Contents

Part I Introduction

1 Reconsidering the Legal Concepts of Genocide and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ .................................................. 3
  1.1 Children as Targets of Genocide ........................................ 3
  1.2 Genocide as a Separate Category of Grave International Crime .......................................................... 9
  1.3 Children as a ‘Protected Group’: Implications for Our Understanding of ‘Protected Group’ .......................... 11
    1.3.1 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children and Children as a ‘Protected Group’ ........ 16
  1.4 Additional Points Regarding ‘Protected Groups’ ...................... 20
  1.5 ‘Restrictive Interpretation’ of Genocide Provisions: Implications for the Notion of Children as Persons .. 22
    1.5.1 Restrictive Interpretation That Favours the Intention of the Parties Versus What Is Expressed in Text .... 24
  1.6 Foreseeability, Perpetrator Accountability and Rome Statute Article 6(e) .................................................. 28
    1.6.1 The Nullum Crimen Principle and the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children to an Armed Group or Force .......................... 30
    1.6.2 Evolving Conceptions of What Constitutes a Protected Group .................................................. 34
  1.7 The Rome Statute Article 6 Protected Group “As Such” Terminology .................................................. 37
    1.7.1 ‘Forcible Displacement’ vs. ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ .................................. 38
    1.7.2 Genocide’s Special Targets and the Destruction of Future Generations ........................................ 41

Literature, Materials and Situations/Cases ........................................... 47
Part II  ICC Prosecutor Case Selection and Charging Decisions

2 Gravity and Interests of Justice Considerations ................................. 53

2.1 Ambiguity of the Test for ‘Sufficient Gravity’
Regarding Admissibility of the Case.............................................. 53

2.2 The Situation in the DRC: Case Selection and Gravity................. 55

2.3 The Situation in Darfur: Case Selection and Gravity.................. 58

2.3.1 Parallels Between U.N. Peacekeepers and Children
as ‘Protected Groups’................................................................. 60

2.4 Legal Characterization of the Facts and the Assessment
of Gravity........................................................... 61

2.4.1 ‘Relative Gravity’ and the ‘Genocidal Forcible
Transfer of Children’............................................................... 63

2.5 Children’s Right to Justice and Legal Empowerment................. 64

2.6 Truth and Reconciliation Mechanisms and Child Victims.......... 67

2.7 An Additional Note Regarding Child Soldier Victims
of the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’......................... 69

2.8 Child Soldiers and the Question of Potential State
Criminal Liability................................................................. 74

2.9 ‘The Interests of Justice’ and ICC Case Admissibility.............. 77

Literature, Materials and Situations/Cases ..................................... 80

Part III  Selected ICC Cases Illustrating the Failure to Address
the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children

3 Case 1: Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo
(Hereafter Also Referred to as Lubanga) ........................................ 85

3.1 The War Crimes Charges: On Why They Were Insufficient........ 85

3.1.1 The Confirmed Charges .................................................... 85

3.1.2 The Prosecution’s Closing: Selected Issues Arising ............... 86

3.1.3 The Context of Armed Conflict in Lubanga ......................... 94

3.1.4 The Common Plan and Genocidal Intent ............................. 97

3.1.5 Gender Crimes and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer
of Children’................................................................. 106

3.1.6 The Legal Re-Characterization of the Facts
Controversy in Lubanga............................................................ 113

3.1.7 On the Short Training Afforded FPLC Child Soldiers:
Implications................................................................................. 137

3.1.8 The ‘Continuous Nature’ of the International Crimes
Perpetrated Against FPLC Child Soldiers....................................... 138

3.1.9 The Defence Closing and the Prosecution Reply:
Selected Issues Arising ............................................................... 146

Literature, Materials and Cases ..................................................... 197
4 Case 2: Prosecutor v. Germain Katanga and Mathieu Ngudjolo Chui

4.1 Confirmed Charges ........................................... 201
4.2 The Prosecution Opening Statement .......................... 202
4.3 Charging Sexual Violence Crimes Under the Rome Statute .... 203
4.4 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children
as “Child Soldiers” ............................................. 208
    4.4.1 The FNI/FRPI Appropriation of Children as the
        ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ ............ 208
    4.4.2 Cruel and Inhuman Treatment of FNI/FRPI
        ‘Child Soldiers’ ........................................ 214
    4.4.3 Mens Rea and the Appropriation of Children
        to the FNI/FRPI ........................................ 217
    4.4.4 Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children; Nationality
        and the Protected Status of Children ................ 218
    4.4.5 More on Outrages on Personal Dignity .............. 219

Literature, Materials and Cases ................................. 220

5 Case 3: Prosecutor v Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir ........ 223

5.1 Background .................................................. 223
5.2 The Prosecutor’s ICC Application for an Arrest Warrant
    Re Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir (14 July, 2008) ........ 224
    5.2.1 On Whether Darfur Involved ‘Autogenocide’ and
        Whether Correctly Answering that Question Matters ... 224
    5.2.2 Motive, Genocide and Child Soldiering .............. 225
    5.2.3 The Targeting of So-Called ‘Arab’ Children of Darfur
        for Child Soldiering as an Act of Genocide ........... 228
    5.2.4 Sexual Violence as a Vehicle for the Genocidal
        Forcible Transfer of Children .......................... 232
    5.2.5 The Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers by the
        GoS During the Time Period Covered by the Al Bashir
        Case (March 2003 to July 14, 2008) .................... 236
    5.2.6 Report of the Secretary-General on Children and Armed
        Conflict in the Sudan (5 July, 2011) .................... 237
5.3 The Interests of Justice and a Judicial Remedy for Child Victims
    in Darfur ................................................... 242
5.4 The Standard of Proof in Regards to Establishing the Offence
    of Genocide in Its Various Forms .......................... 244
    5.4.1 The Struggle to Confirm Genocide Charges
        in the Al Bashir Case .................................... 244
5.5 The Standard of Proof in Regards to Establishing the Offence
    of the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children (Warrant Stage) . . 245
5.6 On Identifying Genocide in Darfur .......................... 248
5.7 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children in Darfur .......... 253

Literature, Materials and Cases ................................. 257
## Part IV Conclusion

### 6 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children: A Crime Well Established in International Law; Yet Still Not Prosecuted by the ICC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Gravity of the Crime as an ICC Admissibility Criterion</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>The Interests of Justice: Insights from the ICC Pre-Trial Judgement in <em>Kenya</em></td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>The Somali Situation and the Matter of Impunity for Perpetrating ‘Child Soldiering’</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2</td>
<td>Background to the Somali Situation and Child Victimization</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Gravity of the International Crimes Perpetrated by Al Shabaab Against Children</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Pursuing the Accountability of Somali Perpetrators</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>The Situation in Chad and the Matter of Impunity for Perpetrating ‘Child Soldiering’</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.1</td>
<td>Reports by Amnesty International and the UN on the Situation in Chad</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7.2</td>
<td>Chad and the U.S. ‘Child Soldiers Prevention Act of 2008’</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Acknowledging Existing International Norms that Protect Children from Genocidal Forcible Transfer</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.1</td>
<td>Gaps in Children’s Access to International Justice</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.2</td>
<td>Genocidal Context and the Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.3</td>
<td>Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children Through Sexual Victimization</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.4</td>
<td>ICC independence and Impartiality and Prosecuting Grave International Crimes Perpetrated Against Children</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8.5</td>
<td>The ICC and the Interests of Child Victims of Genocidal Forcible Transfer</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>PostScript: The Syrian Regime’s Genocidal Targeting of Children in Particular</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Literature, Materials and Cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Index

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Humanity’s Children
ICC Jurisprudence and the Failure to Address the
Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children
Grover, S.C.
2013, XII, 324 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-32500-7