## Contents

1 Introduction .......................................................... 1  
References ........................................................................ 7  

2 The Current Legal Status of the Right to Water ................. 9  
2.1 The Right to Water in Europe ..................................... 9  
  2.1.1 The Right to Water in National Law of European States . 9  
    2.1.1.1 The Right to Water in Germany .................... 10  
    2.1.1.2 The Right to Water in Belgium ................. 19  
    2.1.1.3 The Right to Water in France ..................... 25  
    2.1.1.4 Comparison of the Three European Approaches .. 30  
  2.1.2 The Right to Water in European Law ..................... 32  
    2.1.2.1 The Right to Water in the Law of the European Union ................................. 33  
    2.1.2.2 The Right to Water in the ECHR and the ESC .... 36  
  2.1.3 Conclusion and Analysis .................................... 37  
2.2 The Right to Water Outside of Europe ......................... 39  
2.2.1 The Right to Water in South African Law ................. 40  
  2.2.1.1 Protection of the Right to Water through South African Legislation ................. 41  
  2.2.1.2 Protection of the Right to Water through South African Courts .......... 43  
  2.2.1.3 Analysis of the Protection of the Right to Water in South Africa .................... 46  
2.2.2 The Right to Water in Indian Law ............................ 50  
  2.2.2.1 The Protection of the Right to Water through Indian Laws ......................... 50  
  2.2.2.2 The Protection of the Right to Water through Indian Courts .................. 51  
  2.2.2.3 Analysis of the Protection of the Right to Water in India ....................... 53  
2.2.3 Comparative Analysis of the South African and Indian Approaches ................................. 55  

xiii
2.3 A Human Right to Water in International Law ................................. 56
  2.3.1 Protection of the Right through International
      Conventions and Treaties ........................................... 57
  2.3.2 Interpretations of Treaties through Courts and
      Quasi-Courts ......................................................... 62
      2.3.2.1 General Decisions of International Courts and
              Quasi-Courts .................................................. 62
      2.3.2.2 General Comment No. 15 .............................. 64
  2.3.3 Protection of the Right to Water through International
      Custom ................................................................. 75
      2.3.3.1 Millennium Development Goal Number 7 .......... 77
      2.3.3.2 The UNGA Resolution on “The Human Right
              to Water and Sanitation” ..................................... 78
      2.3.3.3 The HRC Resolution “Human Rights and Access
              to Safe Drinking Water and Sanitation” .................. 82
      2.3.3.4 Renewal of the Mandate of the Independent Expert
              as Special Rapporteur ........................................ 83
      2.3.3.5 Assessment of the Current Situation ................... 84
  2.3.4 Protection of a Human Right to Water through General
      Principles of Law ..................................................... 86
  2.4 Conclusion .................. ............................................. 87
References  ........................................................................... 88

3 Philosophical and Conceptual Approaches to a Human Right to Water
  3.1 The “Water” Element of the Term “Human Right to Water” ............. 95
      3.1.1 Objection: We Cannot Hold a Right to a Tangible Thing ... 96
      3.1.2 Objection: The Time to Accept Water as a Right
              Is Not “Now” ..................................................... 97
      3.1.3 Conclusion ......................................................... 98
  3.2 The “Right” Element of the Term “Human Right to Water” ............ 98
      3.2.1 The Concept of a Right ......................................... 99
      3.2.2 Objection: We Cannot Accept a Right Without Choice ... 99
      3.2.3 Objection: There Is No Added Value of a Right to Water ...
              100
      3.2.4 Objection: There Cannot Be a Right, if it Cannot
              Be Enforced ....................................................... 101
      3.2.5 Objection: We Cannot Accept Rights Whose Realization
              Is “Impossible” .................................................. 103
      3.2.6 Conclusion ......................................................... 104
  3.3 The “Human” Element of the Term “Human Right to Water” ........... 105
      3.3.1 The Identifiable Schools of Human Rights .................. 105
      3.3.2 Water as a Human Right According to the
              Different Schools ............................................... 107
      3.3.3 Conclusion ......................................................... 108
3.4 The Shape of a Right to Water: Combining Existing Approaches ........................................... 108
  3.4.1 A Self-Standing Right or a Derived Right? .............. 109
  3.4.2 Deriving from What? Plea for a More Integrated Approach .............................................. 112
    3.4.2.1 Antiquated Understanding of the Right to Life .... 115
    3.4.2.2 Over-Categorization of Rights as Either Civil–Political or Socio-Economic .................. 117
    3.4.2.3 False Fear of Creating Unforeseeable State Obligations ........................................... 118
    3.4.2.4 Summary ........................................... 119
  3.4.3 Contouring the Right: Water and Sanitation—One or Two Rights? .................................... 120
  3.4.4 Different Legal Levels of Protection—Relationship of Constitutional Rights to Water and a Human Right to Water ........................................... 123
    3.4.4.1 The Relationship of Different Legal Orders After the Kadi-Case ................................... 125
    3.4.4.2 National Level of Protection Exceeding International Level of Protection ..................... 127
    3.4.4.3 International Level of Protection Exceeding National Level Protection ....................... 128
    3.4.4.4 Avoiding the Dilemma: Human Rights as Minimum, Not Uniform Standards .................. 129

3.5 Conclusion ............................................... 130

References ................................................................ 131

4 Implementation: Independent Monitoring, Enforcement Against the Private Sector, and International Realization .......... 135
  4.1 Independent Monitoring: The Case of the UN Special Rapporteur on the Human Right to Water and Sanitation .................. 136
    4.1.1 The Monitoring Role of Experts ......................... 136
    4.1.2 Analysis of the Mandate’s Undertaken Monitoring Efforts ........................................... 138
      4.1.2.1 Country Visits ......................................... 138
      4.1.2.2 Issues in Focus .......................................... 141
    4.1.3 Conclusion and Remaining Problems .................... 143
  4.2 Enforcing the Right in the Private Sector: The Case of Water Privatization ........................................... 145
    4.2.1 Preface: Conceptual Problems with the Right to Water and Privatization .......................... 146
      4.2.1.1 Market Principles Incompatible with Services to Fulfill Basic Needs? .................... 147
      4.2.1.2 Non-existence of Competitive Water Markets? ........................................... 148
      4.2.1.3 Water as a Non-private Good? ......................... 149
4.2.1.4 Current Dynamics of Supply and Demand: Increasing Water Prices? .......................... 151
4.2.1.5 Conclusion: Compatibility of the Right to Water and Privatization .......................... 151
4.2.2 Case Studies: The ICSID-Jurisdiction on Water Privatization .................................. 152
4.2.2.1 Compania de Aguas de Aconquija v. Argentine Republic .................................. 152
4.2.2.2 Azurix Corporation v. Argentine Republic ..................................................... 155
4.2.2.3 Aguas del Tunari v. Republic of Bolivia ............................................................. 158
4.2.3 The Right to Water as Solution for Challenges of Water Privatization .......................... 163
4.2.3.1 Consideration of the Right to Water in the Concession Contract .......................... 163
4.2.3.2 Requirement of Monitoring and Control ......................................................... 164
4.2.3.3 Inclusion of Procedural Rights ........................................................................ 165
4.2.3.4 The Right to Water as Mandatory Component of Judicial Review ..................... 167
4.2.4 Conclusion and Remaining Problems ........................................................................ 169
4.3 Realization by International Means: The Case of International Obligations Deriving from a Right to Water ..................................................... 170
4.3.1 International Water Obligations: The Philosophical Background ............................... 170
4.3.1.1 A Liability Model Approach to the International Obligation to Fulfill ...................... 171
4.3.1.2 Some Kantian and Consequentialist Approaches ............................................. 171
4.3.1.3 Rawlsian-Influenced Approaches ..................................................................... 172
4.3.1.4 A Water-Specific Approach to International Water Assistance: Hugo Grotius .......... 173
4.3.1.5 The Idea of Common Ownership of the Earth ................................................. 175
4.3.1.6 Conclusion: A Compelling Philosophical Case for International Water Assistance? ? 176
4.3.2 International Water Assistance: Existing Legal Implications .................................... 177
4.3.2.1 International Obligations in Human Rights Instruments ...................................... 178
4.3.2.2 Assessment of Existing International Water Obligations .................................. 178
4.3.3 International Water Obligations Under an Accepted Right to Water .......................... 179
4.3.3.1 International Obligations to Respect the Human Right to Water ......................... 179
4.3.3.2 International Duties to Protect the Human Right to Water .................................. 181
4.3.3.3 International Obligations to Fulfill the Human Right to Water ......................... 182
The Right(s) to Water
The Multi-Level Governance of a Unique Human Right
Thielbörger, P.
2014, XVII, 236 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-33907-3