## Contents

1 **Introduction** ........................................................... 1

1.1 Terrorism, Prevention and the Criminal Justice System ....... 1

1.2 Conceptualizing the Subject ........................................... 3

1.2.1 Defining Anticipative Criminal Investigation ............... 3

1.2.2 Selection of Countries ........................................... 6

1.2.3 The Rule of Law .................................................. 7

1.2.4 Criminal Procedural Law ........................................ 11

1.2.5 The Relation Between Criminal Investigation
and Criminal Procedural Law ......................................... 16

1.2.6 The Relation Between Criminal Investigation
and Intelligence Investigation ......................................... 16

1.3 Contextualizing States’ Preventive Measures ...................... 18

1.3.1 The Influence of International Institutions ................. 19

1.3.2 A Duty to Prevent Terrorism under International
Human Rights Law Obligations ...................................... 22

1.3.3 The Influence of Theories on the Risk Society,
the Culture of Control and the Precautionary
Principle on Mobilizing Criminal Law for the
Purpose of Prevention ................................................ 25

1.4 Framing the Subject .................................................... 26

1.5 Research Question ..................................................... 29

1.6 Approach and Methodology ......................................... 30

### Part I  The Netherlands

2 **The System of Criminal Investigation in the Netherlands** ....... 37

2.1 Introduction ............................................................ 37

2.1.1 Goals of the Chapter ............................................ 37

2.1.2 The Dutch Criminal Justice System ........................... 39
2.1.3 Meaning of Some Principles and Fundamental Rights Relevant to the Criminal Investigation in Dutch Criminal Procedural Law .............................. 42
2.1.3.1 The Principle of Legality .................. 43
2.1.3.2 The Right to Respect for Private Life ..... 46
  2.1.3.2.1 Article 8 ECHR ....................... 47
  2.1.3.2.2 Article 10 Constitution ............... 51
2.1.3.3 The Right to a Fair Trial .................. 52
  2.1.3.3.1 The Presumption of Innocence ....... 52
  2.1.3.3.2 Implications of Article 6 ECHR for Pre-Trial Proceedings .......... 55
2.1.3.4 The Principles of the Due Administration of Justice ............................. 58
  2.1.3.4.1 Proportionality and Subsidiarity .... 59
  2.1.3.4.2 Prohibition on Détournement de Pouvoir ............................. 61
2.2 The Sword Function of the Dutch Criminal Investigation .... 61
2.2.1 The Actors Responsible for Truth-Finding .......... 61
  2.2.1.1 The Police ............................... 63
  2.2.1.2 The Public Prosecution Service (PPS) .... 65
  2.2.1.3 The Examining Magistrate .............. 67
  2.2.1.4 The AIVD (General Intelligence and Security Service) ............... 69
2.2.2 The Powers Available for Truth-Finding in the Criminal Investigation ........................ 71
  2.2.2.1 Article 2 Police Act 1993 ............... 73
  2.2.2.2 Investigative Techniques with a Specific Basis in the Law .................. 79
    2.2.2.2.1 The Act on Special Investigative Techniques of 1999 ............... 79
      2.2.2.2.1.1 Classical investigation ......... 80
      2.2.2.2.1.2 Organized Crime Investigation ...... 81
    2.2.2.2.2 Investigative Methods with a Specific Legal Basis in Special Criminal Acts ............... 83
  2.2.2.3 The Preliminary Investigation .......... 86
  2.2.2.4 The Investigative Powers of the Intelligence Community in Relation to Criminal Justice .............. 87
    2.2.2.4.1 The Investigative Powers of the AIVD 87
    2.2.2.4.2 Transfer of Information Obtained by the AIVD to Law Enforcement Services ............... 89
2.2.3 Conclusion ......................... 91
2.3 The Shield Function of the Dutch Criminal Investigation

2.3.1 The Responsibility of the Actors Towards a Fair Procedure

2.3.1.1 The Police

2.3.1.2 The Public Prosecutor

2.3.1.3 The Examining Magistrate

2.3.1.4 The Trial Judge

2.3.1.5 The Position of the Suspect

2.3.1.6 The Position of Other Subjects of Criminal Investigative Activities

2.3.2 The Protective Elements in the System of Criminal Investigation

2.3.2.1 Regulation Following the Principle of Legality and the Right to Respect for Private Life

2.3.2.1.1 The Requirements of the Restrictive Clause of Article 8 ECHR

2.3.2.1.2 The Requirements of the Principle of Legality and the Right to Respect for Private Life in the Regulation of Criminal Investigative Powers

2.3.2.2 The Separation of Criminal Investigation from other Forms of Investigation

2.3.2.2.1 The Definition of a Criminal Investigation

2.3.2.2.2 Separation from Administrative Supervision

2.3.2.2.3 Separation from Intelligence Investigation

2.3.2.2.4 The Relation Between the Preliminary Investigation and the Criminal Investigation

2.3.2.3 The Suspicion Requirement

2.3.2.3.1 The Definition of a Suspect: Article 27 CCP

2.3.2.3.2 Different Degrees of Suspicion

2.3.2.3.2.1 Title IVA: The Classical Investigation

2.3.2.3.2.2 Title V: The Organized Crime Investigation

2.3.2.3.2.3 Title Ve: The Preliminary Investigation

2.3.2.3.2.4 The Threshold of Indications in Special Criminal Acts
2.3.2.3.2.5 Other Degrees of Suspicion and Supplementary Conditions .......................... 148

2.3.2.3.3 The Protective Function of the Suspicion Threshold .............................. 149

2.3.2.4 Other Protective Elements Adopted in the CCP ........................................ 151

2.3.2.4.1 The Duty to Compile Records ......................................................... 151

2.3.2.4.2 The Remedies of Article 359a CCP ................................................. 153

2.3.3 Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 156

3 Counterterrorism Measures Affecting Criminal Investigation in the Netherlands ........................................... 161

3.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 161

3.1.1 Counterterrorism Measures Under the Preventive Paradigm ............................ 163

3.1.2 The Shift to Anticipative Criminal Investigation .............................................. 167

3.1.3 Goals of the Chapter ....................................................................................... 169

3.2 Changes Affecting the Criminal Investigation .................................................... 170

3.2.1 Legislative Measures ...................................................................................... 170

3.2.1.1 The Investigative Domain of Terrorism Investigations: Title Vb .................. 172

3.2.1.2 Preliminary Investigation for Preparing Terrorism Investigations .................. 177

3.2.1.3 New Criminal Investigative Powers ......................................................... 181

3.2.2 The Evolvement Towards Intelligence-Led Criminal Law Enforcement ............. 184

3.3 Changes Affecting the Relation Between the AIVD and the PPS .......................... 185

3.3.1 AIVD Reports as Starting Information for a Criminal Investigation .................. 187

3.3.2 The Shielded Witnesses Act ............................................................................. 190

3.3.3 Parallel Investigations ...................................................................................... 193

3.3.4 The Counterterrorism Information Box ......................................................... 197

3.3.5 Other Measures Enhancing Cooperation ...................................................... 199

3.4 Changes Affecting the Relation Between Administrative Law and Criminal Procedural Law ......................................................... 200

3.4.1 Administrative Disturbance ............................................................................. 202

3.5 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 205
4 The Implications of Enabling an Anticipative Criminal Investigations to Confront Terrorism for the Objectives of Criminal Procedural Law: The Netherlands .................. 209

4.1 Introduction ................................................................. 209

4.2 Expansion of the Preventive Capacity of the Criminal Investigation ............................................. 210

4.2.1 Criminal Investigation for the Purpose of Preventing Terrorism ............................................. 211

4.2.1.1 Expansion of the Scope and Nature of the Criminal Investigation of Terrorism ........... 211

4.2.1.2 The Protective Value of Indications in Comparison to a Reasonable Suspicion ........... 215

4.2.1.3 The Principle of Legality and the Right to Respect for Private Life .................................. 221

4.2.1.3.1 Foreseeability ............................................... 222

4.2.1.3.1.1 Title Vb ........................................... 222

4.2.1.3.1.2 Preliminary Investigation of Terrorist Crimes ........................................ 227

4.2.1.3.1.3 Search Powers for the Prevention of Terrorism ........................................ 228

4.2.1.3.2 Necessary in a Democratic Society .................................................. 231

4.2.2 Trends in Criminal Investigative Policy .................................................. 232

4.2.2.1 Balancing Prevention Against Legal Protection .................................................. 232

4.2.2.2 Choosing Between the Criminal Investigative Domains ........................................ 235

4.2.3 Shifting Responsibilities Among the Various Actors .................................................. 239

4.2.3.1 Authorization of Investigative Methods .................................................. 241

4.2.3.2 Protective function of the Principles of Proportionality and Subsidiarity and Ex Post Judicial Control .................................................. 243

4.2.3.3 Conclusion .................................................. 246

4.2.4 Final Remarks .................................................. 247

4.3 Demarcating the Anticipative Criminal Investigation .................................................. 248

4.3.1 The Relation Between Anticipative Criminal Investigation and Intelligence Investigation ............ 248

4.3.2 Relation Between Anticipative Criminal Investigation and Administrative Supervisory Authority .................................................. 253

4.3.3 Defining and Positioning the Anticipative Criminal Investigation ........................................ 256

4.3.4 Using Intelligence in Criminal Proceedings: An Infected Criminal Process? .................................................. 259
4.3.4.1 Control over the Use of AIVD or CIE Reports as Starting Information 261
4.3.4.2 Control over Parallel Investigations 263
4.3.4.3 An Infected Criminal Process? 264

4.4 Conclusion 269
4.4.1 Characterizing the Anticipative Criminal Investigation 269
4.4.2 Implications for the Shield Objective of Criminal Procedural Law 270
4.4.2.1 Weakened Protection of the Right to Respect for Private Life and the Presumption of Innocence 271
4.4.2.2 An Infected Criminal Process 273

Part II The United States

5 The System of Criminal Investigation in the United States 277
5.1 Introduction 277
5.1.1 Goals of the Chapter 277
5.1.2 Framing the Subject 279
5.1.3 The US Criminal Justice System 282
5.1.4 Constitutional Principles 285
5.1.4.1 Unreasonable Searches and Seizures and the Right to Private Life: Fourth Amendment 286
5.1.4.2 Due Process of Law: Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments 290
5.2 The Sword Function of the US Criminal Investigation 295
5.2.1 The Actors Responsible for Truth-Finding 295
5.2.1.1 The Police 296
5.2.1.2 The Prosecutors 298
5.2.1.3 The Grand Jury 300
5.2.1.4 National Security Power and the Intelligence Community 301
5.2.2 The Powers Available for Truth-Finding in the Criminal Investigation 305
5.2.2.1 Conventional Criminal Investigation 306
5.2.2.1.1 Search Powers 307
5.2.2.1.2 The Search Powers of Surveillance and the Use of Undercover Agents and Informants 309
5.2.2.2 The Possibilities for Proactive Criminal Investigations 313
5.2.2.3 The Powers Available in National Security Investigations in Relation to Criminal Justice 314
5.3.2.4.1 The Regulation of National Security Investigations ............ 372
5.3.3 Conclusion ...................................................... 377
5.4 Final Remarks ..................................................... 381

6 Counterterrorism Measures Affecting Criminal Investigation in the United States ............................................. 385
6.1 Introduction .......................................................... 385
   6.1.1 Counterterrorism Measures Under the Preventive Paradigm .................. 386
   6.1.2 The Shift to Anticipative Criminal Investigation ....................... 388
   6.1.3 Goals of the Chapter ............................................ 391
6.2 Changes Affecting Search and Surveillance in the Conventional Law Enforcement Context ........................................ 392
   6.2.1 Legislative Measures ............................................ 392
      6.2.1.1 Broadening the Scope of Title III ................................ 392
      6.2.1.2 Emergency Disclosure ...................................... 393
      6.2.1.3 Delayed Notice Warrant ..................................... 393
      6.2.1.4 Pen Registers and Trap and Trace Devices .................... 395
      6.2.1.5 Consensual Monitoring ...................................... 396
      6.2.1.6 Nationwide Applicability of Search Warrants .................. 397
   6.2.2 Developments in Case Law ....................................... 398
   6.2.3 Other Developments Enhancing Proactive Capacities of Law Enforcement Agencies ......................................... 402
6.3 Changes Affecting the Powers in National Security Investigations ............................................................. 403
   6.3.1 Increased FISA Surveillance Powers .................................. 403
   6.3.2 FISA Court Document Production Orders ................................ 407
6.4 Changes Affecting the Interaction Between the Intelligence and Law Enforcement Communities ....................................... 415
   6.4.1 Provisions of the USA PATRIOT ACT of 2001 ....................... 416
      6.4.1.1 Enhancing the Sharing of Information .......................... 416
      6.4.1.2 Changing the Purpose Language ............................... 419
   6.4.2 The Influence of the Internal Policy of the Department of Justice and the FBI ......................................................... 422
      6.4.2.1 The Memorandum of Attorney General Ashcroft of 6 March 2002 and the Interagency Memorandum of 2003 ............ 424
      6.4.2.3 Mukasey Guidelines on FBI Operations (2008) .................. 429
6.4.2.4 Domestic Investigations and Operations Guide of the FBI (2008) .................................. 434

6.4.3 Other Developments Enhancing Cooperation Between Intelligence and Law Enforcement .......... 437

6.5 Other Relevant Investigative Powers ............................................. 438

6.5.1 The NSA Surveillance Program and its Incorporation in FISA .................................................. 438

6.5.2 National Security Letters ........................................................... 442

6.6 Conclusion .............................................................................. 445

7 The Implications of Enabling Anticipative Criminal Investigations to Confront Terrorism for the Objectives of Criminal Procedural Law in the United States ......................................................... 449

7.1 Introduction ............................................................................ 449

7.2 Expansion of the Preventive Capacity of Conventional Criminal Law ................................................ 451

7.2.1 Expansion of the Scope and Nature of Electronic Surveillance .................................................. 451

7.2.1.1 In General ........................................................................ 451

7.2.1.2 Delayed Notice Warrants .................................................. 452

7.2.1.3 Pen Registers and Trap/Trace Devices .......................... 457

7.2.2 A Trend in the Case Law Towards Diminishing the Protective Meaning of the Fourth Amendment for National Security or Terrorism Prevention Interests ................. 460

7.2.2.1 Applying the Special Needs Doctrine to Searches for the Prevention of Terrorism ...................... 461

7.2.2.2 Balancing Liberty Against Security in Fourth Amendment Analysis in Terrorism Cases .............. 466

7.2.2.2.1 Probable Cause ....................................................... 466

7.2.2.2.2 Warrant ............................................................... 469

7.2.2.2.3 Reasonableness ..................................................... 472

7.2.2.2.4 The Exclusionary Rule ......................................... 474

7.2.3 The Changed Role of the Relevant Actors ............................................. 474

7.3 The Expansion of the Preventive Capacity of National Security Investigations .............................. 477

7.3.1 Expansion of the Scope and Nature of FISA Surveillance and Physical Searches .......................... 477

7.3.1.1 General Development .................................................. 477

7.3.1.2 Roving Surveillance ................................................... 480

7.3.1.3 Pen Register and Trap and Trace Devices ............... 481

7.3.2 FISA Document Production Orders ........................................ 482

7.3.2.1 The Regulation of Document Production Orders under FISA .............................................. 483
7.3.2.2 The Non-Disclosure Requirement ............... 487
7.3.2.3 Conclusion .................................................. 489

7.4 Interaction Between Law Enforcement and Intelligence
Communities for the Purpose of Enabling a Preventive
Approach ................................................................. 491
7.4.1 Redefining Institutional Positions and Functions ........ 492
7.4.2 Consequences of the Institutional Position and Functions
of the Anticipative Criminal Investigation ................. 498
7.4.3 An Infected Criminal Process? ......................... 504
7.4.4 Dismantling the Wall: Some Final Remarks ............ 511

7.5 FISA Surveillance Targeting Non-US Persons Outside the US
and National Security Letters ................................. 513
7.5.1 FISA Surveillance Targeting Non-US Persons Outside
the US ................................................................. 513
7.5.2 National Security Letters ................................. 515

7.6 Conclusion .......................................................... 516
7.6.1 Characterizing the Anticipative Criminal Investigation .. 517
7.6.2 The Implications for the Shield Objective
of Criminal Procedural Law ................................. 518
7.6.2.1 Weakened Fourth Amendment Protection ........ 518
7.6.2.2 Abandoning Purpose Limitation ................. 522
7.6.2.3 Infected Criminal Process ......................... 523

Part III Theory, Evaluation and Conclusions

8 Regulating the Anticipative Criminal Investigation Under
the Rule of Law ......................................................... 533
8.1 Introduction ......................................................... 533
8.1.1 The Path Towards Formulating the Framework
of Examination ......................................................... 535
8.1.1.1 The Shortcomings of the Balancing Approach... 536
8.1.1.2 Building the Architecture of the
Anticipative Criminal Investigation
Under the Rule of Law ........................................ 539
8.2 Conclusive Characterization and Positioning
of the Anticipative Criminal Investigation .................. 541
8.3 The Common Ground of the Regulation of Criminal
Investigations .......................................................... 544
8.3.1 Three Constitutive Principles ......................... 545
8.3.1.1 The Presumption of Innocence ................. 547
8.3.1.2 Respect for the Fundamental Right to
Private Life ......................................................... 550
8.3.1.3 Due Process/Fair Trial .............................. 550
8.3.2 Three Parameters .................................................. 554
  8.3.2.1 Accountability ............................................. 555
  8.3.2.2 Proportionality .......................................... 557
  8.3.2.3 Necessity .................................................. 558

8.4 Seeking Synthesis in the Flexible Area of the Law in the Light of the Circumstances of Modern Society .................. 559
  8.4.1 Legitimacy of the Anticipative Criminal Investigation with Regard to the ‘Sword Side’ ....................... 561
    8.4.1.1 The Argument of Necessity or Exigency Justifying ‘Emergency Powers’ Outside the Traditional Legal Framework ............ 561
    8.4.1.2 The Argument of Necessity or Exigency Justifying Exceptions to the Shield Elements within the Traditional Legal Framework .......... 564
    8.4.1.3 The Argument of the Specific Nature of Terrorist Crimes .......................... 565
    8.4.1.4 The Argument of the Effectiveness of Preventing Harm .................................. 569
  8.4.2 The Fundamental Nature of an Institutional Distinction Between Criminal Investigation and Intelligence Investigation ........................................... 575
  8.4.3 Conclusion .......................................................... 577

8.5 Three Pillars of Regulatory Conditions: Legitimization, Integrity and Fairness .................................................................................. 580
  8.5.1 Legitimization ...................................................... 581
  8.5.2 Integrity .............................................................. 588
    8.5.2.1 Minimization Mechanisms ........................................ 589
    8.5.2.2 Controlling Mechanisms ......................................... 590
    8.5.2.3 The Availability of a Remedy ................................... 595
    8.5.2.4 Conditions Concerning Integrity ................................. 597
  8.5.3 Fairness ............................................................... 598
  8.6 Conclusion ............................................................... 602

9 Conclusions ................................................................. 605
  9.1 Introduction ............................................................. 605
  9.2 General Perspectives .................................................. 608
    9.2.1 Legitimization and Integrity ....................................... 608
    9.2.2 Fairness and Integrity ............................................. 610
  9.3 Regulating Anticipative Criminal Investigations Under the Rule of Law: Conclusions and Recommendations .................. 612
    9.3.1 The Netherlands: Legitimization and Integrity .................. 612
      9.3.1.1 Relation Between Legitimating Grounds and the Purpose of the Criminal Investigation .... 612
9.3.1.2 Relating Legitimization to Integrity:
Proportionality and the Legitimized
Scope and Purpose 614
9.3.1.2.1 The Legitimized Scope and Purpose 614
9.3.1.2.2 Proportionality as a Minimization Mechanism 617
9.3.1.2.3 Search Methods in Terrorist Crime Investigations 619
9.3.1.2.4 Preliminary Investigation of Terrorist Activities 620
9.3.1.3 Control over the Legitimized Scope and Purpose 622
9.3.1.4 Some Comments on Notification 623
9.3.2 The United States: Legitimization and Integrity 625
9.3.2.1 Regarding the Anticipative Criminal Investigation in Conventional Criminal Law 625
9.3.2.1.1 Attention to Legitimizing Grounds in the Reasonableness Assessment Under the Fourth Amendment 625
9.3.2.1.2 Some Comments on the Special Needs Doctrine 628
9.3.2.1.3 Some Comments on Pen Registers and Trap and Trace Devices 628
9.3.2.1.4 Some Comments on Notification 629
9.3.2.2 Regarding FISA as a Quasi-Law Enforcement Framework 630
9.3.2.2.1 FISA Framework Inadequate for Legitimizing Criminal Investigative Activities 631
9.3.2.2.2 Re-Establishing the Required Legitimization for Anticipative Criminal Investigations 633
9.3.2.3 Minimization and Alternative Controlling Mechanisms Instead of Judicial Control 634
9.3.3 The Netherlands: Fairness and Integrity 637
9.3.3.1 Control over the AIVD and CIE 638
9.3.3.2 Integrity Guarantees Versus Judicial Control: The Fairness of Trial Proceedings 639
9.3.3.3 Comment on the Use of Intelligence as Evidence 642
9.3.4 The United States: Fairness and Integrity 643
9.3.4.1 Insufficient Control over FISA as a Quasi-Law Enforcement Framework 643
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.3.4.2 CIPA as a Counterbalancing Procedure</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.4.3 The Fairness of the Trial Proceedings</td>
<td>644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Final Conclusions</td>
<td>646</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue</td>
<td>651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports</td>
<td>667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Cases</td>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>679</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Anticipative Criminal Investigation
Theory and Counterterrorism Practice in the Netherlands and the United States
Hirsch Ballin, M.F.H.
2012, XXXII, 684 p., Hardcover
A product of T.M.C. Asser Press