Contents

1 Introduction ............................................................... 1
  1.1 Purposes and Premises of this Book .............................. 3
  1.2 Organization and Philosophy of this Book ..................... 4
  1.3 What Attorneys Think About Other Attorneys’
      Decision-Making Skills ........................................... 6

Part I Evidence

2 Prior Research on Attorney-Litigant Decision Making ............. 11
  2.1 The Paradox of Copious Lawyers and Scant Data .............. 11
  2.2 Empirical Legal Research on Judge, Jury and Attorney
      Decision Making ..................................................... 15
    2.2.1 Judge-Jury Agreement ....................................... 17
    2.2.2 Punitive Damages ............................................. 19
    2.2.3 Judges’ Assessments of Juries .............................. 19
    2.2.4 Attorney-Jury and Attorney-Attorney Agreement .......... 20
    2.2.5 Attorney-Litigant Negotiation Positions, Assessments
          and Outcomes ...................................................... 20
    2.2.6 Disparities In “Same Case” Evaluations and Outcomes ..... 21
    2.2.7 Comparisons of Predictions and Outcomes ................. 22
    2.2.8 Damages Award Predictions ................................... 23
    2.2.9 Overview of Judge, Jury and Attorney Decision Making .. 24
    2.2.10 Attorney-Litigant Decision Making in Actual Cases ...... 24
    2.2.11 Kiser, Asher and McShane Study of
           Attorney-Litigant Decision Making .......................... 27
  2.3 Chapter Capsule ...................................................... 27

3 A Current Assessment of Attorney-Litigant Decision Making
  In Adjudicated Cases .................................................. 29
  3.1 The Fifty Percent Implication ..................................... 31
3.2 New Data ............................................................. 32
  3.2.1 The Four Datasets ............................................. 32
  3.2.2 VerdictSearch Publications .................................. 33
  3.2.3 Case Database Selection Criteria ............................. 34
  3.2.4 Attorneys in Dataset ......................................... 35
3.3 Concepts and Definitions ............................................. 36
  3.3.1 Negotiation Disparities and Decision Error ............... 38
  3.3.2 Underpricing ................................................... 39
  3.3.3 Overpricing .................................................... 39
  3.3.4 Negotiation Disparities Without Decision Error .......... 40
  3.3.5 Effect of Negotiation Disparity on Decision Error ....... 41
3.4 Overall California Results ............................................ 42
  3.4.1 Costs of Decision Error ....................................... 42
  3.4.2 Negotiation Disparities ....................................... 44
3.5 New York Results .................................................... 45
3.6 40-Year Historical Study ............................................. 46
  3.6.1 Historical Decision Error .................................... 46
  3.6.2 Historical Cost of Decision Error ............................. 47
3.7 Attorney-Mediator Results ........................................... 48
  3.7.1 Attorney-Mediator Decision Error ............................ 49
  3.7.2 Attorney-Mediator Negotiation Disparities and Settlement Rates ........................................... 51
  3.7.3 Tentative Conclusions About Attorney-Mediators ........ 51
3.8 Predictor Variables ................................................... 52
  3.8.1 Context Variables Trump Actor Variables .................... 53
  3.8.2 The Five Major Context Variables ............................ 54
  3.8.3 Two Secondary Context Variables ............................ 71
  3.8.4 The Major Actor Variables .................................... 76
3.9 Chapter Capsule ...................................................... 85

Part II Causes

4 Psychological Attributes of Decision Errors ....................... 89
  4.1 Perceptions of Adversaries and Conflicts ....................... 91
    4.1.1 Fundamental Attribution Error .............................. 92
    4.1.2 Selective Perception and Memory ........................... 97
    4.1.3 Self-Serving Bias ............................................ 102
    4.1.4 Reactive Devaluation ........................................ 104
    4.1.5 A Practical Example Of Overcoming Self-Protective Biases ........................................... 107
  4.2 Evaluations of Risk and Reactions to Perceived Risk .......... 108
    4.2.1 Framing ....................................................... 111
    4.2.2 Anchoring ..................................................... 115
4.3 Reactions to Threatened Changes in Position and Status .......... 120
  4.3.1 The Endowment Effect ........................................ 120
  4.3.2 Status Quo Bias ............................................ 122
  4.3.3 Overconfidence ............................................ 124
  4.3.4 Confirmation Bias ........................................... 126
  4.3.5 Representative and Availability Heuristics .................... 129
  4.3.6 Hindsight Bias ............................................. 132
  4.3.7 Discounting Of Future Payments and Costs .................... 133
  4.3.8 Sunk Cost Bias ............................................. 136
4.4 Chapter Capsule ................................................. 139

5 Institutional Impediments to Effective Legal Decision Making .... 141
  5.1 Law School Education ........................................... 143
    5.1.1 Separation of Legal Education from Legal Practice .......... 144
    5.1.2 Testing Law Students’ Reasoning Skills
        and Moral Judgment ........................................... 145
    5.1.3 An Example of Law Student Decision Making ................. 148
    5.1.4 Deficiencies in the Case Method of Teaching ............... 150
    5.1.5 Attempts to Change Law School Curriculum .................. 156
  5.2 Law Firms ...................................................... 164
    5.2.1 Conflicts Between Efficient Problem Solving
        and Billable Hour Requirements ............................... 166
    5.2.2 The Consequences of Avoiding “The Big Picture” ........... 169
    5.2.3 “Due Process” and the Elevation of Process
        Above Results ................................................ 172
    5.2.4 Competitive Market Pressures, Undue Deference
        to Client Expectations and Inappropriate Client
        Involvement ..................................................... 174
  5.3 Mental Impairment .............................................. 182
  5.4 The Disappearing Civil Trial .................................... 188
    5.4.1 Settling Without Benchmarks ................................ 189
    5.4.2 Causes and Motivations for Pre-Trial Settlements .......... 192
5.5 Chapter Capsule ................................................. 195

Part III Consequences

6 Legal Malpractice Liability For Settlement Counseling
    and Decision Errors .............................................. 199
  6.1 Malpractice Claims Data ....................................... 200
  6.2 Competing Policy Considerations ............................... 202
  6.3 Malpractice Claims Arising from Settled Cases ................. 204
    6.3.1 Inadequate Advice Regarding Settlement and
        Trial Prospects ............................................... 206
    6.3.2 Client Coerced into Settlement by Attorney ............... 209
6.3.3 Attorney’s Mistakes Prevented Client from Obtaining a Better Settlement or Prosecuting Case to Trial ................................................. 211

6.3.4 Attorney’s Delays Caused Client to Forego More Favorable Settlement Terms .......................... 214

6.3.5 Conflict of Interest, Fraud and Collusion with an Adverse Party ................................................ 215

6.3.6 Attorney Did Not Transmit Settlement Proposals to Client ...................................................... 218

6.3.7 Failure to Conduct Adequate Legal Research, Discovery and Investigation Before Settlement ............ 219

6.3.8 Attorney Not Authorized to Consent to Settlement Agreement .................................................. 223

6.3.9 Settlement Agreement Defectively Drafted ................. 225

6.3.10 Client Misunderstood the Settlement Agreement .......... 226

6.3.11 Failure to Advise of Uncertainty of Law and Anticipate Judicial Error .................................... 227

6.4 Malpractice Claims in Adjudicated Cases ......................... 231

6.4.1 Attorney Remiss In Failing To Initiate Settlement Negotiations, Solicit A Pre-Trial Settlement Offer Or Otherwise Effectuate Settlement ........................ 232

6.4.2 Client Inadequately Apprised of Risk of an Adverse Verdict .............................................. 235

6.5 Defenses to Settlement Malpractice Claims .................... 237

6.5.1 The Client’s Consent Bars a Challenge to the Adequacy of the Settlement Agreement .......................... 238

6.5.2 The Client’s Ratification of the Settlement Agreement ......................................................... 240

6.5.3 The Client’s Failure to Prove Reliance on the Attorney’s Advice .............................................. 240

6.5.4 The Judgmental Immunity Rule and the California Model Limitations ............................................... 241

6.5.5 The Client Cannot Prove Damages Proximately Caused by the Attorney’s Negligence ..................... 243

6.5.6 Another Attorney’s Negligence as an Intervening or Superseding Cause ........................................ 245

6.5.7 Reduction of Malpractice Awards by the Amount of Attorneys Fees the Client Otherwise Would Have Paid the Attorney ........................................ 246

6.6 Chapter Capsule ..................................................... 247

7 Ethical Implications of Attorney-Client Counseling and Decision Making ........................................ 249

7.1 A Profile of Disciplinary Actions ........................................... 250
7.2 The Duty to Communicate all Material Facts and Events to Clients ............................................................ 252
7.3 The Duty to Exercise Independent Judgment and Render Candid Advice ...................................................... 257
7.4 The Duty to Provide Adequate Advice to Enable Clients to Make Informed Decisions ....................................... 260
7.5 The Duty to Identify and Protect Clients with Diminished Capacity ............................................................. 262
7.6 The Duty to Competently, Independently, Diligently and Expeditiously Represent Clients ............................... 266
7.7 The Duty to Abide by Client Decisions ............................ 270
7.8 The Duty to Prevent Conflicts of Interest in Aggregate Settlements .............................................................. 272
7.9 The Duty to be Candid and Truthful in Communications with Clients, Opposing Counsel and the Courts ........... 274
7.10 Chapter Capsule ................................................... 279

Part IV Solutions

8 Obstacles to Becoming an Expert Decision Maker .................. 283
8.1 Defenses and Barriers to Sound Decision Making ................. 284
  8.1.1 Defenses to Learning ........................................ 285
  8.1.2 Distortions of Reality ........................................ 288
  8.1.3 Attorney Belief System Defenses ........................... 293
8.2 Myths and Misconceptions About Decision Making Expertise .... 295
  8.2.1 Intelligence .................................................. 296
  8.2.2 Education and Experience ................................... 298
  8.2.3 Peer Ranking ................................................ 302
  8.2.4 Intuition ...................................................... 303
8.3 Chapter Capsule .................................................... 307

9 Personal Expertise in Legal Decision Making ......................... 309
9.1 Phase One: Finding ................................................. 310
  9.1.1 Still The Messenger ......................................... 311
  9.1.2 Bottom-Up Decisions Beat Top-Down Decisions ....... 311
  9.1.3 Challenge Your Perceptions ................................. 313
  9.1.4 Give Vivid Pictures Time to Fade ......................... 314
  9.1.5 Credit Randomness its Due .................................. 315
  9.1.6 Deal with Attribution Errors Early ....................... 316
  9.1.7 Diversify the Team ......................................... 317
  9.1.8 Time Does not Take Sides .................................. 318
  9.1.9 Align Client Objectives and Attorney Incentives ........ 319
  9.1.10 Consider Appointing Separate Settlement Counsel ...... 321
10 Group Expertise In Legal Decision Making .......................... 367
 10.1 Deficiencies in Group Decision Making ......................... 368
    10.1.1 Elements of Defective Group Decisions ................... 370
    10.1.2 Group Polarization and Groupthink ........................ 371
 10.2 Characteristics of Effective Decision-Making Groups ........... 376
    10.2.1 High Reliability Organizations (HROS) .................... 377
    10.2.2 Expert Teams .............................................. 383
 10.3 Steps to Improve Group Decision Making ........................ 385
    10.3.1 Ask For Multiple Opinions ................................ 385
    10.3.2 Cross-Pollinate the Team .................................. 386
    10.3.3 Proliferate Team Leaders .................................. 387
    10.3.4 Appoint a Devil’s Advocate ............................... 389
    10.3.5 Seed the Brainstorm .......................................... 389
    10.3.6 Promote a Good Fight ..................................... 391
    10.3.7 Build Trust ................................................. 392
    10.3.8 Reach a Consensus, Don’t Build One ....................... 394
    10.3.9 Schedule a Last Clear Chance Meeting ..................... 395
 10.4 Chapter Capsule ................................................... 396

11 Peer Review, Client Evaluations and Law Firm Audits .............. 397
 11.1 A Brief History of Quality Management in Law Firms ............ 399
 11.2 Peer Review in the Medical Field ................................. 400
    11.2.1 The Inception of Medical Peer Review .................... 401
    11.2.2 The Modern Medical Peer Review System ................... 402
    11.2.3 Confidentiality of Medical Peer Review ................... 403
 11.3 Peer Review in Law Firms ....................................... 404
    11.3.1 Priorities in Law Firm Peer Review ........................ 404
    11.3.2 Confidentiality of Attorney Peer Review Proceedings .... 405
    11.3.3 Professional Ethics and Attorney-Client Privilege ........ 407
    11.3.4 The Role of Confidentiality in Peer Review .............. 410
    11.3.5 The Structure of Law Firm Peer Review ................... 412
 11.4 Client Evaluations ................................................. 413
    11.4.1 Challenges of Evaluation Design and Analysis ............. 414
    11.4.2 Sample Questions to Probe for Decision-Making Skills .... 418
 11.5 Assessments and Audits .......................................... 419
 11.6 Chapter Capsule ................................................... 422

12 Conclusion ............................................................... 425

Appendix ......................................................................... 431

Index .............................................................................. 437
Beyond Right and Wrong
The Power of Effective Decision Making for Attorneys and Clients
Kiser, R.
2010, XIII, 444 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-03813-6