# Contents

## 1 Introduction

1.1 Negotiation .......................................................... 1

1.2 An Automated Negotiator ........................................... 2

1.2.1 Generic Negotiation Strategies ................................. 3

1.3 Bidding, Learning, and Accepting ................................. 4

1.4 Research Questions .................................................... 5

1.4.1 Designing a Component-Based Automated
      Negotiation Framework ......................................... 6

1.4.2 Analyzing the Negotiating Strategy Components .............. 6

1.5 Thesis Scope ........................................................... 7

1.6 Dissertation Outline .................................................. 8

1.6.1 The Fundamentals .................................................... 9

1.6.2 The BOA Architecture ............................................. 9

1.6.3 Analyzing the Components of an Automated
      Negotiator ............................................................. 10

1.6.4 Putting the Pieces Together ...................................... 10

1.7 Contributions .......................................................... 11

References ............................................................... 12

## 2 Background

2.1 Introduction ............................................................ 15

2.2 Terminology ............................................................ 16

2.2.1 Negotiation Domain ............................................... 16

2.2.2 Negotiation Protocol .............................................. 17

2.2.3 Preference Profiles ............................................... 18

2.2.4 Outcome Spaces ................................................... 21

2.3 Negotiating Strategies ................................................ 23

2.3.1 Architecture of Negotiation Strategies ......................... 24

2.3.2 Negotiation Strategy Space Exploration ....................... 25

2.3.3 Bidding Strategies ................................................... 27
2.3.4 Acceptance Strategies .................................. 29
2.3.5 Opponent Models ....................................... 31
2.4 Evaluation Methodologies ................................. 33
2.4.1 Environments for Evaluating Negotiating Agents ... 33
2.4.2 Negotiating Agent Competitions ..................... 36
2.4.3 Evaluating Performance of Negotiation Strategies ... 37
2.4.4 Evaluating Learning Methods ......................... 39
References ......................................................... 43

3 A Component-Based Architecture to Explore the Space
of Negotiation Strategies ...................................... 53
3.1 Introduction .................................................. 53
3.2 The BOA Agent Architecture .............................. 55
3.2.1 The BOA Agent .......................................... 55
3.2.2 Employing the BOA Architecture ..................... 57
3.3 Decoupling Existing Agents ............................... 60
3.3.1 Identifying the Components ......................... 60
3.3.2 Testing Equivalence of BOA Agents ................. 63
3.4 Conclusion ................................................... 67
References ......................................................... 67

4 Effective Acceptance Conditions .............................. 71
4.1 Introduction .................................................. 71
4.2 Acceptance Conditions in Negotiation .................. 73
4.2.1 A Formal Model of Accepting ....................... 73
4.2.2 Acceptance Conditions ............................... 74
4.2.3 Existing Acceptance Conditions ..................... 75
4.3 Combined Acceptance Conditions ....................... 76
4.4 Experiments .................................................. 78
4.4.1 Detailed Experimental Setup ......................... 78
4.4.2 Hypotheses and Experimental Results ............... 80
4.5 Conclusion ................................................... 87
References ......................................................... 88

5 Accepting Optimally with Incomplete Information ......... 91
5.1 Introduction .................................................. 91
5.2 Decision Making in Negotiation Under Uncertainty ...... 92
5.2.1 Stochastic Behavior in Negotiation ................. 93
5.2.2 Optimal Stopping in Negotiation ................... 93
5.3 Accepting Random Offers ................................ 96
5.3.1 Uniformly Random Behavior ......................... 96
5.3.2 Non-Uniform Random Behavior ...................... 98
5.3.3 Experiments ............................................. 99
5.3.4 When Optimal Stopping Is Most Effective ........... 101
6 Measuring the Performance of Online Opponent Models

6.1 Introduction 
6.2 Evaluating Opponent Models
   6.2.1 Influence of the Agent’s Strategy 
   6.2.2 Influence of the Opponent’s Strategy 
   6.2.3 Influence of the Negotiation Scenario 
6.3 Measuring the Performance of Opponent Models
   6.3.1 Negotiation Strategies of the Agents 
   6.3.2 Negotiation Strategies of the Opponents 
   6.3.3 Negotiation Scenarios 
   6.3.4 Quality Measures for Opponent Models 
6.4 Experiments
   6.4.1 Experimental Setup 
   6.4.2 Opponent Models 
6.5 Results
   6.5.1 Overall Performance of Opponent Models 
   6.5.2 Influence of the Negotiation Setting 
   6.5.3 Influence of the Agent’s Strategy 
   6.5.4 Influence of the Opponent’s Strategy 
   6.5.5 Influence of the Negotiation Scenario 
6.6 Conclusion

References
## 8 A Quantitative Concession-Based Classification Method of Bidding Strategies

8.1 Introduction

8.2 Concession Making in Negotiation

8.3 Concession Rate

8.3.1 An Example

8.3.2 Formal Definition

8.3.3 Classifying the Agents According to Their Concession Rates

8.4 Experiments

8.4.1 Experimental Setup

8.4.2 Experimental Results for ANAC 2010

8.4.3 Experimental Results for ANAC 2011

8.5 Conclusion and Discussion

## 9 Optimal Non-adaptive Concession Strategies

9.1 Introduction

9.2 An Example

9.3 Making Non-adaptive Concessions

9.4 Conceding and Accepting

9.5 Making Optimal Offers

9.6 Experiments

9.7 Conclusion

## 10 Putting the Pieces Together

10.1 Introduction

10.2 Measuring the Contribution of Strategy Components

10.3 Experiments

10.4 Component Contribution

10.4.1 The Influence of the Opponent

10.4.2 Interaction Effects

10.4.3 Combining the Best Components

10.5 Conclusion

## 11 Conclusion

11.1 Contributions

11.2 Answers to Our Research Questions

11.3 Outlook and Challenges

11.3.1 The BOA Architecture

11.3.2 Bidding
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.3.3 Opponent Modeling</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.4 Accepting</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.5 The Automated Negotiating Agents Competition</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.6 Robustness of Negotiation Strategies</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.7 Negotiation Setting</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3.8 Application to Human Negotiations</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix A: GENIUS: An Environment to Support the Design of Generic Automated Negotiators 215

Appendix B: The Automated Negotiating Agents Competition (ANAC) 223

Appendix C: ANAC 2010 241

Appendix D: ANAC 2011 249

Appendix E: ANAC 2012 259

Appendix F: ANAC 2013 265

Summary 271
Exploring the Strategy Space of Negotiating Agents
A Framework for Bidding, Learning and Accepting in
Automated Negotiation
Baarslag, T.
2016, XXI, 276 p. 58 illus., 21 illus. in color., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-319-28242-8