CONTENTS

List of Illustrations ...........................................................................................................xiii
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................xv

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 The Invisible Truth of Classical Physics .................................................................1
1.2 Historiographic Orientation .....................................................................................5
   1.2.1 The Horizon of the Scientific Revolution (5); 1.2.2 Mechanics in the
   Eighteenth Century (9); 1.2.3 Three Controversies over the Concept of Force
   (15)
1.3 The Place of Philosophy in this Book ..................................................................21
   1.3.1 History of Science or Philosophy of Science? (21); 1.3.2 A Working
   Definition of Metaphysics (22); 1.3.3 Explicit and Implicit Metaphysics (26);
   1.3.4 Substance and Structure: Basic Concepts of Metaphysical Change (28)

PART A. THE UNITY OF THE CONCEPT OF FORCE

CHAPTER 2: FORCE LIKE WATER

2.1 A Brief Archeology of the Concept of Force in the Seventeenth Century .... 32
2.2 Quantity and Quality .................................................................................................35
   2.2.1 The Distinction according to Aristotle (35); 2.2.2 Scholastic
   Considerations (37); 2.2.3 Quantification of the Concept of Force (39)
2.3 The Point of Departure: Dead and Living Force .....................................................41
   2.3.1 Galileo (42); 2.3.2 Descartes (47); 2.3.3 Impact, Lifting and Weight (50)
2.4 Impetus: The Goal Attained ......................................................................................51
2.5 A Related Distinction: Inertia and Resistance .........................................................52
   2.5.1 Impetus, Living Force, and Inertia (52); 2.5.2 Galileo’s Concept of
   Inertia (54); 2.5.3 Descartes’s Concept of Inertia (56); 2.5.4 Newton’s
   Concept of Inertia (57)
2.6 The Unity of Newton’s Concept of Force .................................................................59
   2.6.1 Instantaneous and Continuous Forces (59); 2.6.2 A Practical Example
   (62); 2.6.3 Force like Water (65)
2.7 Conclusion ..................................................................................................................68
CHAPTER 3: LEIBNIZ: FORCE AS THE ESSENCE OF SUBSTANCE

3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 70
  3.1.1 Leibniz's Influence on the Eighteenth Century (70); 3.1.2 Leibniz's
  Significance for Mechanics (73); 3.1.3 The Structure of this Chapter (74);

3.2 Leibniz's Early Concept of Force ......................................................................... 75
  3.2.1 Leibniz's Criticism of Descartes (75); 3.2.2 The Measure of Force (77);
  3.2.3 Force as the Contents and Cause of Transference (80)

3.3 Leibniz's Differentiation of the Concept of Force .............................................. 81
  3.3.1 Aristotelianism and Atomism (81); 3.3.2 From Moving Force to True
  Unity (83); 3.3.3 A Further Analysis of the True Unities (87); 3.3.4 Force as
  the Essence of True Unity (89)

3.4 Leibniz's Concept of Mechanical Force .............................................................. 91
  3.4.1 Fundamental and Derivative Forces (91); 3.4.2 Active and Passive
  Forces (93); 3.4.3 Conservation of Living Force (94); 3.4.4 The Integration of
  Dead Force (95)

3.5 Conclusion: Similarities between Newton's and Leibniz's Concepts of
  Mechanical Force ....................................................................................................... 99

PART B. TOWARDS A NEW METAPHYSICS

CHAPTER 4: FROM CAUSE TO PHENOMENON

4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 104

4.2 Between Leibniz and d'Alembert: A Change in the Definition of the
  Problem ......................................................................................................................... 105
  4.2.1 Atomism and Conservation Theories (105); 4.2.2 Experimental Modes
  of Response (107); 4.2.3 The Importance of d'Alembert in the Vis Viva
  Controversy (109)

4.3 Causality in Mechanics ......................................................................................... 111
  4.3.1 d'Alembert's Purification of Metaphysics (111); 4.3.2 Final Causes
  (113); 4.3.3 Mechanical Causes (114); 4.3.4 Necessity and Contingency (117)

4.4 d'Alembert's Foundation of Mechanics .............................................................. 118
  4.4.1 d'Alembert's Method (118); 4.4.2 The Subject of Mechanics: Moving
  Matter (120); 4.4.3 The Principles of Statics and Dynamics (121); 4.4.4
  Mechanics as a Science of Structure (126)

4.5 d'Alembert's Conception of Force ..................................................................... 126
  4.5.1 Property, Function and Cause (129); 4.5.2 The Measure of Living Force
  (131); 4.5.3 d'Alembert's Transformation of the Concept of Force (132)

4.6 Conclusion: Structuralization and Instrumentalization .................................... 132
CHAPTER 5: FROM EFFICIENT TO FINAL CAUSES: THE ORIGIN OF THE PRINCIPLE OF LEAST ACTION

5.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 134
5.1.1 The Greatest Possible Scandal at Court (134); Intermezzo: The Mathematical Formulation of the Principle of Least Action (136); 5.1.2 The Significance of the Principle of Least Action for Mechanics (137)

5.2 Maupertuis’s Newtonian Background ................................................................ 140
5.2.1 From Soldier to Scholar (140); 5.2.2 Maupertuis’s Defense of Newton’s Theory of Attraction (141); 5.2.3 The Expedition to the Pole (144)

5.3 The Birth of the Principle of Least Action, in Maupertuis and Euler ................. 145
5.3.1 Minimal Principles in Statics (145); 5.3.2 The Principle of Least Action in Optics (149); 5.3.3 Extending the Principle of Least Action to Mechanics (153); 5.3.4 Euler’s Response to Maupertuis’s “Law of Rest” (155)

5.4 The First Steps of the Principle of Least Action .................................................. 159
5.4.1 Maupertuis’s “Lois du mouvement” (1746) (159); 5.4.2 Euler’s Insights (163); 5.4.3 Euler’s Foundation of the Laws of Collisions (167)

5.5 Conclusion: Teleology and Structure Metaphysics ............................................. 170

PART C. BETWEEN METAPHYSICS AND MECHANICS

CHAPTER 6: THE CONCEPT OF FORCE IN THE 1779 BERLIN ESSAY COMPETITION

6.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 174

6.2 The Berlin Academy’s Philosophical Competitions ........................................... 174
6.2.1 An Innovation for the Academic World (175); 6.2.2 The Status of the Philosophical Competition at about 1779 (177)

6.3 The Significance of the Competition on the Foundation of Force ..................... 180
6.3.1 Parisian Arrogance (180); 6.3.2 Formulation and Analysis of the Question (181); 6.3.3 Comparison with Wolff’s Concept of Force (185)

6.4 The Competition Essays ...................................................................................... 189
6.4.1 General (189); 6.4.2 Selection (189)

6.5 Overview of the Selected Essays ......................................................................... 192
6.5.1 The Prize-Winning Essay (Pap de Fagaras) (192); 6.5.2 Essay I–M726 (193); 6.5.3 Essay I–M729 (195); 6.5.4 Essay I–M731 (Rehberg) (196); 6.5.5 Essay I–M733 (198); 6.5.6 Essay I–M734 (Hißmann) (200); 6.5.7 Essay I–M736 (201)

6.6 Conclusion: Divergence of Metaphysics and Mechanics ..................................... 203

Annex to Chapter 6: The Original Formulation of the Berlin Academy’s Competition Question for 1779 ......................................................................................... 206
CHAPTER 7: LAGRANGE’S CONCEPT OF FORCE

7.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 207
7.2 Lagrange’s Mathematical Reduction of Mechanics.................................................... 208
  7.2.1 The ‘Peak of Perfection’ (208); 7.2.2 The Early Meaning of the Principle of Least Action for Lagrange (210)
7.3 Lagrange’s ‘True Metaphysics’ .................................................................................. 216
  7.3.1 A Puzzling Remark (216); 7.3.2 Lagrange’s Concept of Metaphysics (216); 7.3.3 Recognition and Rejection of Metaphysics (218)
7.4 Lagrange’s Analytic Foundation of Mechanics.......................................................... 218
  7.4.1 “Recherches sur la libration de la lune” (1764) (218); 7.4.2 The Méchanique analitique (221)
7.5 Conclusion: Force and Structure in Lagrange’s Thought ......................................... 224

CHAPTER 8: METAPHYSICS CONCEALED

8.1 Exposition: A Paradox in the History of Science ......................................................... 229
8.2 Development: The Significance of Metaphysical Premises ........................................... 230
8.3 Climax: The Concept of Mechanical Force between Substance and Structure .......... 232
8.4 Resolution: Separation and Transformation around 1780 ......................................... 235
8.5 Epilogue: History and Metaphysics in Modern Natural Science ................................. 236

Bibliography ....................................................................................................................... 241
Index .................................................................................................................................... 263
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Figure 2.1  Galileo’s analogy between the effect of an impact and that of the pressure of a weight.................................43
Figure 2.2  Galileo’s analogy of the process of impact with a mechanical tool.................................................................44
Figure 2.3  Galileo’s analogy between the dynamic problem of an impact and a static situation.................................................46
Figure 2.4  Descartes’s comparison of raising a weight with and without a pulley........................................................................48
Figure 2.5  Descartes’s distinction of action and power .........................................................49
Figure 2.6  Illustration of Newton’s proof of Kepler’s law ..................................................64
Figure 2.7  Metaphor of the action of force with water streaming out of a barrel.................................................................69
Figure 3.1  Schematic presentation of Leibniz’s structure of substances .................89
Figure 3.2  Impetus arises from infinitely many infinitely small conatuses ..........97
Figure 3.3  Parallels between Newton’s and Leibniz’s concept of force ..............101
Figure 3.4  Metaphor of the action of force with the pouring of water from one barrel into another..............................................102
Figure 4.1  The principle of composite motion.................................................................124
Figure 5.1  A particle in motion under the influence of external central forces........................................................................136
Figure 5.2  Lever subject to a central force working at an infinite distance ......148
Figure 5.3  System with one degree of freedom .................................................................149
Figure 5.4  System with two degrees of freedom .................................................................149
Figure 5.5  Euler’s analogy with a static system of springs .........................................166
Figure 7.1  Variation $\delta$ and differential $d$ of $y(x)$ ..........................................................209
Figure 7.2.  The equilibrium of forces according to the principle of virtual velocities.................................................................219
What was Mechanical about Mechanics
The Concept of Force between Metaphysics and Mechanics from Newton to Lagrange
Boudri, J.C.
2002, XVI, 280 p., Hardcover