# Table of Contents

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations .................................................. 15  
Preface ................................................................................................. 17  

## 1  Introduction – Closing the Unfinished Business ...................... 19  
   1.1  Mediation and Negotiation – Bridge or Drift? ................. 20  
   1.2  Intractability of Identity Conflicts – Dealing with Slippery Agreements in the Philippines ........................................... 21  
   1.3  Identity Violence in the Philippines – Between Misrecognition and Nation-building ......................................................... 23  
   1.4  Stumbling Blocks and Strategic Facilitation – Assessing the Negotiation Process ................................................................. 26  
   1.5  Research Objectives and Contributions .......................... 28  

## 2  Catching the Slippery Fish – A Theorization of the Concept of Identity and Identity Conflicts ........................................... 31  
   2.1  Conflict Defined .............................................................................. 33  
   2.2  A Conflict Analysis – the Systematic Approach .................. 34  
      2.2.1  Conflict and Scarcity – Reduced Human Capital ....... 37  
      2.2.2  Conflict and Colonization - the Distorted State-building ........................................................................................................ 40  
      2.2.3  Conflict and the Civilizational Fault-lines .................. 42  
      2.2.4  Conflict and Misrecognition – Hegemonial Identity Politics and Social Relations .................................................. 42  
   2.3  The Construction of the Bangsamoro Identity – The Collective Memory of Misrecognition ........................................ 49  
   2.4  Conclusion – Initiating a Theoretical Debate in the Philippines ................................................................. 55
3 The Nation as a Subject of Scientific Studies .........................63

3.1 The Nation and Postcolonial Studies .................................63
3.2 The Four Streams of the Study of the Nation ......................64
  3.2.1 Historicity and Subjectivity/Normativity ......................66
  3.2.2 Historicity and Objectivity/Methodism .......................68
  3.2.3 Non-historicity and Subjectivity/Normativity ..............70
  3.2.4 Non-Historicity and Objectivity/Methodism ................71
3.3 Conclusion – The Nation Defined .....................................73

4 The Hegemonic Nation – How Minorities are Invented...........77

4.1 The Hegemon vs. the Leader – Identifying the Fundament of Bureaucracy .................................................................78
4.2 The Hegemonic Nation – Profiling the Philippine Nation ...80
  4.2.1 The Tagalog as Freedom Fighters – The Role of Independence Entrepreneurs .....................................................81
  4.2.2 Language and Constitution – Consolidating the Hegemonic Bureaucracy ..............................................................83
  4.2.3 System Stability through the Absence of Challengers .. 85
  4.2.4 People Power or Tagalog Power? – The Role of the Elites from the Capital .........................................................87
  4.2.5 The Hegemon following the colonialist divide and rule strategy – the role of Political Warlords in Maintaining Hegemony .................................................................88
4.3 Interim Conclusion – Reframing Hegemony to Leadership 89

5 The Nation and the Legitimacy of Violence – The Need for the Concept of “Non-Competitive Nation-Building” ............93

5.1 Nation-hood and State-hood – the Functionality of Violence .........................................................................................94
5.2 Defining Violence – What Lies Behind by this Elusive Concept? .................................................................................................................. 96
  5.2.1 Direct Violence .................................................................................. 96
  5.2.2 Structural Violence ........................................................................... 97
  5.2.3 Symbolic Violence ............................................................................ 97
5.3 The Bureaucracy of Violence – Acquiring and Maintaining Legitimacy ........................................................................................................ 99
5.4 Failure to Monopolize Violence as State Failure? - Franchising Violence to Political Warlords ................................................................. 101
5.5 Democracy Nurturing Violence – Between Power and Hierarchy ........................................................................................................... 102
5.6 The Need for a Paradigm Shift – The Concept of a “Non-Competitive Nation-Building” ................................................................................ 104
5.7 Nationalistic Paradigms (P) – Discovering Patterns of Misrecognition .................................................................................................. 106
5.8 A Concept of “Non-Competitive” Nation-building .......................... 107
  5.8.1 The Nation-State and Institutional Pluralism .................................. 107
  5.8.2 Stability vs. Resilience ..................................................................... 108
  5.8.3 Resilience and Leadership ............................................................. 109
  5.8.4 The Nation and the Identity of Solidarity ..................................... 110
  5.8.5 Nation-building and History – Reframing Narratives .................... 111
5.9 Interim Conclusion – Legitimizing Violence through Nation-Building .................................................................................................... 113

6 Mediation as Intervention of Choice – A Critical Analysis of Mediation in Identity Conflicts ................................................................. 117

  6.1 Studying Mediation ................................................................................ 117
  6.2 Conceptualizing Mediation .................................................................. 120
  6.3 How Mediation Works ......................................................................... 124
    6.3.1 The Different Stages of Mediation – Bringing Structure to the Process ............................................................................................. 125
6.3.2 Conditions for the Use of Mediation in Identity Conflicts .......................................................... 129
6.4 Rationale and Motives of Mediation in Identity Conflicts – Altruism or Pure Politics? ......................... 132
6.5 Dilemmas of Mediation Standards - Quality Assessment as Guarantee for Success? ............................ 135
  6.5.1 Neutrality and Impartiality of Mediators ............................... 135
  6.5.2 Autonomy of Conflicting Parties ........................................ 136
  6.5.3 Confidentiality of the Process ........................................... 137
  6.5.4 Voluntariness .............................................................. 137
  6.5.5 The Power Balance between Conflicting Parties ............ 138
6.6 Critical Views on Mediating Identity Conflicts – Gaps through the Bridge ........................................... 139
  6.6.1 Mediation and (In)justice ............................................... 139
  6.6.2 Mediation and the Pro-Rights Approach ....................... 140
  6.6.3 Mediation, Power Imbalances and Sustainability ...... 141
  6.6.4 Mediation and Accountability ....................................... 142
6.7 Interim Conclusion – Mediation as Intervention of Choice in Identity Conflicts .................................. 143

7 Managing Intractable Identity Conflicts – A Concert of Measures in the Southern Philippines .................. 149

7.1 Causes of Intractability – Mapping out the Bangsamoro Conflict .......................................................... 149
7.2 Mediation and other Intervention Efforts in the Philippines .............................................................. 154
  7.2.1 First-Track Mediation in the Philippines – Dealing with “Biased” Mediation .................................... 158
  7.2.2 Mediation by Regional Organizations – The Organization of Islamic Conference (OIC) in the Philippines .............................................................. 165
  7.2.2.1 The Organization of Islamic Conference (OIC) ....... 167
7.2.3 Non-Governmental Organizations as Mediators – The Imperative Partnership ............................................................. 172
7.3 Interim Conclusion - Designing the Intervention Process .... 179

8 Relating Agreements to the Peace Process – The Science and Art of Decision-Making ............................................................. 187

8.1 Uncertainty and Negotiated Outcomes ................................ 188
8.2 Reaching an Agreement – Options and Dilemmas ............. 190
8.3 Negotiation Outcomes - Agreement, No Agreement and Collapsed Agreement ...................................................................... 191
  8.3.1 Agreement .................................................................... 192
  8.3.2 No Agreement ............................................................. 192
  8.3.3 Collapsed Agreement .................................................. 193
8.4 Macro-Perspectives in a Long-Term Process – the Mindanao Case .................................................................................. 194
8.5 The Implementation of Agreements – Dilemmas in the Operationalization ...................................................................... 202
8.6 Monitoring Agreements ..................................................... 203
8.7 Interim Conclusion - Managing Process Complexity ............ 205

9 Stumbling Blocks - Reasons for Collapse of Agreements .... 209

9.1 Actor-related Stumbling Blocks – Dealing with Humans . 210
  9.1.1 Diversity of Actors, Professional Cultures and Communication Skills ................................................................. 210
  9.1.2 Lack of Information and Lack of Institutional Memory .............................................................................................. 210
  9.1.3 Spoilers and Negotiators for “Side-Effects” ................. 211
9.2 Issue-related Stumbling Blocks – Issue Complexity .......... 212
  9.2.1 Problem of Ranges – Framing Problems and Issues... 212
  9.2.2 Multi-causality and Diffusion - Horizontal and Vertical Linkages of Issues ................................................................. 213
9.2.3 Low Politics vs. High Politics – Problematization of Rewards and Costs ............................................................... 214
9.2.4 The Zero-Sum Trap – Violence and Security ............. 216
9.3 Structure-related Stumbling Blocks ................................... 216
  9.3.1 Power Structures and Asymmetries ............................ 217
  9.3.2 Lack of Information and Immeasurability of Stakes ..218
  9.3.3 Constituency Accountability ....................................... 219
  9.3.4 Multi-Party Setting...................................................... 220
9.4 Process-related Stumbling Blocks ..................................... 220
  9.4.1 Time Frame Paradox – Between Short-term and Long-Term Approaches ................................................................. 220
  9.4.2 Sectoral Arrangements................................................ 222
9.5 Outcome-related Stumbling Blocks ................................... 223
  9.5.1 Varying Expectations.................................................. 223
  9.5.2 Post-settlement Dilemma ............................................ 224
9.6 Interim Conclusion – When Means Become Ends ............ 225

10 Strategic Facilitation of the Mindanao Peace Process – Dealing with Stumbling Blocks ................................................. 229

10.1 Actor-related Prescriptions .............................................. 230
  10.1.1 Problem-Solving Mode – Separating Persons (Relationships) from Problems (Issues)............................... 231
  10.1.2 Management of Professional Cultures and Group Cohesion in Negotiation ....................................................... 231
  10.1.3 Capacity Building ..................................................... 232
  10.1.4 Dealing with Spoilers – Identifying Structural Weaknesses ................................................................................. 234
  10.1.5 Dealing with “Side-Effects” and Hardliners through Engagement ........................................................................... 235
10.2 Issue-related Prescriptions ............................................... 237
  10.2.1 Knowledge Management – Truth Commissions and Early Warning Systems .......................................................... 237
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.2.2</td>
<td>Sequential Agreements and Amendment Procedures – Flexibility of Agreements</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Structure-related Prescriptions</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.1</td>
<td>Integrative Bargaining</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2</td>
<td>Dealing with Constituency Gaps – The Role of Public Spheres</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Process-related Prescription – Process Management</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>Outcome-related Prescriptions</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.1</td>
<td>Expectation Management</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5.2</td>
<td>Dealing with Insufficient Outcomes – Evaluation and Selection of Alternatives</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Interim Conclusion – Bridging the Gaps</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11 Conclusion – Lessons for Theory and for Action to Resolve Identity Conflicts ................................................................. 253

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Lessons for Theory and for Action – Dealing with Complexity</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Outlook for Further Research</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Nation-building and Identity Conflicts
Facilitating the Mediation Process in Southern Philippines
Hernández, A.
2014, XVIII, 244 p. 4 illus., Softcover
ISBN: 978-3-658-05214-0