Contents

1 The “Ethics Job” ................................................................. 1
  1.1 The Role of the “In-house” Ethicist and How This Book Came About ......................................................... 1
  1.2 Research in Genomics .................................................. 3
    1.2.1 Genetics and Genomics ........................................ 3
    1.2.2 A Genomics Research Project: The Procardis Consortium ......................................................... 4
    1.2.3 Varieties of Genomics Research ................................ 4
  1.3 Ethical Debate in Genomics ........................................... 5
  1.4 Putting Philosophy to Work in Ethics and Genomics ................. 7
    1.4.1 Careful Attention to Steps in Arguments .................... 7
    1.4.2 Matching up Theory with Experience ....................... 8
    1.4.3 Developing Moral Thought ................................... 10
  1.5 Conclusions ........................................................... 12
  1.6 Study Questions ....................................................... 13
  1.7 Coming Up Next ...................................................... 13
References ........................................................................ 13

2 Why Research Ethics? Why Ethics in Genetics? The Case of Genomics Research .................................................. 15
  2.1 A Brief History of the Ethical Regulation of Research .......... 15
  2.2 An Equally Brief History of Ethical Issues in Genetics ........ 18
    2.2.1 Worries About Eugenics ....................................... 18
    2.2.2 Genetics and Populations: The Spectre of “Race” ........ 21
    2.2.3 Genetics and Reproduction .................................... 22
    2.2.4 Genetics, Life, and Identity ................................... 22
  2.3 Meet ELSI ............................................................ 24
  2.4 Too Much Ethics? ........................................................ 26
  2.5 Human Subjects and Subjects of Research ....................... 28
  2.6 Lessons from Research Abuses and Open Debate .............. 32
  2.7 Researchers Facing Ethical Issues: Accounts from the Front Line .......................................................... 33
6  Autonomy and Its Limits: The View from Genomics  .......... 109
  6.1 Introduction ......................................................... 109
  6.2 What Is Autonomy? Philosophical Accounts of the Notion
     of Autonomy ............................................................. 110
     6.2.1 Descriptive and Normative Accounts of Autonomy .......... 111
     6.2.2 Mere Choice: Or Reasoned Choice? ............................ 111
     6.2.3 Negative and Positive Approaches to Autonomy .......... 112
     6.2.4 The Domain of Autonomy: Self, Body, Life, Information . . . 112
     6.2.5 Autonomy, Community, and Other Values .................. 115
     6.2.6 Alternative Ways of Valuing and Protecting the Individual
          Not Based on Autonomy ..................................... 117
  6.3 Autonomy in Research Ethics: Research Upon Autonomy ...... 118
     6.3.1 Milgram’s Obedience Experiments .............................. 119
     6.3.2 Moral Conceit: What We Do Not Know About Ourselves . . 120
     6.3.3 The Fragility of Autonomy .................................... 121
     6.3.4 Consent, Authority, and Institutions ...................... 122
     6.3.5 Consent, Conscience, and Persuasion ........................ 123
     6.3.6 The Institutionalisation of Consent........................... 125
  6.4 Conclusions ......................................................... 127
  6.5 Study Questions ..................................................... 127
  6.6 Coming Up Next .................................................... 128
  References .............................................................. 129

7  The Social and Institutional Setting of Ethics .................. 131
  7.1 Introduction ........................................................ 131
  7.2 Science in a Social Context ...................................... 132
     7.2.1 Science and Money ........................................... 132
     7.2.2 Scientific Teamwork .......................................... 135
     7.2.3 Science and Wider Society ................................... 135
  7.3 Institutional Influences and Authority .......................... 136
  7.4 Social Influences on Moral Action .............................. 139
     7.4.1 Institutional Ethics: Administrative Evil .................. 140
  7.5 Hindrances to Ethical Action and Reasoning and What to Do
     About Them .................................................................... 141
     7.5.1 Time ................................................................... 141
     7.5.2 Dehumanisation ................................................... 144
     7.5.3 Social Conformity ............................................... 145
     7.5.4 Moral Disengagement ............................................ 146
     7.5.5 The Diffusion of Responsibility ............................... 146
     7.5.6 Whistleblowers ................................................... 147
  7.6 Conclusions ............................................................ 147
  7.7 Study Questions ....................................................... 148
  7.8 Coming Up Next ..................................................... 148
  References .............................................................. 149
8 Respect for Persons in Research and in Genetics .......... 151
  8.1 Study Question .................................................. 151
  8.2 Introduction ...................................................... 152
  8.3 Varieties of Respect: Divergent Understandings of the Concept of Respect for Persons ............................ 153
  8.4 Background: The Debate About Feedback of Results .... 154
  8.5 The Use and Misuse of the Notion of “Respect for Persons” in a Current Debate in Genomics Research Ethics .......... 156
  8.6 Concluding Unscientific Postscript: Problems with the Use of Science in Ethical Debate ............................ 164
  8.7 The Need for Detailed Consideration of Different Cases ... 167
  8.8 Conclusions ........................................................ 168
  8.9 Study Questions ................................................... 169
  8.10 Coming Up Next .................................................. 170
Appendix: Participants at a Workshop on Respect for Persons, St. Hugh’s College Oxford, 2010 ................................. 170
References .............................................................. 172

9 Responsibilities of Researchers in Genetics ................. 173
  9.1 Introduction ......................................................... 173
  9.2 Responsibility for Health ........................................... 175
  9.3 Responsibilities of the Medical Profession ...................... 177
  9.4 Responsibilities of Medical Researchers .......................... 178
  9.5 Recent Calls for Researchers in Genomics to Take on Expanding Responsibilities .................................................. 180
  9.7 Responsibilities of Research Subjects and Genomics Research . 183
  9.8 Legal Notions of Responsibility: The “Duty of Care” of Genomics Researchers .................................................. 184
  9.9 Moral Responsibility: Some Lessons from Psychology ........ 187
    9.9.1 Warnings for Genomics Research: Ways in Which We Abnegate Responsibility ............................................. 187
    9.9.2 Ideology and Responsibility .................................. 189
    9.9.3 How Can Responsible Behaviour Be Fostered? .............. 189
  9.10 Conclusions ........................................................ 190
  9.11 Study Questions ................................................... 191
  9.12 Coming Up Next .................................................. 192
References .............................................................. 192

10 Data Sharing in Genomics ........................................... 195
  10.1 Introduction ........................................................ 195
  10.2 Reasons to Share Genomics Data: Views from Policy and Practice .................................................. 198
| 10.2.1 | Data Sharing as the Norm | 198 |
| 10.2.2 | Improving Scientific Outputs | 199 |
| 10.2.3 | Fostering Novelty and Scientific Creativity | 199 |
| 10.2.4 | The Value of Sharing Certain Sorts of Data | 199 |
| 10.2.5 | Visions of Scientific and of Human Progress | 199 |
| 10.2.6 | The Value of Data and the Value of Knowledge | 200 |
| 10.2.7 | Data Sharing and Good Scientific Practice | 200 |
| 10.2.8 | Good Data Sharing and Stewardship | 200 |
| 10.2.9 | Data Sharing and Research Participants | 200 |
| 10.2.10 | Data Sharing Brings Benefit to the Public | 201 |
| 10.2.11 | The Timing of Data Sharing, Speed and Brakes | 201 |
| 10.2.12 | Interests in Controlling Data | 201 |
| 10.3 | Data Sharing and Scientific Practice | 203 |
| 10.3.1 | Stewardship of Data | 204 |
| 10.3.2 | Rewards, Sanctions, and the Scientific Community | 204 |
| 10.4 | The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Sharing Knowledge | 206 |
| 10.5 | Reasons Not to Share: Privacy and the Control of Personal Information | 209 |
| 10.6 | Do We Own Our Genetic Information? | 211 |
| 10.7 | The Value of Knowledge and the Value of Sharing Knowledge: Summary and Analysis | 213 |
| 10.8 | Conclusions | 214 |
| 10.9 | Study Questions | 214 |
| References | 215 |
| Afterword | 217 |
| Glossary | 219 |
| Abbreviations | 223 |
| Index of Text Boxes | 225 |
| Subject Index | 227 |
Ethical Challenges in Genomics Research
A Guide to Understanding Ethics in Context
Boddington, P.
2012, XIV, 234 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-23698-3