Contents

1 The Judicial Role and the Rule of Law .............................................. 1
   Introduction ................................................................................. 1
   Overview of the Book ............................................................... 8
   References ............................................................................... 11

Part I The War of Law

2 State Repression and the Rule of Law ........................................... 15
   Rule of Law and Wicked Rulers ............................................... 15
     The Ideal of the Rule of Law .................................................. 15
     Departures from the Ideal ....................................................... 17
   Transition from Rule of Law to Tyranny ................................... 19
   Oppression in Legal Forms: Is It Really Law? ......................... 22
   Inside and Outside of Law ....................................................... 31
   References ............................................................................... 33

3 Repression of the Judiciary ........................................................... 35
   The Need for Legitimacy .......................................................... 35
   Judicial Independence .............................................................. 39
   Purge of the Judiciary and Court Packing ................................ 45
   Limits to Jurisdiction and Special Courts ................................ 47
   Persuasion and Conditioning of Legal Minds ......................... 50
   References ............................................................................... 51

4 Judicial Acceptance of Oppression ................................................. 53
   Acceptance of the Legality of Authoritarian Regimes ............. 53
   Acceptance of Oppressive Aims and Policies ......................... 59
     Nazi Anti-semitism .............................................................. 60
   Extension Beyond Race ........................................................... 68
     South African Courts and Apartheid ..................................... 70
   Agreement with Oppressive Measures in Liberal Societies ....... 74
Protection of Vital State Interests ........................................... 74
Eugenics ............................................................................. 77
Disproportionate Punishment ............................................... 78
The Courts and Legal Repression ......................................... 86
References .......................................................................... 88

5 The Opposition ............................................................ 91
“The Flame of Law Never Quite Extinguished” ...................... 91
Issues of Legality .............................................................. 93
Restrictive Interpretation .................................................. 97
Opposition in the Twilight of Authoritarianism ..................... 108
Resistance and Legal Method ........................................... 110
References .......................................................................... 111

Part II Holding Judges Responsible for Injustice

6 The Argument for Criminal Liability .................................. 115
Introduction ......................................................................... 115
Methodological Considerations ......................................... 116
The Counterarguments ..................................................... 117
Judges as Culprits ............................................................ 118
References .......................................................................... 122

7 The Condition of Illegality Under International Law .......... 125
The Legal Basis for the Allied War Crimes Tribunals .......... 125
The US Military Tribunal Justice Case ............................. 126
The Acquittal of Nazi Judges ........................................... 130
References .......................................................................... 133

8 The Condition of Illegality and Failed Usurpations .......... 135
Judges and Revolution ..................................................... 135
Judges Under Foreign Occupation ................................... 136
References .......................................................................... 141

9 The Condition of Illegality in Transitional Settings .......... 143
The German Post-Nazism Restoration .......................... 143
The Judges of the GDR ................................................... 148
References .......................................................................... 150

10 Judges in Special Courts .................................................. 151
Authoritarian Regimes and Special Courts ...................... 151
The US Military Tribunal and Special Courts ................... 152
The View on Special Courts in Post-Nazi Germany .......... 154
Should Taking Office in a Special Court Be Criminal? ....... 156
References .......................................................................... 157
11 Justification of Judicial Oppression ............................................. 159
   Criminal Intent ........................................................................ 160
   The Eilifsen Case ..................................................................... 160
   Ignorance of Law ...................................................................... 161
   Duress .................................................................................. 166
   Discussion .............................................................................. 168
   References ............................................................................... 169

12 A Special Immunity for Judges? ................................................. 171
   Obligations and Orders .......................................................... 171
   Immunity and the Role of the Judge ......................................... 173
   Judicial Independence and Immunity ...................................... 177
   Division of Power ..................................................................... 185
   References ............................................................................... 187

13 Holding Judges Responsible ..................................................... 189
   A Fixed Core of Justice .......................................................... 189
   Why Are Not Judges Punished? .............................................. 191
   The Hurdle of Retroactivity .................................................... 193
   Does the Responsibility Go Far Enough? ................................. 198
   References ............................................................................... 201

Part III The Moral Side of Judging

14 The Positivism Thesis .............................................................. 205
   The Reasons for Judicial Complicity ........................................ 205
   Radbruch and the Discussion on Nazi Germany ....................... 208
   References ............................................................................... 213

15 What Positivism? ..................................................................... 215
   Undefined Positivism ............................................................ 215
   Positivism as Separation of Law and Morality .......................... 218
   Positivism as Formalism ......................................................... 220
   Alternatives to Positivism ....................................................... 221
   References ............................................................................... 224

16 Alternative Approaches to Legal Interpretation ....................... 227
   The Plain Fact Approach to Legal Interpretation ..................... 227
   The Dissonance Theory of Robert M. Cover .............................. 231
   References ............................................................................... 236

17 Beyond Legal Theory as Explanation ...................................... 237
   Do Legal Theories Influence Judicial Action? ............................ 237
   Psychological Factors ............................................................ 239
   Institutional Factors ............................................................. 243
   Entrapment and Erasure of Moral Identity ............................... 247
   References ............................................................................... 251
## Contents

18 **The Lesser Evil** ........................................ 253  
Administrating the Holocaust .................................... 253  
Exemptions from the Rule of Law .................................. 256  
The Lesser Evil Defence ........................................... 259  
Is Resignation the Only Viable Alternative? .................... 267  
A Realistic Calculus ............................................. 270  
Avoiding the Slippery Slope ...................................... 271  
References ....................................................... 272

19 **Judges for Justice** ........................................ 275  
Coming Out from Behind the Law .................................. 275  
Constitutional Provisions Against Acceptance of Authoritarianism? ... 276  
International Standards .......................................... 280  
The Politics of Legal Methodology ................................. 283  
Resistance for the Rule of Law .................................... 292  
References ....................................................... 300
Judges Against Justice
On Judges When the Rule of Law is Under Attack
Graver, H.P.
2015, X, 301 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-662-44292-0