3 International Manuals and International Law

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Gaps in the Treaty Law of Targeting

3.3 What Status Do the Recent Manuals Claim?
   3.3.1 San Remo Manual
   3.3.2 The ICRC Customary International Law Study (ICRC Study)
   3.3.3 Direct Participation in Hostilities and the ICRC Interpretive Guidance
   3.3.4 HCPR Manual on the Law of Air and Missile Warfare
   3.3.5 Tallinn Manual of the Law of Cyber Warfare

3.4 What Status in Law Do These Documents Actually Have?

3.5 Do These Manuals Have Utility and Should They Influence the Development of Law?

3.6 Are the Manuals Making New Law or Restating Existing Law?

3.7 Is This International Manual Process Something New?

3.8 Conclusion

References

4 Interacting Technologies and Legal Challenge

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Remotely Piloted Aircraft

4.3 Automation and Autonomy Distinguished

4.4 Autonomy in Attack and International Law

4.5 Unmanned Attack: What Does the AMW Manual Provide?

4.6 Precautions Against the Effects of Attacks

4.7 What are Cyber Operations and Cyber Attacks?

4.8 Characteristics of Cyber Warfare and Deception Operations
   4.8.1 Putting Cyber Deception Operations into a Historical Context
   4.8.2 Deception Operations: The Modern Law on Perfidy, Ruses and Misuse of Indicia
   4.8.3 Improper Use of Certain Indicators
   4.8.4 Espionage
   4.8.5 The Problem
5 Weapons Law and Future Conflict ........................................ 155
  5.1 Introduction ....................................................... 155
  5.2 Law of Armed Conflict Rules that Apply to Weaponry .......... 158
    5.2.1 The Customary Weapons Law Principles ................. 158
    5.2.2 Indiscriminate Weapons Rule ............................. 159
    5.2.3 Weapons Rules Protecting the Environment ............. 160
    5.2.4 Weapons Law Rules on Specific Weapons 
or Technologies ............................................. 162
  5.3 Weapon Reviews: The Treaty Rule .............................. 168
  5.4 Weapon Reviews: The Customary Rule .......................... 170
  5.5 Legal Criteria for Assessing Weapons, Means 
and Methods of Warfare ........................................... 171
  5.6 Applying Weapons Law Rules to Four Novel 
Technologies ................................................................ 174
    5.6.1 Autonomous Weapons ....................................... 174
    5.6.2 Cyber Weapons ............................................... 176
    5.6.3 Nanotechnology .............................................. 181
    5.6.4 Outer Space Weapons ....................................... 185
  5.7 Weapons Law and the Legal Spectrum of Conflict .............. 188
    5.7.1 Weapons Law and the Current Legal Spectrum ........ 189
    5.7.2 Weapons Law and Changes in the Legal 
Conflict Spectrum ..................................................... 192
  5.8 Conclusions .......................................................... 192
References ................................................................. 194

6 Legal Implications of Emerging Approaches to War ............. 197
  6.1 Introduction .......................................................... 197
  6.2 Enduring Methods of Warfare and 9/11 .......................... 201
  6.3 Particular Approaches to Warfare and Their Implications ... 205
    6.3.1 Remote Attack .................................................. 206
    6.3.2 Liability for Error in Remote Attack ...................... 208
    6.3.3 Wider Implications of Remote Attack ................. 214
    6.3.4 Effects-Based Attacks: Does Law Based 
on Distinction Make Sense? ...................................... 218
    6.3.5 Taking People Out of Warfare ............................. 223
  6.4 Asymmetric Armed Conflict ........................................ 227
  6.5 Causes of Future Conflict .......................................... 231
  6.6 Conclusion .......................................................... 234
References ................................................................. 235
7 People and the Legal Spectrum of Conflict

7.1 Introduction ...................................................... 241
7.2 The Users of Violence in Modern Conflicts .............. 243
  7.2.1 Armed Forces and Combatants .............................. 243
  7.2.2 Civilians Who Directly Participate in Hostilities .... 245
  7.2.3 Contractors’ Employees and Armed Conflict ........... 254
  7.2.4 People Involved in Non-international Armed Conflicts .... 256
  7.2.5 Mercenaries .............................................. 257
  7.2.6 Those Who Use Force in Conflicts Other than Armed Conflicts .... 260
7.3 Persons Whom the Law Would Protect in Armed Conflict .... 263
  7.3.1 Protected Persons Under the Law of Armed Conflict: Civilians .... 263
  7.3.2 Persons Specifically Protected Under the Law of Armed Conflict .... 265
  7.3.3 Protected Persons Under Domestic and Human Rights Law ... 267
7.4 Implications of Changes in the Nature of Conflict for the People Involved .... 268
  7.4.1 Civilianisation of the Battlespace ......................... 268
  7.4.2 Civilians and Military Cyber Operations ............... 269
  7.4.3 Civilians and Remotely Piloted and Autonomous Attack ........ 272
  7.4.4 Hostilities in Outer Space ................................ 274
7.5 Implications for Individuals of Changes to the Legal Spectrum of Conflict .... 274
7.6 Conclusion ..................................................... 275
References .......................................................... 277

8 Detention Operations: Legal Safeguards for Internees ....... 281

8.1 Introduction ...................................................... 281
8.2 Evolution of the Law Relating to Prisoners of War (PWs) and Civilian Detainees .... 284
8.3 The Law of International Armed Conflict as to PWs and Civilian Detainees ........... 286
  8.3.1 Prisoners of War Protection Under Geneva Convention III and API .... 287
  8.3.2 Civilians Protected Under Geneva Convention IV and API .......... 290
  8.3.3 Fundamental Guarantees Under API .......................... 292
8.4 Detainees in Non-international Armed Conflicts ............... 296
8.5 Internment and Human Rights Law
8.5.1 Internment, Human Rights Law
and International Armed Conflict 299
8.5.2 Internment, Human Rights Law
and Non-international Armed Conflict 300
8.5.3 Transfer of Internees 302
8.6 Detainees in Internal Security Situations 303
8.7 Future War and Detainee Operations 305
8.8 Copenhagen Process Principles and Guidelines 310
8.9 Conclusions 312
References 313

9 The Law of Armed Conflict and Human Rights Law

9.1 Introduction 318
9.2 Application of Human Rights Law 318
9.2.1 Human Rights Law in Peacetime 319
9.2.2 Human Rights Law in Armed Conflict:
The Views of Commentators 325
9.2.3 Human Rights Law and the Law of Armed
Conflict: The ICJ Judgments 331
9.2.4 The European Court of Human Rights’ Approach 334
9.2.5 Jurisdiction Under ECHR 337
9.3 Applying Human Rights Law to Specific Armed
Conflict Activities 340
9.3.1 Combat 340
9.3.2 Requisitioning 344
9.3.3 Article 5 Tribunals 345
9.3.4 Other Decisions 345
9.4 Applying Particular Rights in the Armed
Conflict Context 346
9.4.1 Liberty and Security of Person 346
9.4.2 Fair Trial 347
9.4.3 Respect for Private and Family Life 349
9.4.4 Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion 350
9.4.5 Freedom of Assembly 350
9.5 Factors to Determine When Human Rights Law Applies
in Armed Conflict 351
9.6 Other Human Rights Law Treaty Regimes 352
9.6.1 International Covenant on Civil
and Political Rights 352
9.6.2 United Nations Universal Declaration
of Human Rights 355
9.6.3 American Convention on Human Rights 356
### 10 Making Sense of the Human Rights Law/Law of Armed Conflict Conundrum: A Practical Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1 The Relationship as Established in Contemporary Jurisprudence</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Why is the Current Interpretation Unacceptable?</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 The Sources of International Law</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 Which Body of Law Have States Agreed Should Apply in Armed Conflicts?</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 The Pure Lex Specialis Interpretation</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6 The Need for an Alternative Approach</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7 A Suggested Framework for the Application of IHL and IHRtsL Norms</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.1 The Conduct of Hostilities</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.2 Article 5 Tribunals and Prisoners of War</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.3 Matters that Should Be Regulated Jointly by the Law of Armed Conflict and Human Rights Law</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.4 Matters Exclusively for Human Rights Law</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.7.5 Non-international Armed Conflict</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.8 What May Be the Effect of Emerging Approaches to Warfare?</td>
<td>385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.9 Stagnation in Development of the Treaty Law of Armed Conflict</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10 Is Doing Nothing an Option?</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.11 Conclusion</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 11 War in the Spotlight

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.1 Introduction</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 War Correspondents and Journalists</td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 The Diverse Media and Attempts to Control it</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4 Human Rights Law and Interference with Private Communications and with Journalism</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5 The Strategic Impact of News Media and Private Communications Reporting</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.6 New Trends in Warfare and the Media</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.7 Journalism, the Internet and Public Attitudes to Human Rights</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
11.8 When Law Becomes Part of the Spotlight .......................... 410
  11.8.1 Coroners’ Courts .............................................. 410
  11.8.2 Other Inquiries ................................................. 411
  11.8.3 Criminal Courts ................................................. 412
  11.8.4 Judicial Review, Human Rights Proceedings
          and Challenges at the Political Level ...................... 413
  11.8.5 International Courts and Tribunals ......................... 415
11.9 ‘Lawfare’ or ‘Politics’? ............................................. 417
11.10 Lawfare in the Digital Age .......................................... 419
11.11 Conclusion ............................................................ 424
References ................................................................. 426

12 Bringing the Strands Together ............................................ 429
  12.1 The Issues ............................................................ 429
  12.2 Discussion of the Issues ............................................ 431
    12.2.1 Respect for the Distinction Principle ...................... 431
    12.2.2 Human Rights Law and Gaps in the Law
          of Armed Conflict ............................................ 434
    12.2.3 The Nature of International Law and the State
          of the Law of Armed Conflict .............................. 435
    12.2.4 If New Treaty Law is Not Feasible,
          What Can States Do? .......................................... 439
    12.2.5 Crime in Warfare and Enforcement of the Law .......... 444
  12.3 Is the Purpose of War Changing? ................................ 449
  12.4 How Do Internal Security Operations Fit into This Mix? .... 452
  12.5 Classification Challenges Posed by Future Conflict .......... 454
  12.6 Some Suggested Conclusions ...................................... 454
References ................................................................. 461
Conflict Law
The Influence of New Weapons Technology, Human Rights and Emerging Actors
Boothby, W.H.
2014, XV, 464 p. 1 illus., Hardcover
A product of T.M.C. Asser Press