# Contents

1 **Introduction** .......................................................... 1  
Chantal Meloni and Gianni Tognoni  
1.1 Introduction ............................................................. 1  
1.2 Chronology of Events Related to the UN Fact Finding Mission  
on the Gaza Conflict .................................................. 5  
1.3 Map of Gaza ............................................................ 9  

## Part I  International Conference ‘Is There a Court for  
Gaza?’ 22 May 2009, Rome  

2 **Selected Materials from the International Conference  
‘Is There a Court for Gaza?’ 22 May 2009, Lelio Basso  
International Foundation, Rome ................................... 13  
Chantal Meloni and Gianni Tognoni  
2.1 Introduction ............................................................ 14  
2.2 Selected Conference’s Papers ..................................... 15  
2.2.1 Raji Sourani ......................................................... 16  
2.2.2 Eric David .......................................................... 24  
2.2.3 Giuseppe Palmisano ............................................... 30  
2.2.4 Gabriele Della Morte .............................................. 36  
2.2.5 Chantal Meloni ..................................................... 41  
2.2.6 Flavia Lattanzi .................................................... 48  
2.2.7 François Rigaux ................................................... 56  
2.3 Presentation of the Complaint Filed Before the International  
Criminal Court by Gilles Devers and Mireille Fanon  
Mendes-France ......................................................... 61  
2.3.1 Introduction ......................................................... 61  
2.3.2 Violations of International Law ............................... 62
2.3.3 Violations of International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights Law .......................... 66
2.3.4 The Commission of War Crimes ......................... 69
2.3.5 The Commission of Crimes Against Humanity ...... 70
2.3.6 Consequences in Terms of the Individual Criminal Liability of Israeli Authorities .......... 71
2.3.7 The Consequences of the Violations of International Law by the State of Israel .................. 72
2.3.8 Conclusions ............................................ 74
2.4 States that have Recognised Palestine as a State .......... 76
References .................................................. 79

Part II The UN Fact Finding Mission on the Gaza Conflict and Follow-up at the International and Domestic Level

3 The Goldstone Report and the Goldstone Retreat: Truths Told by Law and Reviled by Geopolitics ................. 83
Richard Falk
3.1 A Preliminary Observation on the Goldstone Retreat .... 83
3.2 Assessing the Goldstone Report ............................ 87
3.3 Why the Goldstone Report Broke the Sound Barrier .... 88
3.4 Conclusions and Recommendations of the Goldstone Report .................................................. 93
3.5 A Polarized Debate: Liberal Legality and Geopolitical Reality .................................................. 96
3.6 International Law and the Peace Process .................. 101
3.7 Conclusion ................................................... 102
References .................................................. 103

4 The Follow up to the Goldstone Report and its Legal Impact in Israel and Beyond .......................... 105
Sharon Weill
4.1 Introduction ................................................... 105
4.2 The Recommendations of the FFM Report ................ 107
4.3 The Monitoring of Israeli Investigations .................. 108
4.3.1 United Nations Monitoring ................................ 108
4.3.2 Israeli Monitoring: The Turkel Commission ............ 110
4.4 The Israeli System of Investigation ......................... 111
4.4.1 Structural Deficiencies .................................. 111
4.4.2 Policy Deficiency ....................................... 114
4.5 Domestic Investigations and Prosecutions Conducted in the Aftermath of Cast Lead .................. 115
4.6 Conclusion ................................................... 117
Documents Attached to Part II .................................. 169
[1] UN Human Rights Council Resolution S-9/1
of 12 January 2009, establishing the Fact Finding Mission
on the Gaza Conflict ............................................ 169
Gaza Conflict (the ‘Goldstone Report’): Executive
Summary, 23 September 2009 .......................... 173
the Gaza Conflict: Conclusions and Recommendations,
24 September 2009 ............................................. 199
[4] UN Human Rights Council Resolution S-12/1
of 16 October 2009, endorsing the Goldstone Report .... 227
[5] UN General Assembly Resolution 64/10 of 5 November 2009
and Official Records with individual States’ votes ........ 233
Mission on the Gaza Conflict: Report of the UN Secretary
General, Ban Ki Moon, of 4 February 2010, with annexed
Israeli and Palestinian Reports on internal investigations .... 251
[7] UN General Assembly Resolution 64/254
of 26 February 2010 ............................................. 323
[8] UN Human Rights Council Resolution 13/9 of 25 March 2010,
establishing a Committee of independent Experts ........... 325
Tomuschat, of 23 September 2010. .......................... 329
McGowan Davis, of 18 March 2011 ...................... 357
of 25 March 2011 .............................................. 385

Part III Gaza and the International Criminal Court: The Legal
Debate on the Admissibility of the Palestinian Declaration
Pursuant to Article 12(3) of the Rome Statute

8 Why Statehood Now: A Reflection on the ICC’s Impact
on Palestine’s Engagement with International Law .......... 391
Michael G. Kearney
8.1 Introduction ............................................. 391
8.2 De-Politicisation and Human Rights Advocacy ........ 393
8.3 From the Partition Resolution to the ICC ................. 396
8.3.1 The 1988 Declaration of Independence and
Engagement with International Law ...................... 398
8.3.2 The Palestinian Declaration to the ICC ............ 401
8.4 The Fact-Finding Mission Report and the Pressures on the
PA to Defer the Vote at the UN ......................... 403
9 The Effects of Palestine’s Recognition of the International Criminal Court’s Jurisdiction

Allain Pellet

9.1 Introduction .......................................................... 409
9.2 The Relevance of a Functional Approach ......................... 411
9.3 The Validity of the Palestinian Declaration of
    21 January 2009 ......................................................... 415
9.4 Postscript .............................................................. 425
References .................................................................. 428

10 The Palestine Declaration to the International Criminal Court: The Statehood Issue

John Quigley

10.1 Prior Episodes that Raised the Issue of Palestine Statehood . . 431
10.2 Palestine’s Declaration of Statehood ............................... 432
10.3 Possible Claimants to Palestine Territory .......................... 434
10.4 Entitlement to Self-Determination ................................. 435
10.5 Reaction of States ...................................................... 435
10.6 A Continuing Statehood .............................................. 436
10.7 Conclusion .............................................................. 439
References .................................................................. 439

11 Is Palestine a “State”? A Response to Professor John Quigley’s
Article, “The Palestine Declaration to the International Criminal
Court: The Statehood Issue” .............................................. 441

Robert Weston Ash

11.1 Introduction .............................................................. 441
11.2 That Palestinian Officials Repeatedly and Openly Admit that
    Palestine is not a “State” Conclusively Establishes that
    Palestine Does not Meet the Conditions Required to Accede
to ICC Jurisdiction ......................................................... 443
11.3 That Palestine is not Recognized as a “State” by Key
    International Institutions is Additional Indication that the
    International Community Does not Recognize Palestine as
    a “State” ...................................................................... 449
11.4 That no Arab Palestinian State Currently Exercises Sovereign
    Control Over Claimed Palestinian “Territory” Also Confirms
    that Palestine is not a “State” ............................... 455
11.5 Conclusion .............................................................. 458
References .................................................................. 459
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Professor Ash’s Sect. 11.2: Statements by Palestinian Officials and Palestinian Participation in the Peace Process</td>
<td>John Quigley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>Professor Ash’s Sect. 11.3: The International Community</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>Professor Ash’s Sect. 11.4: The Attributes of Statehood</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Yaël Ronen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>Preconditions for ICC Jurisdiction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>Admission of the Palestinian Declaration as that of a Full-Fledged State</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>Admission Under Article 12(3) of a Declaration by a Quasi-State</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>Institutional Considerations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>The Statute’s Delegation-Based Jurisdiction</td>
<td>Yuval Shany</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>The Interpretative Question: Can a Non-State Entity be Regarded as a State?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>The Rome Statute’s Object and Purpose is Well-Served by a Functional Approach to Delegation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>The Plot Thickens: The Oslo Accords</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>A Functional Approach to Statehood for Purposes of Article 12(3)</td>
<td>Vera Gowlland-Debbas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>Interpretative Approaches to Article 12(3) of the Statute</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>The International Status of Palestine Under the Relevant Rules of International Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15.3.1</td>
<td>Obligations Toward the United Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Contents
15.3.2 Palestine’s International Status and the Legitimacy of Statehood ............................... 518
15.3.3 Obligations Under International Law of the States Parties to the ICC Statute .................. 523
References ........................................................................ 524

Part IV Non Judicial Responses: The Russell Tribunal on Palestine

16 The Russell Tribunal on Palestine ........................................... 527
Frank Barat and Daniel Machover
16.1 Introduction .................................................................. 527
16.2 Background to the RToP ................................................. 530
16.3 The First International Session of the Russell Tribunal on Palestine .................................. 532
16.4 The Call for the Suspension of the EU-Israel Association Agreement .................................. 535
16.5 The Second International Session of the Russell Tribunal on Palestine ............................. 537
16.6 Corporate Liability for Complicity in International Law Violations .................................... 538
16.7 The Third International Session of the Russell Tribunal on Palestine ............................... 540
16.8 Russell Tribunal on Palestine: An Enduring Legacy ......................................................... 541
References ........................................................................ 542

Part V Concluding Remarks

17 International (In)Justice and Palestine ................................. 581
John Dugard
Annex to Chapter 17: Report of the Independent Fact Finding Committee on Gaza Presented to the League of Arab States, 30 April 2009—‘No Safe Place’, Executive Summary ........ 586
Is There a Court for Gaza?
A Test Bench for International Justice
Meloni, C.; Tognoni, G. (Eds.)
2012, XIX, 594 p. 258 illus., 1 illus. in color., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-90-6704-819-4
A product of T.M.C. Asser Press