Contents

1 Introduction to Immigration Economics ................................. 1
  1.1 The Late Twentieth-Century Immigration Explosion .......... 2
    1.1.1 The Complexity of Immigration ................ 3
    1.1.2 Not Everyone Likes Immigrants ................. 4
    1.1.3 Economists’ Perspective .................... 4
  1.2 The Determinants of Immigration ................................. 5
    1.2.1 Many Factors Discourage Immigration .......... 6
    1.2.2 Considering the Full Set of Push, Pull, Stay,
         and Stay Away Factors ........................ 8
    1.2.3 Shifts in Economic Forces Influence
         Immigration .................................. 9
    1.2.4 Immigration Is a Complex Phenomenon ........ 9
  1.3 A Brief History of Immigration .................................. 10
    1.3.1 Early Migrations ................................ 10
    1.3.2 Recent Immigration ............................ 12
  1.4 There Are Many Types of Immigrants ............................. 14
    1.4.1 Not All Immigrants Are Permanent Settlers .......... 14
    1.4.2 Forced Immigration ............................. 15
    1.4.3 Some Immigrants Are Difficult to Classify ........ 16
  1.5 The Purpose and Organization of this Book .................. 16
References .............................................................................. 18

Part I Immigration Theory and Evidence

2 The Determinants of International Migration: Theory .............. 27
  Chapter Overview .................................................. 27
  2.1 Early Migration Theory ..................................... 29
    2.1.1 Pre-1960 Theory .................................. 29
    2.1.2 Ravenstein and Zipf ............................... 30
    2.1.3 The Standard Modern Theory of Migration ........ 31
    2.1.4 Further Influences on Migration ................ 37
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The Modern Model of Immigration</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1</td>
<td>The First Borjas Model</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2</td>
<td>Borjas’ 1991 Model</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3</td>
<td>Recent Extensions of the Borjas Model</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>The Family or Household as the Decision-Making Unit</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1</td>
<td>Conflicting Interests and the Family Migration Decision</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2</td>
<td>Mincer’s Model</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3</td>
<td>Family Migration as a Portfolio Decision</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Summary and Conclusions</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Why People Immigrate: The Evidence</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Overview</td>
<td></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Regression Models of Immigration</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1</td>
<td>Empirical Models of Regional Migration</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2</td>
<td>The Gravity Model of International Migration</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3</td>
<td>Some Econometric Problems Related to the Gravity Model</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The Choice of Variables in Statistical Models of Immigration</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Three Examples</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Representing Income Differences</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3</td>
<td>Representing Migration Costs</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4</td>
<td>Representing Source Country Development</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5</td>
<td>Representing Immigration Restrictions</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.6</td>
<td>The Empirical Evidence on the Determinants of Migration</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.7</td>
<td>Evidence on Worldwide Migration</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.8</td>
<td>Evidence on Migration to Groups of OECD Countries</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.9</td>
<td>Evidence on US Immigration</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.10</td>
<td>Immigration to Other Countries</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.11</td>
<td>Summarizing the Results</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Summary and Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>The Power of Statistical Models</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>The Way Forward</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td></td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Who Immigrates? Theory and Evidence</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Overview</td>
<td></td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Immigrant Selection: The Chiswick vs. Borjas Debate</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1</td>
<td>Some Unfortunate Terminology</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2</td>
<td>The Chiswick View</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3</td>
<td>The Borjas Model</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.4</td>
<td>A More Detailed Look at the Borjas Model</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.5</td>
<td>Selection by Observed Characteristics</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2 Extensions of the Borjas Model .................................. 88
  4.2.1 Variable Migration Costs and Migrant Selection .......... 88
  4.2.2 Credit Constraints and Immigrant Selection ........... 90
  4.2.3 Family Migration and Selection Bias ................... 91

4.3 The Empirical Evidence on Immigrant Selectivity .............. 93
  4.3.1 Borjas’ Empirical Results .............................. 93
  4.3.2 Further Tests of Borjas’ Model ........................ 94
  4.3.3 Tests Based on Counterfactual Density Functions ....... 95

4.4 The Asymmetric Information Model ............................. 96
  4.4.1 Kwok and Leland’s Model ............................... 97
  4.4.2 Restoring Symmetric Information ....................... 98

4.5 The Theory of Immigrant Assimilation ........................ 99
  4.5.1 The Chiswick Study of Assimilation ................... 99
  4.5.2 Potential Bias in Chiswick’s Results .................. 100
  4.5.3 Borjas’ Empirical Results ............................. 102

4.6 Addressing Borjas’ Critique .................................. 103

4.7 Conclusions .................................................. 104

References ....................................................... 105

5 The Effects of Immigration on the Destination
Economy: The Theory ............................................. 109

Chapter Overview ............................................... 109

5.1 The Macro Effects of Immigration .............................. 110
  5.1.1 Homogeneous Labor with Fixed Capital ................. 110
  5.1.2 Homogeneous Labor with Variable Capital ............ 114
  5.1.3 Heterogeneous Labor ..................................... 116
  5.1.4 Heterogeneous Labor with Constant Capital .......... 117
  5.1.5 Heterogeneous Labor and Perfectly Elastic Capital Supply ........................................ 117
  5.1.6 How Big Is the US Immigrant Surplus? ................. 117

5.2 Detailing the Distributional Effects of Immigration .......... 118
  5.2.1 The Johnson Model (1980) .............................. 118
  5.2.2 The Altonji and Card Model (1991) ..................... 119
  5.2.3 The Ottaviano and Peri Model .......................... 120

5.3 Long-Run Adjustment Processes ................................ 122
  5.3.1 Internal Migration Responses ........................... 122
  5.3.2 Multiple Goods .......................................... 123
  5.3.3 Choice of Technology .................................... 124
  5.3.4 The Demand Effect of Immigration ...................... 124

5.4 The Demand Effect of Immigration ............................ 125
  5.4.1 Say’s Law of Immigration ................................ 125
  5.4.2 Regional Migration and Local Demand .................. 126
  5.4.3 A Few Models of Immigrant Demand Effects .......... 127
  5.4.4 Bodvarsson and Van den Berg’s Lexington Model .... 128
## Contents

5.4.5 The More General Case ........................................... 129  
5.4.6 Further Models of Immigrant Demand Effects ................. 130  
5.5 Concluding Remarks ................................................ 131  
References ................................................................. 133  

### 6 How Immigration Impacts the Destination Economy:  
**The Evidence** .......................................................... 135  
6.1 Introduction ............................................................ 135  
6.2 The Spatial Correlation Method .................................... 136  
6.2.1 Cross Section Applications ....................................... 137  
6.2.2 Dealing with Simultaneity and Spurious Correlation ............ 138  
6.2.3 Recent Applications of the Spatial Correlation Method ...... 141  
6.2.4 Applications of the Unexpected Exogenous Supply Shock Method ................................................................. 144  
6.2.5 The Mariel Boatlift .................................................. 145  
6.2.6 Russian Immigrants in Israel ...................................... 146  
6.2.7 Assessing the Spatial Correlation Method ..................... 148  
6.3 The Production Function Method .................................... 148  
6.3.1 Grossman’s Pioneering Production Study ....................... 149  
6.3.2 Gang and Rivera-Batiz ............................................. 150  
6.3.3 Assessing the Production Function Method ................... 151  
6.4 The Skill Cell Approach .............................................. 152  
6.4.1 Borjas’ Use of National Data Versus Regional Data ........... 152  
6.4.2 Ottaviano and Peri’s Extension of Borjas’ Skill Cell Model ... 154  
6.4.3 Other Types of Labor Market Cells .............................. 156  
6.5 Concluding Remarks .................................................. 157  
References ................................................................. 158  

### 7 Estimating Immigration’s Impact: Accounting for All Adjustments  
7.1 Introduction ............................................................. 161  
7.2 Does Immigration Trigger Internal Migration? .................... 162  
7.2.1 Evidence That Immigrants Induce Native Out-Migration ....... 162  
7.2.2 Evidence That Immigration Has Little Effect on Native Out-Migration ................................................................. 165  
7.3 Migration Biases Estimates of Immigration’s Wage Effect ....... 166  
7.4 Does Immigration Change Industry Structure? .................... 168  
7.5 Measuring the Demand Effects of Immigration .................... 169  
7.5.1 Hercowitz and Yashiv’s Estimates ............................... 169  
7.5.2 Bodvarsson and Van den Berg’s Lexington, Nebraska, Study ................................................................. 171
7.5.3 Estimating the Demand Effect of the Mariel Boatlift ........................................ 172
7.5.4 Additional Estimates of the Demand Effects of Immigration ................................. 174
7.6 The Costs of Government Services for Immigrants ........................................ 176
7.6.1 Recent Studies for the USA ....................................................... 177
7.6.2 Are US Immigrants More Costly Today than in the Past? ....................................... 178
7.6.3 Estimates of Fiscal Costs for Other Countries ............................................... 178
7.7 Immigration’s External Effects ................................................................. 180
7.7.1 Economies of Scale ........................................................................... 180
7.7.2 Are There Negative Externalities Associated with Immigration? .............................. 182
7.8 Concluding Remarks .................................................................................... 183
References ........................................................................................................... 184

8 Immigration and the Source Country ................................................................. 187
8.1 Remittances and Demand Effects in the Source Country ................................. 188
8.1.1 Supply and Demand Effects ............................................................. 188
8.1.2 Immigrants and Remittances ............................................................ 190
8.1.3 A Two-Country View of Remittances ................................................... 191
8.2 What We Know About Immigrant Remittances ........................................... 192
8.2.1 The Growth of Immigrant Remittances ............................................... 192
8.2.2 Remittances as a Percentage of Source Country GDP ................................. 193
8.2.3 The Reliability of Remittance Data ..................................................... 194
8.2.4 The Recent Data on the Growth of Immigrant Remittances ......................... 195
8.2.5 Policies to Encourage Remittances ..................................................... 196
8.2.6 How Remittances Are Used in the Source Countries ................................. 197
8.2.7 Remittances: Tentative Conclusions ..................................................... 199
8.3 The Brain Drain ............................................................................................. 199
8.3.1 Human Capital of Immigrants ............................................................ 200
8.3.2 The Brain Drain as a Development Issue ............................................... 200
8.3.3 How Big Is the Brain Drain? ................................................................ 201
8.3.4 Why Human Capital Flees Capital-Scarce Countries ................................. 205
8.3.5 Brain Drain and Brain Waste ............................................................... 206
8.4 A Reassessment of the Brain Drain ............................................................... 207
8.4.1 Remittances Again .............................................................................. 207
8.4.2 The Brain Drain as an Incentive to Seek Education ..................................... 208
10.1.5 Technological Change Is a Combinatorial Process .................................. 256
10.1.6 Technology Is a Nonrival Good .................................................. 257
10.1.7 Paradigm Shifts ........................................................................ 258

10.2 Immigration and the Agglomeration of Economic Activity ................................ 259
10.2.1 The Causes of Agglomeration .................................................... 260
10.2.2 The Agglomeration of Innovative Activity ..................................... 261
10.2.3 The Changing Patterns of Economic Activity ................................... 262

10.3 Immigration and the Social and Natural Environments .................................... 264
10.3.1 Nature as a Source of Diminishing Returns ................................... 265
10.3.2 The Natural Environment ........................................................... 266
10.3.3 An Ecological Solow Model ....................................................... 267
10.3.4 Adding a Third Sector: Human Society ......................................... 271
10.3.5 Bourdieu’s Forms of Capital ....................................................... 273
10.3.6 Modeling the Social Sector ......................................................... 274

10.4 Institutions and Social Capital .................................................................. 276
10.4.1 The Study of Institutions .............................................................. 276
10.4.2 Conflicts Between Formal and Informal Institutions ......................... 277

10.5 Chapter Conclusions and Some Further Thoughts on the Solow Model .............. 278

References ................................................................................................. 280

Part II Immigration Issues and Cases

11 Temporary Immigration, Involuntary Immigration, and Other Variations on the Standard Model .......................................................... 287

Chapter Overview ..................................................................................... 287

11.1 Return Immigration .............................................................................. 288
11.1.1 Return Immigration as a Response to Changing Circumstances .................... 289
11.1.2 Correcting Mistakes in Judgement .................................................. 290
11.1.3 Source Country Policies to Encourage Immigrants to Return .................... 290

11.2 Temporary Immigration ...................................................................... 291
11.2.1 The Multinational Corporation and Temporary Immigration ..................... 291
11.2.2 Temporary Immigration as a Destination Country Policy ............................. 292
11.2.3 The Diversity of Temporary Immigration .......................................... 293

11.3 Analyzing Temporary Migration .......................................................... 294
11.3.1 A Simple Model: Culture Clash Versus Higher Income ............................. 294
11.3.2 Other Determinants of Temporary Immigration ..................................... 296
11.3.3 The Role of International Trade
11.3.4 Further Issues Related to Temporary Immigration
11.3.5 Temporary Immigration as a Form of Labor Market Discrimination
11.3.6 Growth Implications of Temporary Immigration
11.3.7 Temporary Immigration and the Ageing Problem
11.4 Asylum Seekers and Refugees
11.4.1 Refugees
11.4.2 The UNHCR
11.4.3 Asylum Seekers
11.5 Involuntary Immigration
11.5.1 A Model of International Slavery
11.5.2 Other Oppressive Forms of Immigration
11.6 Summary and Conclusions

12 Unauthorized Immigration
12.1 Introduction
12.2 Estimating Unauthorized Immigration
12.2.1 The Residual Method
12.2.2 Other Methods for Estimating Unauthorized Immigration
12.3 What Do the Estimates Tell Us?
12.4 Some Characteristics of Unauthorized Immigrants
12.5 The Economic Analysis of Unauthorized Immigration
12.5.1 The Supply and Demand for Unauthorized Workers
12.5.2 Unauthorized Immigration as a Form of Labor Market Discrimination
12.5.3 Oppression of Unauthorized Workers
12.5.4 Discussion of the Labor Segmentation Hypothesis
12.5.5 Temporary Work Visas: Just a Variation on Illegality?
12.5.6 Unauthorized Immigration Can Be Deadly
12.6 The Fiscal Costs and Benefits of Unauthorized Immigration
12.7 Unauthorized Immigration: Policy Options
12.7.1 Border Controls
12.7.2 Employer Sanctions
12.8 Conclusions

References
13 Hispanic Immigration to the USA ........................ 345
  13.1 A Brief Description of Recent Hispanic Immigration to the USA ........................ 347
  13.2 Assimilation ........................................ 350
    13.2.1 Hispanics’ Slow Assimilation ................... 350
    13.2.2 Further Reasons Why Hispanic Assimilation Is Slow ......................... 356
    13.2.3 Is It All Just a Data Problem? ................. 357
  13.3 Geographic Diffusion .................................. 358
    13.3.1 Networks and Herding ............................ 358
    13.3.2 Toward the South and the Midwest ............... 358
    13.3.3 The Dispersal of Manufacturing Jobs and Immigrant Dispersal ............. 359
  13.4 Explaining Hispanic Immigration ....................... 361
    13.4.1 The Welfare Effects on the Source Hispanic Countries ...................... 362
    13.4.2 The Demand Effects of Hispanic Immigration .................. 363
  13.5 Future Hispanic Immigration ........................... 363
    13.5.1 Will Hispanic Immigration Continue? .............. 364
    13.5.2 Temporary Immigration Programs .................. 365
  13.6 Conclusions ......................................... 366
References .................................................. 367

Part III Immigration Policy: Introduction

14 Immigration Policy in the USA ............................. 375
  Chapter Overview .......................................... 375
  14.1 Early Immigration Policy ............................... 378
    14.1.1 The Borders Were Not Entirely Open ................ 379
    14.1.2 Assessing the Early Policies ...................... 379
  14.2 The Latter Half of the Nineteenth Century .............. 380
    14.2.1 Religion and Immigration .......................... 380
    14.2.2 Growing Opposition to Immigration Spurs New Legislation .............. 381
    14.2.3 The Chinese Exclusion Act ......................... 381
    14.2.4 Controlling the Border ............................ 382
    14.2.5 Immigration Remained Mostly Open ............... 384
    14.2.6 Assessing the Early Policies ..................... 385
  14.3 The Shift in Policy in the Early Twentieth Century ...... 386
    14.3.1 The First General Restrictions of Immigration .......... 386
    14.3.2 The Post-World War I Shift in Policy .............. 387
    14.3.3 Immigration During the Great Depression ............ 388
    14.3.4 Immigration Policy During the War .................. 389
14.4 Post World War II Immigration Policy .................................. 390
14.4.1 Policy Immediately After the War .......................... 390
14.4.2 A New Immigration Law in 1965 ........................ 391
14.4.3 The Economic Effects of the 1965 Act .................. 392
14.4.4 The Growth of Unauthorized Immigration .............. 393
14.5 Recent USA Immigration Policy .................................. 393
14.5.1 IRCA .................................... 394
14.5.2 After IRCA ................................ 395
14.5.3 Summarizing Recent US Policy .......................... 397
14.6 Post 9/11 Immigration Policy .................................. 397
14.6.1 Reform of the Immigration Bureaucracy and Enforcement .................. 398
14.6.2 Employment-Based Permanent Residency ................ 399
14.6.3 Temporary Work Visas ................................ 400
14.6.4 Diversity Immigrant Visas ............................... 402
14.6.5 Immigration Reform Stalls in 2006 and 2007 .......... 402
14.7 Summary and Conclusions ....................................... 403

15 Immigration Policy in Canada ....................................... 407

Chapter Overview .................................................. 407
15.1 Overview of Immigration Policy in Canada .................. 408
15.1.1 Immigration and Population Growth in Canada .... 408
15.1.2 The Early Years .................................... 409
15.1.3 Late Nineteenth Century Immigration .................. 410
15.1.4 Summary of Nineteenth Century Canadian Immigration Policy .................. 412
15.2 Canadian Immigration Policy in the Twentieth Century .. 413
15.2.1 The First Half of the Twentieth Century .......... 413
15.2.2 After World War II .................................. 414
15.2.3 Comparing Immigration Legislation ................. 415
15.3 Canada’s Immigration Policy Today ......................... 416
15.3.1 The 2002 Reform .................................. 417
15.3.2 The Canadian Point System .......................... 417
15.3.3 Should Policy Discriminate in Favor of Highly Educated Immigrants? ... 418
15.3.4 The Seven Questions in the Early Twenty-First Century .................. 421
15.3.5 Immigrant Performance and Recent Shifts in Policy ................. 421
15.4 Some Final Observations ....................................... 423

References ......................................................... 424
## Contents

### 16 Immigration Policy in Europe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Overview</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1 European Migration During the Colonial Era</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1.1 Colonial Regimes and Immigration</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1.2 The Nineteenth Century</td>
<td>430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1.3 The Emigration Life Cycle</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1.4 European Emigration After World War I</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2 The Post-World War II Period</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2.1 Guest Workers</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2.2 The Post-Soviet Era</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2.3 Recent EU Immigration Policy</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3 The Interesting Case of Ireland</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.4 Recent Immigration Policy in Spain</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.5 Can Immigration Solve Europe’s Demographic Burden?</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.6 Conclusions</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 17 Conclusions and Final Observations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Overview</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.1 Immigration: A Fundamental Economic Phenomenon</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.2 We Must Think Outside Our Little Boxes</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3 An Appeal to Holism</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3.1 Defining Holism</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3.2 The Economics of Immigration Must Embrace Holism</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.3.3 The Holistic Approach to the Study of Immigration: An Example</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4 Developing International Institutions for an International Phenomenon</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.1 The Global Commission on International Migration</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.2 What Is the Optimal Flow of Immigrants?</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.4.3 Small Steps Towards Global Governance</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.5 Final Comment</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index**                                                                 | 461  |
The Economics of Immigration
Theory and Policy
Bodvarsson, Ö.B.; Van den Berg, H.
2013, XV, 474 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-1-4614-2115-3