provides into Learning and Professional Inscriptions .................................................. 277

10.5 Skill for Seeing, Inscribing and Knowing Work .................................................. 282

10.5.1 Inscriptions for Work .................................................. 283

10.5.2 Inscriptions of Work .................................................. 284

10.5.3 Inscriptions within Work .................................................. 286

10.6 Analysis of Students’ Inscriptions of Professional Knowledge and Work .................................................. 287

10.6.1 Inscriptions as Inquiry Carriers .................................................. 288

10.6.2 Inscriptions as Discourse Carriers .................................................. 290

10.7 Insights into the Functional (Pedagogical) Properties of Learning Inscriptions .................................................. 291

10.7.1 Learning Habits Through Inscriptional Work .................................................. 292

10.7.2 Linking Professional Inscriptional Work and Innovation .................................................. 294

10.7.3 Inscriptions of Knowledge and Professional Actionable Knowledge .................................................. 296

10.8 From Inscribing to (Re)presenting: Personal, System and Enactive Views of Inscriptions .................................................. 297

References .................................................. 299

11 Inscriptions Shaping Mind, Meaning and Action ............................................. 303

11.1 How Meanings Get Expressed and Inscribed in Knowledge Production .................................................. 307

11.2 How Meanings Get Expressed and Inscribed in Professional Learning .................................................. 309
11.3 Unpacking the Semiotic Nature of Professional Knowledge Work .................................................. 311
  11.3.1 Comparing Students’ Epistemic Artefacts to Those Produced in Science .............................. 312
11.4 What Ways of Knowing and Slices of Knowledge Get Inscribed? .............................................. 315
  11.4.1 Example of Clinical Performance Package: Blending Epistemic Spaces ................................. 315
  11.4.2 Limitations of the Traditional Semiotic Account with Respect to Innovation in Professional Work ..... 320
11.5 Conceptual Integration and Material Blending ................................................................. 321
  11.5.1 Blending Conceptual and Material Structures .......................................................... 324
11.6 An Example: Blending, Projecting and Enacting Through Inscribing a Lesson ................................... 328
11.7 Creating Actionable Epistemic Spaces Through Grounding and Blending ..................................... 334
References .......................................................................................................................... 338

12 Epistemic Tools, Instruments and Infrastructure in Professional Knowledge Work and Learning .......... 341
  12.1 Epistemic Tools, Infrastructures and Practices .................................................................. 342
    12.1.1 Understanding and Encountering Infrastructure ...................................................... 343
    12.1.2 Tools .................................................................................................................. 344
  12.2 Instrumental Genesis: Linking Tool and Game .................................................................. 346
    12.2.1 Tool as Artefact: Intrinsic Features ..................................................................... 347
    12.2.2 Extrinsic Features of Tools: Action Schemes ......................................................... 348
    12.2.3 Linking Tool and Action Schemes ......................................................................... 349
  12.3 Epistemic Tools and Infrastructures for Professional Work ................................................... 351
    12.3.1 Elements of Epistemic Infrastructure in Professions .................................................. 353
    12.3.2 Innovation, Tool-Making and Tool Use ................................................................ 355
  12.4 An Example: Epistemic Infrastructure for Child Behavioural Assessment ............................... 359
    12.4.1 Concluding Points from This Case ....................................................................... 362
References .......................................................................................................................... 363

13 Taxonomies of Epistemic Tools and Infrastructures ........................................................................ 367
  13.1 A Taxonomy of Epistemic Tools ...................................................................................... 369
    13.1.1 Epistemic Frames .............................................................................................. 369
    13.1.2 Epistemic Devices ........................................................................................... 370
    13.1.3 Epistemic Instruments and Equipment ................................................................ 374
  13.2 A Taxonomy of Epistemic Infrastructure ........................................................................... 375
    13.2.1 Codes ................................................................................................................ 376
    13.2.2 Conceptual Infrastructure ............................................................................... 381
    13.2.3 Information Infrastructure .............................................................................. 382
    13.2.4 Learning Infrastructure .................................................................................... 383
16.2 Actionable Knowing as Embodied Social Practices in the Material World ........................................ 467
  16.2.1 Socio-material Organising of Action ................. 468
  16.2.2 Socio-material Organising of Cognition ............ 468
16.3 How Matter Matters in Professional Knowledge Work .... 469
  16.3.1 Knowledge Embodied in Physical Tools .............. 470
  16.3.2 Knowledge Embodied in Inscriptional Tools ....... 472
  16.3.3 Knowledge Embodied in Bodily Skills and Senses ... 474
  16.3.4 Knowledge Embodied in the World ................ 477
16.4 Learning and Thinking with Social Others ................ 479
  16.4.1 The Socially Extended Mind ...................... 479
  16.4.2 Dialectical, Dialogical and Triialogical Perspectives ........................................ 480
  16.4.3 Implications for Professional Work and Learning .... 482
16.5 Four Kinds of Mediation: Tools, Social Others, Artefacts and Self ........................................ 484
16.6 Concluding Points: Learning in ‘Thin’ and ‘Thick’ Social and Material Environments .................... 488
References .................................................................. 491

17 Conceptual Resourcefulness and Actionable Concepts: Concepts Revisited ..................................... 495
  17.1 Concepts Revisited ....................................... 495
  17.2 Some Examples: ‘Constructivism’ and Other Concepts in Abstract Notions, Contexts and Actions ........ 496
  17.3 Concepts in Mind and in Discourse .................... 500
  17.4 Abstract, Contextual and Situated Concepts .......... 502
    17.4.1 Abstract Concepts .................................. 502
    17.4.2 Contextual Concepts .............................. 503
    17.4.3 Situated Concepts .................................. 505
  17.5 Actionable Concepts .................................... 509
  17.6 A Case: Constructing Actionable Concepts ............ 511
    17.6.1 Creating Actionable Pedagogical Concepts for Teaching by Combining Concepts .................. 512
    17.6.2 How Actionable Concepts Are Grounded in Experiences and Actions ......................... 514
    17.6.3 How Are Actionable Concepts Linked to Language? .......................................................... 514
  17.7 Actionable Concepts as Concepts That Mean and Matter ...................................................... 517
References .................................................................. 520

18 Epistemic Resourcefulness for Actionable Knowing ............ 523
  18.1 Understanding Epistemic Resources ...................... 523
  18.2 Epistemic Resources in Discourse and the Mind ....... 526
    18.2.1 Epistemic Knowledge as Discourse ............... 526
    18.2.2 Epistemic Knowledge as Cognition ................ 528
18.2.3 Epistemic Knowledge: Bridging Discourse and Mind ........................................... 531
18.3 Actionable Epistemic Resources ................................................................. 534
18.4 Linking Epistemic and Conceptual: Dynamic View of Conceptual Learning ............... 540
18.5 Framing, Stability and Coherence ................................................................. 541
  18.5.1 Stability vs. Coordination ........................................................................... 541
  18.5.2 ‘Following Instructions’ vs. ‘Sense-making’ ................................................... 542
18.6 Learning to Coordinate Diverse Ways of Knowing .............................................. 544
  18.6.1 Three Kinds of Stability in Situated Knowing ................................................... 544
  18.6.2 Seeing Opportune Points for Productive Pedagogical Framing and Reframing ...... 545
  18.6.3 Situating Instructions Between the Conceptual Regularities and Material Arrangements .................................................................................................................. 546
  18.6.4 Resourcefulness as Active Coordination of Concepts, Actions and Situated Experiences .................................................................................................................. 548
References .................................................................................................................. 549

19 Teaching and Learning for Epistemic Fluency ......................................................... 553
  19.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 553
    19.1.1 Four Educational Approaches to Teaching and Learning for Epistemic Fluency .................................................................................................................. 554
    19.1.2 Professional Problems: Structure and Stability ................................................. 555
  19.2 Approach One: Learning by Integrating Knowledge ............................................ 557
    19.2.1 Purpose ........................................................................................................ 557
    19.2.2 Structure and Principles ............................................................................... 558
    19.2.3 Model Cases .................................................................................................. 560
    19.2.4 Rationale and Evaluation ............................................................................. 562
  19.3 Approach Two: Learning by Playing Epistemic Games ....................................... 563
    19.3.1 Purpose ........................................................................................................ 563
    19.3.2 Structure and Principles ............................................................................... 566
    19.3.3 Model Cases .................................................................................................. 569
    19.3.4 Rationale and Evaluation ............................................................................. 571
  19.4 Approach Three: Learning by Designing Knowledge .......................................... 573
    19.4.1 Purpose ........................................................................................................ 573
    19.4.2 Structure and Principles ............................................................................... 575
    19.4.3 Model Cases .................................................................................................. 576
    19.4.4 Rationale and Evaluation ............................................................................. 578
  19.5 Approach Four: Learning by Designing Inquiry .................................................. 580
    19.5.1 Purpose ........................................................................................................ 580
    19.5.2 Structure and Principles ............................................................................... 582
    19.5.3 Model Cases .................................................................................................. 585
    19.5.4 Rationale and Evaluation ............................................................................. 586
  19.6 Concluding Comments ........................................................................................ 589
References .................................................................................................................. 590
20 Creating Epistemic Environments: Learning, Teaching and Design ........................................... 595

20.1 From Rational Thought to Embodied Skill to Grounded Actionable Knowledge ........................................... 595

20.2 What Is Knowledge, Revisited: Dynamic Knowledge, Grounded Concepts and Embodied Epistemic Environments ........................................... 599

20.2.1 How Knowledge Emerges ........................................... 600

20.2.2 Grounded Concepts: Situated Knowing and Non-situated Knowledge ........................................... 601

20.2.3 How Environments Support Knowing: Embodied Epistemic Environments and Professional Knowledge Work ........................................... 601

20.3 Learning by Creating an Epistemic Environment and Constructing a Conscientious Self ........................................... 603

20.4 Designing for Epistemic Fluency ........................................... 607

References ........................................... 612

Related Publications and Presentations ........................................... 615

Index ........................................... 617
Epistemic Fluency and Professional Education
Innovation, Knowledgeable Action and Actionable Knowledge
Markauskaite, L.; Goodyear, P.
2017, XXII, 636 p. 71 illus., 4 illus. in color., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-94-007-4368-7