# Contents

1. Same-Sex Couples, Legislators and Judges. An Introduction to the Book ........................................... 1
   Daniele Gallo, Luca Paladini, and Pietro Pustorino

## Part I Selected National Jurisdictions

### Section 1 Domestic Law Issues

2. The Recognition of Same-Sex Couples’ Rights in the US Between Counter-Majoritarian Principle and Ideological Approaches: A State Level Perspective ...................... 15
   Graziella Romeo

3. From Gay Rights to Same-Sex Marriage: A Brief History Through the Jurisprudence of US Federal Courts ............. 33
   Antonio D’Aloia

4. Different Approaches, Similar Outcomes: Same-Sex Marriage in Canada and South Africa ........................................ 73
   Edmondo Mostacci

5. Same-Sex Couples Before Courts in Mexico, Central and South America ......................................................... 93
   José Miguel Cabrales Lucio

6. Following the Legislative Leaders: Judicial Recognition of Same Sex Couples in Australia and New Zealand ............ 127
   Olivia Rundle

7. The Nordic Model: Same-Sex Families in Love and Law ........... 161
   Hrefna Friðriksdóttir

8. A Glorious Revolution? UK Courts and Same-Sex Couples ........ 181
   Aidan O’Neill
9 Between Recognition and Homophobia: Same-Sex Couples in Eastern Europe ........................................ 211  
Adam Bodnar and Anna Śledzińska-Simon

10 Same-Sex Couples in France and Belgium: The Resilient Practice of Judicial Deference ............................. 249  
Philippe Reyniers

11 At the Crossroads Between Privacy and Community: The Legal Status of Same-Sex Couples in German, Austrian and Swiss Law ......................................................... 263  
Giorgio Repetto

12 Judicial Restraint and Political Responsibility: A Review of the Jurisprudence of the Italian, Spanish and Portuguese High Courts on Same-Sex Couples ................................. 287  
Tiago Fidalgo de Freitas and Diletta Tega

13 The Legal Situation of Same-Sex Couples in Greece and Cyprus ........................................... 319  
Spyridon Drosos and Aristoteles Constantinides

Section 2 Private International Law Issues

14 The Law Applicable to the Formation of Same-Sex Partnerships and Marriages ........................................... 343  
Roberto Virzo

15 On Recognition of Foreign Same-Sex Marriages and Partnerships ......................................................... 359  
Giacomo Biagioni

16 Same-Sex Families Across Borders ........................................... 381  
Matteo M. Winkler

Part II Supranational and International (and Quasi-) Jurisdictions

Section 1 Human Rights Law Issues

17 Same-Sex Couples Before the ECtHR: The Right to Marriage . . . 399  
Pietro Pustorino

18 Same-Sex Couples’ Rights (Other than the Right to Marry) Before the ECtHR ........................................... 409  
Francesco Crisafulli

19 Same-Sex Couples Before the Inter-American System of Human Rights ........................................... 437  
Laura Magi
### Section 2 EU Law Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20 Free Movement Rights for Same-Sex Couples Under EU Law: What Role to Play for the CJEU?</td>
<td>Jorrit Rijpma and Nelleke Koffeman</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 Employment Benefits for Same-Sex Couples: The Case-Law of the CJEU</td>
<td>Massimo F. Orzan</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section 3 International Labour Law Issues and Quasi-Jurisdictional Bodies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22 International Administrative Tribunals and Their Non-Originalist Jurisprudence on Same-Sex Couples: ‘Spouse’ and ‘Marriage’ in Context, Between Social Changes and the Doctrine of Renvoi</td>
<td>Daniele Gallo</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Same-Sex Couples Before Quasi-Jurisdictional Bodies: The Case of the UN Human Rights Committee</td>
<td>Luca Paladini</td>
<td>533</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Foreword ................................................................. v
Gráinne de Búrca

List of contributors ............................................... xxvii

1 Same-Sex Couples, Legislators and Judges. An Introduction
to the Book .......................................................... 1
Daniele Gallo, Luca Paladini, and Pietro Pustorino
1.1 A Brief Prologue: Harry, Sally and the Present Time .... 2
1.2 Aim and Scope .................................................. 3
1.3 Structure ......................................................... 4
1.3.1 Part I: National Jurisdictions .............................. 4
1.3.2 Part II: Supranational and International (and Quasi-)
Jurisdictions ......................................................... 5
1.4 The Vis Expansiva of Same-Sex Couples’ Rights Across the
World and the Role of the Judiciary ............................ 6
1.5 Interactions, Dialogues and the Rights of Same-Sex Couples ... 7
1.6 ‘Couple’, ‘Family’, ‘Marriage’, ‘Sex’ in Context and Related
Problems Concerning Legitimacy, Democracy and the Separation
of Powers .......................................................... 9
1.7 A Working Tool .................................................. 11
References .............................................................. 11

Part 1 Selected National Jurisdictions

Section 1 Domestic Law Issues

2 The Recognition of Same-Sex Couples’ Rights in the US Between
Counter-Majoritarian Principle and Ideological Approaches:
A State Level Perspective ........................................... 15
Graziella Romeo
### Detail Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The Recognition of Rights Between Counter-Majoritarian</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dilemma and Ideological Approaches</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Marriage Federalism and Its Implications</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Courts, Legislature and Public Debate</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 The Choice Over the Scheme of Argumentation in State</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Equal Protection v. Due Process</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Models of Recognizing Same-Sex Couples’ Rights:</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Kaleidoscopic Framework</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Final Remarks</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 From Gay Rights to Same-Sex Marriage: A Brief History Through</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Jurisprudence of US Federal Courts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antonio D’Aloia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introductory Remarks. Same-Sex Marriage at the Crossroads:</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between State and Federal Legislative and Judicial Powers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The <em>Bowers</em> Case: A Wall with Many Cracks on the Road</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards Gay Rights Recognition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 After <em>Bowers</em>: <em>Romer v. Evans</em> and Justice Kennedy’s Doctrine</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 A Parallel Story: The First Same-Sex Marriage Cases in Federal</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 The Federal Congress’ ‘Studs Up Tackle’: DOMA and the</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power to Reserve Marriage to Opposite-Sex Couples</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Constitutional Problems Raised by DOMA. The Full Faith</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and Credit Clause in the Conflict Between the Judicial and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legislative Branches, and the ‘Incidents’ of Federalism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Development of the Federal Case-Law on DOMA</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 <em>Lawrence</em>, or the Case That Put a Positive End to the Quest</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for Individual Gay Rights and Opened Up the Possibility of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homosexual Partnership and Same-Sex Marriage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Beyond the Question of Powers and Federalism. Same-Sex</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marriage and the Embarrassing (and, Perhaps, Not Entirely Correct)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparison with the Precedent of the Interracial Marriage Ban</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(the <em>Loving</em> Case)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10 <em>United States v. Windsor</em> and <em>Hollingsworth v. Perry</em>: The Final</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turning Point. The US Supreme Court Declared Section 3 of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOMA Unconstitutional</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11 Final Remarks: Some Doubts Concerning Same-Sex Marriage,</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Anti-Discrimination Principle, and Homosexual Parenting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Different Approaches, Similar Outcomes: Same-Sex Marriage in</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada and South Africa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmondo Mostacci</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Canada and South Africa: Different Approaches with Similar</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 Same-Sex Marriage in the Courts: The Initial Experience in Canada ................................................................. 75
  4.2.1 Continued: Its Consequences for the Approach to the Issue of Rights for Same-Sex Couples ......................... 77
4.3 The Rights of Same-Sex Couples and Discrimination on the Grounds of Sexual Orientation in the 1990s ............... 78
4.4 The Courts, the Federal Parliament and the Recognition of Same-sex Marriage ............................................. 82
4.5 The Constitution of the Rainbow Nation and Sexual Orientation . 85
4.6 Recognition of Same-Sex Unions, from Langemaat to Fourie . 87
4.7 The Recognition of Same-Sex Couples Between the Courts and the Legislature: Some Comparative Comments .......... 89
References ........................................................................... 91

5 Same-Sex Couples Before Courts in Mexico, Central and South America ................................................................. 93
José Miguel Cabrales Lucio
5.1 Introduction .................................................................. 93
5.2 The Situation of Same-Sex Couples in Latin America ....... 94
5.3 Mexico ....................................................................... 97
  5.3.1 General Overview .................................................. 97
  5.3.2 Mexico City ........................................................... 97
    5.3.2.1 Civil Unions: The ‘Law for Coexistence Partnerships’ ......................................................... 97
    5.3.2.2 Same-Sex Marriage: The 2009 Reform .......... 98
    5.3.2.3 Same-Sex Marriage: Court Decisions .......... 98
    5.3.2.4 Social Security and Social Rights for Same-Sex Couples ....................................................... 100
  5.3.3 Mexican Federal States .......................................... 101
5.4 Central America .......................................................... 104
  5.4.1 Guatemala ............................................................. 104
  5.4.2 Costa Rica ............................................................. 104
    5.4.2.1 Court Decisions .............................................. 105
    5.4.2.2 Electoral and Constitutional Battle Over the Bill on Same-Sex Civil Unions ............................. 106
  5.4.3 El Salvador ............................................................ 107
5.5 South America ............................................................ 109
  5.5.1 Colombia ............................................................... 109
    5.5.1.1 Constitutional Framework and Court Decisions ... 109
    5.5.1.2 Legislative Reactions to the Decisions of the Constitutional Court ........................................... 113
  5.5.2 Venezuela .............................................................. 113
  5.5.3 Ecuador ................................................................. 114
  5.5.4 Brazil .................................................................... 114
  5.5.5 Chile ..................................................................... 118
5.5.5.1 The Constitutional Court Rejects Same-Sex Marriage ........................................ 118
5.5.5.2 Bills on Same-Sex Couples ....................................... 119
5.5.5.3 Lack of Protection at the National Level: The Atala Riffo Case ...................... 119
5.5.6 Uruguay .......................................................... 120
5.5.7 Argentina .......................................................... 122
  5.5.7.1 General Overview ....................................... 122
  5.5.7.2 Court Decisions ........................................... 122
  5.5.7.3 Court Decisions in Buenos Aires: Constitutional Principles Supporting Same-Sex Marriage .................. 122
  5.5.7.4 Legislative Reaction to Judicial Decisions ........................................ 124
References ................................................................................. 124

6 Following the Legislative Leaders: Judicial Recognition of Same Sex Couples in Australia and New Zealand .......... 127
Olivia Rundle
  6.1 Introduction .................................................................... 127
  6.2 Australia ........................................................................ 128
    6.2.1 Background: The Australian Legal Order ........................................ 128
    6.2.2 Same-Sex Marriage .................................................... 131
    6.2.3 Same-Sex Relationship Recognition ...................................... 133
      6.2.3.1 Non-Married Relationship Registration ................................ 133
      6.2.3.2 De Facto Recognition of Same-Sex Couples ............................. 134
      6.2.3.3 Judicial Recognition of Same-Sex Couples .................................. 136
    6.2.4 Same-Sex Parenting ..................................................... 139
      6.2.4.1 Judicial Recognition of Legal Parentage ................................... 140
      6.2.4.2 Judicial Views on Parenting by Same-Sex Couples .................... 141
  6.3 New Zealand ............................................................... 142
    6.3.1 Background: The New Zealand Legal Order .................................... 143
    6.3.2 Same-Sex Marriage ..................................................... 144
    6.3.3 Same-Sex Relationship Recognition ...................................... 148
      6.3.3.1 Non-Married Relationships Registration ................................ 148
      6.3.3.2 De Facto Recognition of Same-Sex Couples ............................. 149
      6.3.3.3 Judicial Recognition of Same-Sex Couples .................................. 149
    6.3.4 Same-Sex Parented Families ............................................. 152
      6.3.4.1 Legal Parentage ........................................................ 152
      6.3.4.2 Parenting by Same-Sex Couples ............................................ 155
  6.4 Comparison of Australia and New Zealand ........................................... 156
    6.4.1 Legal Orders and Human Rights Frameworks .................................. 156
    6.4.2 Marriage Inequality ..................................................... 157
6.4.3 Treatment of Same-Sex Couples ................... 158
6.4.4 Recognition of Same-Sex Parents ................ 158
6.5 Conclusion ...................................... 159
References ........................................... 159

7 The Nordic Model: Same-Sex Families in Love and Law ........ 161
Hrefna Friðriksdóttir
7.1 Introduction ....................................... 161
7.2 Nordic Family Law and Same-Sex Relationships ........ 162
  7.2.1 The Nordic Model ................................ 162
  7.2.2 The Nordic Legal Family ....................... 163
  7.2.3 Nordic Milestones ................................ 164
  7.2.4 Same-Sex Relationships in the Nordic Countries .. 165
    7.2.4.1 Denmark ................................... 165
    7.2.4.2 Norway ..................................... 169
    7.2.4.3 Sweden ..................................... 170
    7.2.4.4 Iceland ..................................... 174
    7.2.4.5 Finland ..................................... 175
7.3 Conclusionary Remarks ................................ 176
References ........................................... 179

8 A Glorious Revolution? UK Courts and Same-Sex Couples .... 181
Aidan O’Neill
8.1 Introduction: From the Period of Criminalisation to That of
  Liberalization ........................................ 182
8.2 The UK’s Approach to Same-Sex Conduct and Couples: The
  Interaction Between the European Court of Human Rights and
  National Courts ....................................... 183
  8.2.1 Gays Openly in the Military ..................... 184
  8.2.2 Equalisation of the Age of Consent Between Gay and
        Straight .......................................... 185
  8.2.3 Children and Their Gay Parents ................ 185
  8.2.4 Death and the Same-Sex Couple .................. 186
8.3 The UK’s Approach to Same-Sex Couples: The Influence of
  EU Law .................................................. 187
  8.3.1 The EU Legislature Prohibits Sexual Orientation
        Discrimination in the Workplace ................ 187
8.4 Same-Sex Couples in the Twenty-First Century: The UK
  Legislature Becomes the Motor for Change in the UK ..... 188
  8.4.1 Civil Partnerships and Same Sex Marriages ......... 189
    8.4.1.1 Same Sex Marriages and Civil Partnerships
            Have Nothing (Expressly) to Do with Sex .... 189
    8.4.1.2 Same Sex Marriages and Civil Partnerships
            and Religious Ceremonies .................... 190
    8.4.1.3 Conscientious Objection and the Civil
            Registrar ....................................... 194
8.4.2 The Equality Act 2010 and Its Application

8.4.2.1 Marriage and Civil Partnership to Be Treated as of Equivalent Status Within the ambit of EU Law

8.4.2.2 Prohibition Against Sexual Orientation Discrimination Extended to Provision of Goods and Services to the Public and to All Functions of a Public Law Nature

8.4.2.3 Duty on Public Sector Bodies Actively to Promote Equality Between Gay and Straight

8.4.2.4 Homophobia and Freedom of Expression

8.4.2.5 Equality of Treatment of Gay and Straight Received by the UK Courts as a General Principle of (Common) Law

8.4.2.6 Statutory “Ministerial Exemption” from Prohibition on Sexual Orientation Discrimination

8.4.2.6.1 UK Ministerial Exemption Incompatible with EU Law?

8.4.2.6.2 Ministerial Exemption for Religious Employers and the Strasbourg Jurisprudence

8.5 Conclusions

References

9 Between Recognition and Homophobia: Same-Sex Couples in Eastern Europe

Adam Bodnar and Anna Śledzińska-Simon

9.1 Introduction

9.2 The Eastern European Countries’ Approach to LGBT Rights and Same-Sex Couples in Brief

9.2.1 National Constitutions

9.2.2 Membership in the Council of Europe

9.2.3 Membership in the EU

9.3 The Link Between Recognition of Same-Sex Couples and Homophobia

9.4 The Interplay Between Courts and Parliaments in Recognition of Same-Sex Couples

9.4.1 Croatia

9.4.2 Hungary

9.4.3 Slovenia

9.5 Judicial Recognition of the Rights of Same-Sex Couples: The Case of Poland

9.5.1 The Emergence of the LGBT Movement and Failures to Recognize Same-Sex Couples in Law

9.5.2 Kozak v. Poland: The Right to Enter into a Lease Agreement After a Partner’s Death
9.5.3 The Rights of Same-Sex Couples Exercising Their Freedom of Movement in the EU ........................................ 239
  9.5.3.1 The Right to Obtain a Non-marriage Certificate and a Certificate for the Legal Capability to Enter into Marriage ........................................ 239
  9.5.3.2 The Right to the Recognition of a Same-Sex Registered Partnership or Marriage Concluded in Another Member State ........................................ 241
  9.5.3.3 The Right to Move and Reside in a Member State by a Third Country National Who Is a Same-Sex Partner of an EU Citizen ........................................ 242

9.5.4 The Right to the Recognition of Same-Sex Couples in Poland in Light of the ECHR ........................................ 243

9.6 Conclusions ........................................ 244

References ........................................ 245

10 Same-Sex Couples in France and Belgium: The Resilient Practice of Judicial Deference ........................................ 249
Philippe Reyniers

10.1 Political and Institutional Contexts ........................................ 249
10.2 France ........................................ 250
  10.2.1 Overcoming Homosexuality as a Deviant Conduct .................. 250
  10.2.2 Early Recognition of Same-Sex Couples ........................................ 251
  10.2.3 Same-Sex Marriage ........................................ 253

10.3 Belgium ........................................ 255
  10.3.1 Overcoming the Conception of Homosexuality as Deviant Conduct ........................................ 255
  10.3.2 Early Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships ........................................ 257
  10.3.3 Same-Sex Marriage ........................................ 258
  10.3.4 Same-Sex Parenthood ........................................ 260

10.4 Conclusion ........................................ 262

References ........................................ 262

11 At the Crossroads Between Privacy and Community: The Legal Status of Same-Sex Couples in German, Austrian and Swiss Law ........................................ 263
Giorgio Repetto

11.1 Introduction ........................................ 263
11.2 The Status of Same-Sex Couples in German Law ........................................ 265
  11.2.1 Constitutional Background ........................................ 265
  11.2.2 The Emergence of Same-Sex Relationships Issues and the Right to Marriage: The Different Cohabitation Regimes ........................................ 267
    11.2.2.1 Same-Sex Marriage ........................................ 267
    11.2.2.2 De Facto Homosexual Couples ........................................ 269
    11.2.2.3 Registered Partnerships (Lebenspartnerschaft) ........................................ 270
11.3 The Status of Same-Sex Couples in Austrian Law .......... 277
11.3.1 Constitutional Background and the Introduction of Registered Partnerships in 2010 ............... 277
11.3.2 The Enjoyment of Social Rights by Registered Partners .................................................. 279
11.3.3 The Enjoyment of Parental Rights by Registered Partners .................................................. 279
11.4 The Status of Same-Sex Couples in Swiss Law .......... 280
11.4.1 Constitutional Background and the Introduction of Registered Partnership in 2007 .................. 280
11.4.2 The Enjoyment of Social Rights by Same-Sex Couples .................................................. 281
11.4.3 The Enjoyment of Parental Rights by Registered Partners .................................................. 282
11.5 Conclusions: The “Central European” Model of Same-Sex Partnership at the Crossroads Between Symbols and Reality ... 283
References .................................................................. 284

12 Judicial Restraint and Political Responsibility: A Review of the Jurisprudence of the Italian, Spanish and Portuguese High Courts on Same-Sex Couples ........................................ 287
Tiago Fidalgo de Freitas and Diletta Tega
12.1 Introduction ................................................. 288
12.2 Italy .......................................................... 289
12.2.1 Introductory Remarks .................................. 289
12.2.2 Decision No. 138 of 2010 of the Italian Constitutional Court .................................................. 291
12.2.3 The ECtHR’s Judgement in Schalk and Kopf v. Austria .................................................. 294
12.2.4 Decision No. 4184 of 2012 of the Italian Supreme Court of Cassation .................. 296
12.2.5 Concluding Remarks ................................. 298
12.3 Spain .......................................................... 299
12.3.1 Introductory Remarks .................................. 299
12.3.2 Law No. 13/2005 and Case No. 198/2012 of the Constitutional Court .................................. 300
12.3.3 Concluding Remarks ................................. 304
12.4 Portugal .......................................................... 304
12.4.1 Introductory Remarks .................................. 304
12.4.2 Case n. 359/2009 of the Constitutional Court .................................................. 305
12.4.3 Law No. 9/2010 and Case n. 121/2010 of the Constitutional Court .................................. 308
12.4.4 Concluding Remarks ................................. 313
References ......................................................... 314
13 The Legal Situation of Same-Sex Couples in Greece and Cyprus

Spyridon Drosos and Aristoteles Constantinides

13.1 Introduction ...................................... 319
13.2 Legal Framework .................................. 321
    13.2.1 Greece .................................... 321
    13.2.2 Cyprus .................................... 324
13.3 Case-Law ........................................ 325
    13.3.1 Greece .................................... 325
    13.3.1.1 The Meaning of ‘Marriage’ Under the
              Greek Civil Code ............................... 325
    13.3.1.2 The Exclusion of Same-Sex Couples from
              Civil Unions Before the Strasbourg Court ....... 329
    13.3.2 Cyprus .................................... 333
    13.3.2.1 Reports of the Ombudsman: Discrimination
              Against Same-Sex Couples ....................... 333
    13.3.2.2 Reports of the Ombudsman: Recommending
              the Introduction of Civil Partnership for Both
              Opposite-Sex and Same-Sex Couples .............. 336
    13.3.2.3 The Supreme Court Decision in Correia
              and Or v. Republic .................................. 338
13.4 In Lieu of Conclusion: Towards Introducing Same-Sex Civil
    Unions in Both Greece and Cyprus (?) .............. 339

References ............................................ 340

Section 2 Private International Law Issues

14 The Law Applicable to the Formation of Same-Sex Partnerships
   and Marriages ....................................... 343
Roberto Virzo

14.1 Preliminary Remarks ................................ 343
14.2 Private International Law Issues Concerning the Formation
    of Same-Sex Registered Unions ..................... 344
    14.2.1 Applicability of the Conflict of Laws Rules on
            Contractual Obligations ......................... 344
    14.2.2 Applicability of the Conflict of Laws Rules
            on Marriage ...................................... 346
    14.2.3 Special Conflict of Laws Rules and lex loci registrationis
            as a Connecting Factor .......................... 347
14.3 Private International Law Issues Concerning the Formation
    of Same-Sex Marriages .............................. 351

References ............................................ 356

15 On Recognition of Foreign Same-Sex Marriages and
   Partnerships ....................................... 359
Giacomo Biagioni
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>Preliminary Remarks</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>Cross-Border Mobility and Private International Law</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>Proceedings Involving Recognition of Same-Sex Relationships Before National Courts</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3.1</td>
<td>Proceedings for Registration of Same-Sex Relationships</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3.2</td>
<td>Claims by Same-Sex Couples for Benefits Recognized to Opposite-Sex Couples</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3.3</td>
<td>Proceedings for Divorce or Dissolution of Same-Sex Relationships</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>Recognition of Foreign Same-Sex Unions in National Courts</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4.1</td>
<td>In States Which Grant Same-Sex Couples Access to Marriage</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4.2</td>
<td>In States Which Grant Same-Sex Couples Access to Civil Unions</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4.3</td>
<td>In States Which Do Not Recognize Same-Sex Unions as Legal</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4.3.1</td>
<td>Non-Existence of a Foreign Same-Sex Marriage</td>
<td>375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4.3.2</td>
<td>Public Policy</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Same-Sex Families Across Borders</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>Same-Sex Families in a Transnational Context</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>Crossing the Border: Conflict-of-Law Aspects of Same-Sex Families</td>
<td>385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.1</td>
<td>Access to Medically Assisted Procreation</td>
<td>385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.2</td>
<td>Joint Adoption by Same-Sex Couples</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.3</td>
<td>Surrogate Motherhood</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part II Supranational and International (and Quasi-) Jurisdictions

Section 1 Human Rights Law Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Same-Sex Couples Before the ECtHR: The Right to Marriage</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>Schalk and Kopf: The Proceedings Before the National Courts</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
17.3 The ECtHR’s Judgment in Schalk and Kopf: The Reference to Transsexual Cases ................................. 401
17.4 The Reasoning of the European Court in Schalk and Kopf: ........................................... 402
17.5 Effects of the Decision in Schalk and Kopf and Future Developments ..................................... 405
References ............................................ 407

18 Same-Sex Couples’ Rights (Other than the Right to Marry) Before the ECtHR ........................................... 409
Francesco Crisafulli
18.1 Introduction ...................................... 409
18.2 Homosexuality and Sexual Intercourse ................................................................. 410
18.3 Private Life and Family Life ................................................................. 417
18.4 Patrimonial Rights ................................................................. 419
18.5 Parental Rights ................................................................. 425
18.6 Expulsion of Aliens ................................................................. 434
References ............................................ 436

19 Same-Sex Couples Before the Inter-American System of Human Rights ........................................... 437
Laura Magi
19.1 Introduction ...................................... 437
19.2 Measures Adopted to Combat Violence and Discrimination Against LGTBI Individuals ................................................................. 439
19.2.1 Precautionary Measures ................................................................. 440
19.2.2 IACHR Special Unit ................................................................. 441
19.3 Case Law of the Inter-American Court on Human Rights Concerning LGTBI Individuals ................................................................. 441
19.3.1 Cases Brought Before IACHR ................................................................. 442
19.3.2 The Court Judgment in Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile ................................................................. 444
19.3.2.1 General Remarks ................................................................. 444
19.3.2.2 Violation of the Right of an Equal Treatment Before the Law ................................................................. 445
19.3.2.3 Violation of the Right to a Private and Family Life ................................................................. 448
19.3.2.4 Reparations ................................................................. 452
References ............................................ 453

Section 2 EU Law Issues

20 Free Movement Rights for Same-Sex Couples Under EU Law: What Role to Play for the CJEU? ................................................................. 455
Jorrit Rijpma and Nelleke Koffeman
20.1 Introduction ...................................... 455
20.2 Delineating the Jurisdiction of the CJEU ................................................................. 457
20.3 The Rights of Same-Sex Partners as Fundamental Rights .......................... 461
20.4 The Rights of Same-Sex Partners of EU Citizens Under EU Secondary Law ............................................. 465
   20.4.1 Directive 2004/38/EC ........................................... 466
      20.4.1.1 Same-Sex Spouses ........................................... 468
      20.4.1.2 Same-Sex Registered Partners ............................. 472
      20.4.1.3 Same-Sex Partners ........................................... 474
20.5 The Rights of Same-Sex Partners of EU Citizens Under EU Primary Law ............................................. 475
   20.5.1 The Existence of a Restriction ........................................... 476
   20.5.2 Possible Justifications ............................................. 478
      20.5.2.1 Public Policy ............................................. 479
      20.5.2.2 National Identity ........................................... 481
   20.5.3 The Implications of Mutual Recognition .......................... 483
20.6 Third-Country Nationals and Same-Sex Partners ........................................... 484
20.7 European Private International Law ............................................. 487
20.8 Conclusion ............................................................... 489
References ................................................................. 490

21 Employment Benefits for Same-Sex Couples: The Case-Law of the CJEU .................................................. 493
Massimo F. Orzan
21.1 Introduction ............................................................... 494
21.2 The Jurisprudence Concerning Same-Sex Couples in EU Staff Cases ............................................................. 495
   21.2.1 D v. Council and the Adoption of Regulation 723/2004 ........................................................... 496
   21.2.2 W v. Commission and the Application of New Art. 1(2)(c) of Annex VII to the Staff Regulations .................. 498
   21.2.3 The Roodhuijzen Case and the Autonomous Notion of Non-Marital Partnership in the Staff Regulations .... 499
21.3 Preliminary Rulings: A More Cautious Approach ................................................................. 500
   21.3.1 The Grant Case and the Adoption of Directive 2000/78 ........................................................... 501
   21.3.2 The K.B. Case and the Different Approach of the CJEU to the Discrimination of Transsexuals .................. 502
   21.3.3 The Maruko Case and the First (Apparently Revolutionary) Application of the Prohibition of Sexual Orientation Discrimination ................................................................. 504
   21.3.4 The Römer Case and the Confirmation of Member States’ Freedom to Introduce the Equivalence Between Same-Sex Couples and Married Couples ........................................... 506
21.4 Conclusion ................................................................. 506
References ................................................................. 507
Section 3 International Labour Law Issues and Quasi-Jurisdictional Bodies

22 International Administrative Tribunals and Their Non-Originalist Jurisprudence on Same-Sex Couples: ‘Spouse’ and ‘Marriage’ in Context, Between Social Changes and the Doctrine of Renvoi

Daniele Gallo

22.1 Scope of Research: The Jurisprudence of the UNAT and ILOAT as a Privileged Tool of Analysis

22.2 The Law Governing Employment Relations Between International Organizations and Their Staff: The Heterogeneous Notion of ‘Family’, ‘Spouse’, ‘Marriage’, and the Renvoi to the Official’s Lex Patriae

22.3 The Jurisprudence of the UNAT on Same-Sex Marriage and Partnerships

22.3.1 The Berghuys Case: The Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Marriages, But Not Partnerships

22.3.2 The Adrian Case: An Atypical (and Indirect) Judicial Revirement and the UN Secretary General’s Activism

22.4 The Jurisprudence of ILOAT on Same-Sex Marriage and Partnerships

22.4.1 The Geyer Case: Traditional (Heterosexual) Marriages and the Renvoi to the Lex Celebrationis

22.4.2 The Case-Law on Same-Sex Marriage and Partnerships, Between a Substantive Approach and the Renvoi to the Staff Members’ Lex Patriae

22.4.2.1 The Applicants’ Main Arguments

22.4.2.2 The Defendant Organizations’ Main Counter-Arguments

22.4.2.3 The Tribunal’s Considerations

22.5 Concluding Remarks

References

23 Same-Sex Couples Before Quasi-Jurisdictional Bodies: The Case of the UN Human Rights Committee

Luca Paladini

23.1 Preliminary Remarks

23.2 The Human Rights Committee’s Monitor Functions

23.2.1 Focus on the Competence to Examine Individual Communications

23.2.1.1 Sending and Registration of Individual Communications

23.2.1.2 The Admissibility Criteria Under the Protocol
23.2.1.3 Pronunciation of Views and the Follow-Up Procedure

23.2.1.4 Nature and Authoritativeness of the HRC and Its Views

23.3 The HRC Case-Law on LGBT Rights

23.4 The HRC Case-Law on Same-Sex Couples Issues

23.4.1 The Right to Marry

23.4.2 The Right to Benefit from the Deceased Partner’s Pension

23.4.2.1 The Case of Young v. Australia

23.4.2.2 The Case of X v. Colombia

23.4.2.3 The Follow-Up of Cases on the Deceased Partner’s Pension

23.4.2.4 The Potential of Art. 26 ICCPR

23.5 Final Remarks

23.5.1 Interpretation of the Covenant, Marriage and Same-Sex Partnership

23.5.2 HRC as a Forum for Same-Sex Couples

References
Same-Sex Couples before National, Supranational and International Jurisdictions
Gallo, D.; Paladini, L.; Pustorino, P. (Eds.)
2014, XXXIV, 558 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-35433-5