# Contents

1 Introduction ............................................................... 1  
   A. Content and Questions Addressed ................................. 1  
      I. Killing: A General Problem in International Law and Its  
         Relevance to the Colombian Case .............................. 1  
      II. Legal Framework ............................................... 2  
      III. The Gray Area Between IHL and Human Rights in Cases  
         of Armed Conflict ............................................... 2  
   B. Justification of the Research Topic ................................ 3  
   C. Questions That Are not Addressed .................................. 5  
   D. Outline ......................................................................... 6  

2 The Situation in Colombia ................................................. 7  
   A. Armed Conflict not of International Character: Classification  
      of the Colombian Case ............................................... 7  
      I. Article 3 GC I–IV .................................................... 8  
         1. Threshold of Application ...................................... 9  
      2. Party to the Conflict: Groups of Organized Crime  
         and Banditry ......................................................... 10  
         a) Degree of Organization ....................................... 11  
            (1) Capacity to Carry Out Operations Reaching  
                the Threshold of Armed Conflict .................... 11  
            (2) Ability to Implement IHL ............................... 12  
         b) Alternative Criteria ............................................. 12  
         c) Are the Armed Groups Required to Have  
            a Political Goal? ................................................ 13  
         d) Can Parties to the Conflict Commit Acts  
            of Terrorism? .................................................... 14  
            (1) View of the US Government ............................ 15  
            (2) Echoing the US Government’s View .................. 15  
            (3) Summary ................................................... 16
3. Non-State Parties to the Colombian Armed Conflict ...... 17
   a) Guerrilla Movements ........................................ 17
      (1) FARC-EP ........................................... 17
      (2) ELN ................................................ 19
   b) Paramilitary Groups ........................................... 19
   c) Organized Criminal Groups, Namely Drug Smugglers ... 22

II. Criteria under Article 1 AP II .................................. 22
   1. The Responsible Command ................................ 23
   2. Control Over Part of a Territory ......................... 24
   3. The Sustained and Concerted Character
      of Military Operations ..................................... 24
   4. Military Operations Against Governmental
      Armed Forces .................................................. 25
   5. The Ability to Implement the Protocol .................... 26

III. Summary ....................................................... 26

B. The Term “Armed Forces” in IHL and the National Police
   of Colombia ............................................................ 26

3 Legal Requirements for the Use of Lethal Force ............... 29
   A. Introductory Explanations of the Right to Life .......... 29
   B. Applicable Branches of International Law ................ 30
      I. Applicability of Human Rights and Applicable
         Conventions .................................................. 30
      II. Relationship Between IHL and the International Law
         of Human Rights .............................................. 32
            1. Process of Convergence ................................ 32
            2. Different Approaches towards Defining
               the Relationship ........................................ 34
      III. Which Body of Law Regulates the Matter? ............ 36
            1. Conduct of Hostilities and Law Enforcement ....... 37
            2. Legal Framework .......................................... 37
      IV. Is There a Specific Branch of International Law
         for the Fight Against Terrorism? .......................... 40
      V. Summary ....................................................... 41

C. Killing under International Humanitarian Law (Hostilities) ... 41
   I. Pertinent Rules for Colombia .................................. 41
   II. Principle of Distinction and Prohibition
       of Indiscriminate Attacks ...................................... 41
       1. Reasons for the Loss of Protection and the Use
          of Lethal Force ............................................. 43
       2. Reasons for the Use of Lethal Force ...................... 44
       3. Notion of “Civilian” ........................................ 45
       4. Notion of “Member of the Armed Forces” ............... 45
          a) Governmental Armed Forces ............................ 46
          b) Organized Armed Groups ............................... 46
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Summary</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Direct Participation of Civilians in Hostilities</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) The Term “Direct Participation in Hostilities”</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Threshold of Harm</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Direct Causality</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Belligerent Nexus</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Preparatory and Final Measures with Regard to Direct Participation</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Evaluation of the Three Constitutive Elements</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Preliminary Considerations</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Attempt to Define</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Different Approaches regarding Personal Scope</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Temporal Scope: Discontinuing the Loss</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Civilians</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Members of Organized Armed Groups</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Presumption in Situations of Doubt</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Summary</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Restrictions on the Use of Lethal Force</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Human Rights Approach</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Principle of Military Necessity</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Concept and Scope of Application</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Permissive and Restrictive Functions</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Necessity-Factor with Regard to the Use of Lethal Force</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Safeguard of a Person <em>Hors de Combat</em></td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Article 5 AP II</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Article 3 GC I–IV</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Customary Law</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Category Two: Defencelessness</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Category Three: Surrender</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Summary of Category Two and Three</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Category One: To Be in the Power of the Adverse Party</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) The Traditional View of the Legal Doctrine</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Test of Practicability of the Proposed Definition</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Meaning of “Attack” under the Safeguard</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
(6) The Proviso regarding the Safeguard .............. 85
(7) Summary and Definition of “to Be in the Power” ... 86
4. Relationship Between *Hors de Combat*
and Military Necessity ..................................... 87
5. Conclusion .................................................. 88
IV. Principle of Proportionality ............................. 89
V. Precautionary Measures ................................... 90
  1. Precautionary Measures with regard to the Principle
     of Distinction ........................................... 91
  2. Precautionary Measures with regard to the Principle
     of Proportionality ....................................... 92
VI. The Prohibition and Restriction of Certain Means
    and Methods ............................................... 93
  1. Denial of Quarter ....................................... 93
  2. Perfidy .................................................. 93
  3. Specific Weapons ....................................... 94
D. Killing under International Human Rights Law
    (Law Enforcement) ........................................ 94
  I. The Right to Life in ICCPR and in ACHR .......... 94
  II. Origin of the Term “Arbitrary” ....................... 95
      1. *Travaux Préparatoires* of the ICCPR .......... 95
      2. *Travaux Préparatoires* of the ACHR .......... 96
      3. Meaning of “Arbitrary” .............................. 96
  III. “Legitimate Purpose” and “Absolute Necessity” .... 97
      1. View of the United Nations’ Human Rights Bodies .... 97
      2. View of the Inter-American Court on Human Rights
         and Inter-American Commission on Human Rights .... 98
      3. European Convention on Human Rights
         as Interpretative Guidance .......................... 99
      4. Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials
         and the Basic Principles on the Use of Force
         and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials ....... 100
      5. Summary of “Legitimate Purpose” and “Absolute
         Necessity” ............................................... 102
         a) Legitimate Purpose ................................. 102
         b) Absolute Necessity ................................. 103
      6. Is Terrorism a Legitimate Purpose? .................. 104
  IV. Arbitrariness and Proportionality .................... 105
      1. Origin of the Rule ..................................... 105
      2. Content of the Rule ................................... 106
  V. Arbitrariness and Legal Basis .......................... 107
      1. Origin of the Legal Basis ............................ 107
      2. Legal Basis in Colombia ................................ 108
  VI. Temporal Scope .......................................... 109
  VII. Further Aspects? ....................................... 109
VIII. Precaution, Control and Organisation of the Operation 110
   1. Prevention of the Escalation of Violence 111
      a) Arrest at an Appropriate Moment 111
      b) Sufficient Set-Up 111
   2. Evaluation of Available Intelligence Information 112
   3. Minimization of Risks Caused by the Use of Firearms 112
E. Findings 112
   I. Legitimacy of the Use of Lethal Force: Military Objective and Legitimate Purpose 113
   II. Restrictions: The Necessity-Factor and the “Least Harmful Means” Requirement 114
   III. Precautionary Measures 115
   IV. Proportionality 116
   V. Prohibition of and Restrictions on Certain Means and Methods 117
   VI. Summary 117

4 Use of Lethal Force by the National Police of Colombia in Various Operations 119
A. Introductive Explanations 119
   I. The Concerned Police Units 120
      1. EMCAR 120
      2. COPES 120
   II. Justification of the Identified Operations 121
   III. Methodology of the Identification of the Four Scenarios 121
B. General Aspects regarding the Operations 122
C. Scenario One 123
   I. Planning 123
   II. Execution 124
      1. Localization of the Area 124
      2. Deployment of the Police 124
      3. Confrontation 124
   III. Legal Assessment 125
      1. Legal Framework Regulating the Scenario 125
      2. Attack of a Military Objective 125
      3. Restriction of Having Been Rendered Hors de Combat 127
      4. Restriction Due to the Principle of Proportionality 127
      5. Further Precautionary Measures 128
      6. Prohibition and Restriction of Certain Means and Methods 128
D. Scenario Two 128
   I. Planning 129
   II. Execution 129
   III. Legal Assessment 130
      1. Requirements of IHL 131
a) Legal Framework that Regulates Scenario Two ....................................................... 131
b) Attack of a Military Objective ................................................................. 132
c) Restrictions Due to the Safeguard of a Person
   Hors de Combat ...................................................................................... 133
   (1) Defencelessness Due to Unconsciousness, Being Shipwrecked, Wounded or Sick .... 133
   (2) Clear Expression of the Intent to Surrender .................................................. 133
   (3) To Be “in the Power” of the Adversary ......................................................... 133
d) Principle of Proportionality ............................................................................ 134
e) Further Precautionary Measures and the Prohibition and Restriction of Certain Means and Methods ................................................................. 134

2. Requirements of the International Law of Human Rights ........................................ 135
   a) Legitimate Purpose ...................................................................................... 135
      (1) Defence of One’s Life or that of Another ..................................................... 135
      (2) Prevention of Escape by Lawful Arrest ....................................................... 135
   b) Absolute Necessity ....................................................................................... 136
c) Temporal Scope of Legitimate Purpose and Absolute Necessity ................................ 136
   d) Proportionality .............................................................................................. 137
   e) Precaution, Control and Organization of the Operation ...................................... 137
      (1) Arrest at an Appropriate Moment .............................................................. 137
      (2) Sufficient Set-Up ....................................................................................... 138
      (3) Available Information ............................................................................... 138
      (4) Minimization of Risks Due to the Use of Firearms ....................................... 138

E. Scenario Three ................................................................................................. 139
   I. Planning ...................................................................................................... 139
   II. Execution .................................................................................................... 140
   III. Legal Assessment ....................................................................................... 140
1. Requirements in IHL ......................................................................................... 141
   a) Legal Framework Regulating the Present Scenario ........................................... 141
   b) Direct Participation ....................................................................................... 142
      (1) Threshold of Harm ................................................................................... 142
      (2) Direct Causality Between Hostile Acts and the Threshold of Harm ................ 142
      (3) Belligerent Nexus ...................................................................................... 143
      (4) Temporal Scope: Spontaneous, Sporadic Participation ................................... 144
      (5) De facto Affiliation ................................................................................... 144
      (6) Summary .................................................................................................. 145
c) Restrictions Due to the Safeguard of a Person
   Hors de Combat .............................................................................................. 145
(1) Defencelessness Because of Unconsciousness, Being Shipwrecked, Wounded or Sick ........... 146
(2) To Be in the Power of the Adversary .......... 146
d) Restrictions Due to the Principle of Proportionality, Further Precautionary Measures and the Prohibition and Restriction of Certain Means and Methods ...... 146

2. Requirements in the International Law
of Human Rights .......................................... 147
a) Legitimate Purpose .................................... 147
b) Absolute Necessity .................................... 148
c) Temporal Scope ....................................... 148
d) Proportionality ....................................... 148
e) Precaution, Control and the Organization of the Operation .................................. 149

F. Scenario Four ........................................................ 150
I. Planning ....................................................... 150
II. Execution ...................................................... 151
III. Legal Assessment ............................................. 151
1. Requirements in IHL ...................................... 151
   a) Legal Framework Regulating the Current Scenario .... 151
   b) Attack of a Military Objective and the Use of Lethal Force .................................. 152
   c) The Restriction of the Use of Lethal Force ........... 152
2. Requirements in the International Law
of Human Rights .................................................. 152
   a) Legitimate Purpose .................................... 152
   b) Absolute Necessity .................................... 153
   c) Temporal Scope ....................................... 153
   d) Proportionality ....................................... 153
   e) Precaution, Control and Organization of the Operation .................................. 154
      (1) Arrest at an Appropriate Moment .......... 154
      (2) Sufficient Set-Up .................................. 154
      (3) Further Aspects ................................... 155

G. Findings .............................................................. 155
I. Causes of the Gray Area ........................................ 155
II. Degree of Convergence between the Requirements in IHL and Human Rights ......................... 157
1. Shooting by the Attacked Individuals and Their Attempt to Escape .......................... 157
   a) Use of Firearms by the Targeted People ......... 157
   b) Discontinuing the Use of Firearms ............... 158
2. Escape of Unarmed Guards of the Coca Field and Their Behaviour in Further Situations .......... 159
5 Main Findings and Thesis Statement ........................................ 165
   A. Main Findings ....................................................... 165
   B. Further Conclusions ................................................. 166
   C. Thesis Statement ..................................................... 167

Bibliography ................................................................. 169

Other Materials ............................................................. 177
   Governmental Documents ........................................ 177
   Reports of International Organizations ............................ 178
   Non-Governmental and Academic Reports ......................... 179
   Travaux Préparatoires ................................................ 180

Abbreviations ............................................................... 183
Killing in a Gray Area between Humanitarian Law and Human Rights
How Can the National Police of Colombia Overcome the Uncertainty of Which Branch of International Law to Apply?
Römer, J.
2010, XVIII, 184 p., Softcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-04661-2