# Content

## Part I  Adaptive Logics as a Framework for Defeasible Logics

1. **Introduction** ........................................ 3  
   1.1  Defeasible Reasoning ............................... 3  
   1.2  Towards the Formalization of Defeasible Reasoning .... 6  
   References ............................................ 9  

2. **The Standard Format for Adaptive Logics** ................. 11  
   2.1  The Standard Format ............................... 11  
   2.2  The Lower Limit Logic ............................. 12  
   2.3  The Abnormalities ................................. 13  
   2.4  The Adaptive Strategy ............................. 14  
   2.4.1  The Reliability Strategy ....................... 15  
   2.4.2  The Minimal Abnormality Strategy ............... 23  
   2.4.3  A Special Case: The Simple Strategy .......... 29  
   2.5  Modeling Defeasibility in Adaptive Proofs .......... 30  
   2.5.1  Internal and External Dynamics ................. 30  
   2.5.2  Comparing the Strategies ....................... 33  
   2.5.3  Adaptive Logics and Plausible Reasoning ........ 35  
   2.6  Some Properties of ALs in Standard Format .......... 42  
   2.6.1  Properties of the Adaptive Consequence Relations 42  
   2.6.2  Some Remarks on Computational Complexity ........ 46  
   2.6.3  Excursus on the Rational Properties ............ 46  
   2.7  The Necessity of Superimposing Classical Connectives . 50  
   2.8  Normal Selections: A ‘Credulous’ Strategy that is not  
   in the Standard Format ................................ 53  
   References ............................................ 57  

3. **Sequential Combinations of ALs** .......................... 59  
   3.1  The Consequence Relation of CAL ................... 60  
   3.2  Semantics for Sequential ALs ...................... 65
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Soundness and Completeness for Reliability</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Soundness and Completeness for Some Other Special Cases</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>A Proof Theory for CAL</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>The Proof Format</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>Preparing for the Marking Definitions</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>The $i$-Marking for the Reliability Strategy</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4</td>
<td>The $i$-Marking for the Minimal Abnormality Strategy</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.5</td>
<td>An Alternative to the inh-marking for Some Special Cases</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Normal Selections</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>On the Transparency of Defeasible Logics: Equivalent Premise Sets,</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Equivalence of Their Extensions, and Maximality of the Lower Limit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Formats for Logics for Defeasible Reasoning</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Equivalent Premise Sets</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Equivalent Premise Sets and ALs</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Characterizations Under a Translation</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Extensions of Equivalent Premise Sets</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>In Conclusion</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Generalizing the Standard Format</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Some Examples</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1</td>
<td>The Standard Format: Minimal Abnormality</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2</td>
<td>Lexicographic ALs</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3</td>
<td>Counting Abnormalities</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4</td>
<td>A Most Skeptical Rationale: Reliability</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.5</td>
<td>Colexicographic ALs</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.6</td>
<td>The Problem of Non-Smoothness</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.7</td>
<td>More Refined Quantitative Examples</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.8</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>The Generic Adaptive Logic $\text{AL}_A$</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1</td>
<td>The Semantics</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2</td>
<td>The Dynamic Proof Theory</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Repäsentational Results for $\text{AL}_A$</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1</td>
<td>A Representational Theorem for $\vdash_{\text{AL}_A}$</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2</td>
<td>The Complete Stage of an Adaptive Proof</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4.3 A Representational Theorem For $\vdash_{\text{AL}_A}$ and Related Results ............................................. 132
5.4.4 Soundness and Completeness .......................... 134
5.5 Other Meta-Theoretic Properties of $\text{AL}_A$ ....................... 135
  5.5.1 Cumulativity and Equivalent Premise Sets .......... 135
  5.5.2 Some Classes of Cumulative $\Lambda$-Based ALs ... 138
  5.5.3 Reassurance ........................................... 139
  5.5.4 The Upper Limit Logic and the Maximality of the Lower Limit Logic ......................... 140
  5.5.5 Further Properties ..................................... 141
5.6 Simplifying the Proof-Theory for a Subclass of $\Lambda$-Based ALs .............................................. 142
5.7 Normal Selections: The Logic $\text{AL}_A^n$ ...................... 143
5.8 Wrapping Things Up: Some Concrete Classes of $\Lambda$-Based ALs .............................................. 145
  5.8.1 The Threshold Functions $\min_{\lambda, <}, \Psi_{<\lambda},$ and $\Psi[^{[\lambda, \ldots, \lambda]}_{<\lambda}]$ ............. 145
  5.8.2 The Standard Format ................................... 146
  5.8.3 (Co)-Lexicographic ALs ................................. 147
  5.8.4 More on Quantitative Variants ......................... 148
5.9 Conclusion .................................................. 150
References ......................................................... 152

Part II Default Reasoning

6 Adaptively Applying Modus Ponens in Conditional Logics of Normality ............................................... 157
  6.1 Introduction ............................................... 157
  6.1.1 Some Background .................................... 157
  6.1.2 Contribution and Structure of this Chapter ....... 159
  6.2 Conditional Logics, Their Core Properties and Related Work ............................................. 160
  6.3 Modus Ponens in Conditional Logics of Normality ...... 163
  6.4 Applying Modus Ponens Conditionally ............... 166
  6.5 Discussion ............................................... 172
    6.5.1 Some Advantages of the Adaptive Approach ... 172
    6.5.2 The Drowning Problem ............................... 174
    6.5.3 Taking Into Account Negative Knowledge ....... 175
  6.6 Conclusion and Outlook .................................. 176
References ......................................................... 176
Part III  Argumentation Theory

8  Towards the Proof-Theoretic Unification of Dung’s Argumentation Framework: An Adaptive Logic Approach  
8.1  Introduction  
8.2  Dung’s Argumentation Framework: Key Terms  
8.3  A Logic for Abstract Argumentation  
8.3.1  Language and Rules  
8.3.2  Representing AFs as Premise Sets  
8.3.3  Representational Requirements  
8.3.4  Interpreting a Premise Set as Normally as Possible  
8.3.5  The Problem of an Interpretative Surplus  
8.3.6  A Better Solution: Going Adaptive and Enabling External Dynamics  
8.3.7  External Dynamics: Letting New Information In  
8.3.8  The Minimal Abnormality Strategy and Final Derivability  
8.4  The AL Framework for Skeptical Acceptance  
8.5  Adaptive Logics for Credulous Acceptance  
8.6  Discussion  
8.7  Conclusion  
References  

9  Allowing for Joint Attacks  
9.1  Motivation  
9.2  Complex Argumentation Frameworks  
9.3  Extension Types  
9.4  Allowing for Joint Attacks in the Lower Limit Logics  
References
9.5 Representing Complex Argumentation Frameworks as Premise Sets 249
9.6 Going Adaptive 250
9.7 Conclusion 253
References 253

Part IV Deontic Logics

10 Avoiding Deontic Explosion by Contextually Restricting Modal Inheritance 257
10.1 Introduction 257
10.2 Dealing with Deontic Conflicts by Restricting Inheritance 259
10.3 The Semantics of DPM 262
10.4 Some Shortcomings of DPM 263
10.5 Adaptive Logics 265
10.6 The Adaptive Logic ADPM.1 267
10.7 The Adaptive Logic ADPM.2 271
10.8 Some Meta-Theoretical Properties 273
10.9 Shortcomings and Related Work 274
10.10 Conclusion 276
10.11 Outlook 277
10.11.1 Obligation-Permission Conflicts: Towards More Conflict-Tolerant Deontic Logics 277
10.11.2 Going Conditional 278
References 279

11 An Adaptive Logic Framework for Conditional Obligations and Deontic Dilemmas 281
11.1 Introduction 281
11.2 The Problem With Strengthening the Antecedent 283
11.3 Lou Goble’s CDPM 284
11.4 A Critical Analysis 286
11.4.1 CDPM.1c Validates (P RAT mono) 286
11.4.2 Explosive Behavior and Other Problems With (WRM) 286
11.4.3 Solving the Problems by Further Restricting (WRM) 287
11.4.4 A Problem with Aggregation and (S) 288
11.5 Going Adaptive: The Conditional Case 289
11.5.1 Applying Inheritance Conditionally 290
11.5.2 Applying Weak Rationality Conditionally 291
References
Adaptive Logics for Defeasible Reasoning
Applications in Argumentation, Normative Reasoning
and Default Reasoning
Straßer, C.
2014, XVIII, 438 p. 34 illus., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-319-00791-5