Contents

1 An Overview of German Business or Enterprise Law and the One-Tier and Two-Tier Board Systems Contrasted .......... 1
   1.1 Introduction ............................................................ 1
   1.2 General Characteristics ................................................ 2
   1.3 Various Types of Business Organisations ............................. 4
   1.4 Contrasting the One-Tier and Two-Tier Board Systems .......... 8
   1.5 Delineation ............................................................ 14

2 An Overview of the Corporate Governance Debate in Germany .... 15
   2.1 Introduction ........................................................... 15
   2.2 History and Significance of the German ‘Corporate Governance’ Debate .................................................. 16
   2.3 Focus on the Supervisory Board ...................................... 20
   2.4 Important Role of Supervisory Boards and Recommendations for Improvement .................................................. 22
   2.5 Initial Reaction ........................................................ 24
   2.6 The German Corporate Governance Code .......................... 30
       2.6.1 Overview ....................................................... 30
       2.6.2 Section 161 of the AktG ....................................... 33
       2.6.3 Basic changes to the Code since 2002 ......................... 36
       2.6.4 Parts and Layout ............................................... 40
       2.6.5 Some Noteworthy Provisions of the Code .................... 41
       2.6.6 The Legal Nature of the Code ................................ 45
   2.7 Need for a European Corporate Governance Code ............... 49
   2.8 The Global Financial Crisis and Corporate Governance in Germany .......................................................... 51
   2.9 Concluding Remarks .................................................. 53
3 The General Meeting and the Management Board as Company Organs .......................................................... 55
  3.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 55
  3.2 The General Meeting .............................................................. 56
    3.2.1 Function as a Corporate Organ ...................................... 56
    3.2.2 Some Specific Functions ................................................. 57
    3.2.3 Emergence of Shareholder Activism in Germany ............ 59
  3.3 The Management Board ......................................................... 60
    3.3.1 Function as a Corporate Organ ...................................... 60
    3.3.2 Qualifications, Appointment, Removal and Compensation of Members ................................................. 61
    3.3.3 Rights, Powers and Responsibilities ................................... 71
    3.3.4 Duties and Forms of Liability .......................................... 80
  3.4 Concluding Remarks .............................................................. 88

4 The Supervisory Board as Company Organ ............................................... 91
  4.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 91
  4.2 Appointment Prerequisites ...................................................... 93
  4.3 Conditions of Appointment and Qualifications to Serve as Supervisory Board Members ........................................... 96
    4.3.1 General ........................................................................... 96
    4.3.2 Some EU Recommendations ............................................. 98
    4.3.3 Basic Knowledge of Economics, Law and Accounting ....... 99
    4.3.4 Additional Requirement Pertaining to Knowledge and Qualification ......................................................... 100
    4.3.5 Women ........................................................................... 101
    4.3.6 Conflicts of Interest ......................................................... 102
    4.3.7 Independence .................................................................... 103
    4.3.8 Former Members of Management Board Serving as Members of the Supervisory Board ....................... 105
    4.3.9 Number of Supervisory Boards an Individual Can Serve on ................................................................. 109
  4.4 Removal of Supervisory Board Members .................................. 111
  4.5 Compensation of Supervisory Board Members ......................... 113
  4.6 Rights and Responsibilities of Supervisory Board Members ........ 117
    4.6.1 Appointment and Removal of Management Board Members ................................................................. 117
    4.6.2 Determination of the Compensation of Management Board Members .................................................. 119
    4.6.3 Supervision ...................................................................... 123
    4.6.4 Reporting to the General Meeting .................................... 138
    4.6.5 Instituting Action Against Members of the Management Board for a Breach of Their Duties ............... 139
  4.7 General Duties and Forms of Liability ...................................... 140
  4.8 The Supervisory Board as Integral Part of the German Two-Tier Board System ......................................................... 145
  4.9 Concluding Remarks .............................................................. 147
5 The German System of Supervisory Codetermination

5.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 149
5.2 Historical Development of Codetermination (Mitbestimmung) ......................... 151
  5.2.1 Overview ........................................................................................................... 151
  5.2.2 Social Codetermination .................................................................................. 151
  5.2.3 Supervisory Codetermination ........................................................................ 154
  5.2.4 The Two-Tier Board System and Supervisory Codetermination Contrasted .............................................................................................................. 161
  5.2.5 Perceptions Regarding Codetermination in Germany from a Historic Perspective .............................................................................................................. 164
5.3 Current Practical Perspectives on Codetermination ............................................. 167
  5.3.1 General Concerns ............................................................................................ 167
  5.3.2 The Dependency of the Management Board on the Employee Delegates on the Supervisory Board .............................................................................. 173
  5.3.3 Some Recent Scandals Associated with Employee Representatives Serving on Supervisory Boards .............................................................................. 175
  5.3.4 The Mutual Take-Over Battle Between the VW SE and the Porsche SE: The VW SE Wins .............................................................................................................. 179
  5.3.5 Compensation of the Employee Representatives Serving on Supervisory Boards .............................................................................................................. 186
  5.3.6 Recent Proposals to Modify the System of Codetermination .......................... 187
5.4 Issues Related to Supervisory Codetermination .................................................. 191
  5.4.1 Codetermination in the Management Board: The Personnel Director ............. 191
  5.4.2 Classification of Employees .......................................................................... 193
  5.4.3 The Role of Trade Unions .............................................................................. 193
5.5 Concluding Remarks .............................................................................................. 195

6 The Impact of European Developments on German Codetermination and German Corporate Law .......................................................... 197
6.1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 198
6.2 Decisions by the European Court of Justice and Their Impact on German Codetermination .............................................................................................................. 199
  6.2.1 The Seat Theory as a Shield for the Maintenance of the German System of Codetermination .............................................................................................................. 199
  6.2.2 Decisions of the ECJ Enabling EU Companies to Move Their Seats into Another EU Country .............................................................................................................. 204
  6.2.3 Decisions of the ECJ Recognising National Barriers Against the Transfer of Companies’ Seats Abroad .......................................................... 210
  6.2.4 Reconciling the Two Lines of ECJ Decisions .................................................. 214
  6.2.5 Summary and Conclusions .......................................................................... 217
6.3 The Impact of the ECJ Rulings on German Courts, German Legislation and German Law Practice .............................................................................................................. 219
6.3.1 The Partial Conversion of German Courts to the Doctrine of Incorporation ............................................... 219
6.3.2 The Amendments of the German Statutes on Public and Private Limited Companies .............................. 224
6.3.3 German Companies Transform Themselves into English Limited Companies ........................................... 225
6.3.4 The Proposal by a German Government Commission for New Statutory Regulations on International Company Law .......................... 228
6.4 The Creation of the European Company (SE) and the System of EU Codetermination ............................................. 229
6.4.1 Stormy History ................................................ 229
6.4.2 The Regulation of the SE: Two-Tier Versus One-Tier Board System ................................................. 230
6.4.3 The Transfer of the Registered Seat of an SE .......... 231
6.4.4 The SE Employees’ Directive ................................ 233
6.4.5 The SE: A Success Story ..................................... 235
6.4.6 Advantages and Disadvantages of Incorporation as an SE ........................................................................ 236
6.4.7 The Relative Attractiveness of the Employees’ Codetermination Under the SE Regulation and Directive ... 239
6.4.8 A Re-Assessment of the SE Regulation .................... 241
6.4.9 A Re-Assessment of the SE Employees’ Directive ........ 243
6.5 The Creation of a Societas Europaea Privata (SPE) ............... 245
6.5.1 Some Fundamental Features of the Legal Framework of the SPE ............................................................. 246
6.5.2 Employees’ Codetermination Under the SPE Proposal ... 247
6.5.3 The Transfer of the Registered Seat of the SPE .......... 247
6.5.4 An Assessment of the Proposal for an SPE Including Its Rules on Employee Participation ................................. 248
6.6 Cross-Border Mergers of Limited Companies ..................... 249
6.6.1 The Sevic Decision by the European Court of Justice (2005) ............................................................... 249
6.6.2 The Directive on Cross-Border Mergers of Limited Companies and Germany’s Implementation of that Directive .................................................. 251
6.7 Recent Developments in a Nutshell ................................ 253
6.7.1 Some Fundamental Changes .................................. 253
6.7.2 Some Unwavering Institutions ................................ 267
6.8 Concluding Remarks ................................................ 269
6.8.1 Codetermination Wins in Acceptance .......................... 269
6.8.2 Driving Factors .................................................. 270

7 Accounting as the Documentary Proof of Good Corporate Governance ................................................................. 275
7.1 Back to the Future .......................................................... 276
7.2 Handling the ‘Invisible’ ....................................................... 277
7.3 Accounting Law .................................................... 278
  7.3.1 Accountability ................................................ 278
  7.3.2 A Complete Set of Financial Statements ..................... 280
  7.3.3 European Law and IFRS ...................................... 280
  7.3.4 General Rule (Bilanzwahrheit) and Conflict of Laws ...... 282
  7.3.5 IASB/IFRS: Lack of Legitimacy ............................. 283
  7.3.6 German and European Law (IFRS) ........................... 284
  7.3.7 Regulatory Interactions ...................................... 285
  7.3.8 Corporate Governance Statement (Directive 2006/46/EC) . 286

7.4 Financial Statements: ‘A True and Fair View’ ................. 287
  7.4.1 International Focus and Comparative Law ................... 287
  7.4.2 European Court of Justice (ECJ) ............................ 289
  7.4.3 Guidance ...................................................... 290
  7.4.4 IFRS, Company Law and Tax Law ............................ 291
  7.4.5 Rules of Accounting .......................................... 292
  7.4.6 Expectation Gaps and Procedural Law ....................... 293
  7.4.7 Completeness: No ‘Off-Balance Sheet’ ...................... 295

7.5 Valuation ............................................................ 296
  7.5.1 Financing and the ‘Numbers Game’ .......................... 296
  7.5.2 The Fall of Lehman Brothers Inc. ............................ 297
  7.5.3 The Legal Focus of Accounting Practice .................... 298
  7.5.4 The Procedural Law of Faithful Accounting ................. 300
  7.5.5 Conclusion for Corporate Directors and Auditors .......... 301

7.6 Accounting and Company Groups ................................. 301
  7.6.1 Consolidated Financial Statements ........................... 301
  7.6.2 Liability: Separate Legal Entity and International Taxation ......................................................... 303
  7.6.3 Cash Pooling and Liability .................................. 304

7.7 Accounting, International Allocation of Assets and Reform .... 305
  7.7.1 Legal Order and Competition ................................. 305
  7.7.2 Reform in Germany (‘BilMoG’) ............................... 306
  7.7.3 ‘BilMoG’: Some of the Rule Changes ........................ 307
  7.7.4 German and European Rule of Law ............................ 308
  7.7.5 Fair Competition? ............................................. 309
  7.7.6 Comparative Law: Regional ‘IFRS’ ........................... 311
  7.7.7 Linguistic Diversity and European ‘IFRS’ .................... 312
  7.7.8 European Accounting Law and Multijurisdictional Approach ................................................................. 313

7.8 Auditing, Control and Sanctions ................................... 315
  7.8.1 About Watchdogs and Materiality ............................ 315
  7.8.2 Reform and Lessons from the Crisis ........................ 316
  7.8.3 Disclosure and Enforcement .................................. 317
  7.8.4 Liability in the European Context ............................ 318
  7.8.5 Sanctions: Some Rules ........................................ 320
8 Banking on Trust: The German Financial Sector, Global Capital Markets and Corporate Finance and Governance 329
8.1 Introduction: Casino Wall Street 330
8.2 Reflections on Corporations, Capital and Banking 331
8.2.1 Corporation Finance 331
8.2.2 Common Law Concept of ‘Ownership’ 332
8.2.3 The Banks’ Dominant Role in Germany 332
8.3 Germany: The Traditional Position 334
8.3.1 Control Through the General Meeting 334
8.3.2 Control Through the Supervisory Board 335
8.3.3 Control Over the Management Board 336
8.4 International Influences 338
8.4.1 The Wind of Change 338
8.4.2 Controlling German Banks 339
8.5 Global Corporate Finance and Hyperspeculation 340
8.5.1 Governance: Financing of Infinite Brassiness 340
8.5.2 Exorbitance (Hyperspeculation) 341
8.5.3 The Goldman Sachs Case 343
8.5.4 Financial Engineering: Collateralized Debt Obligations and Credit Default Swaps 344
8.5.5 Deutsche Bank AG (International) 346
8.6 Macroeconomics of Corporate Governance 347
8.6.1 Real Economy and Systemic Risk: ‘Too-Big-to-Fail’? 347
8.6.2 The Practice of a Paradigm Shift 349
8.6.3 Legal Analysis of the Economy Instead of Exorbitance 349
8.7 European, German and Global Perspectives 351
8.7.1 Financial Institutions 351
8.7.2 Boards of Directors 352
8.7.3 Restriction of Mandates of the Supervisory Board 354
8.8 Concluding Remarks 356

9 Corporate Governance and Corporate Compliance 359
9.1 Corporate Compliance: Temporary Fashion and the Concept in Law 359
9.2 Interrelation Between Corporate Governance and Corporate Compliance: The Programme ........................................ 361
9.3 Corporate Compliance as a Management Task .................... 363
  9.3.1 The Duty of Legality as a Starting Point ...................... 363
  9.3.2 Organisational Duty as a Characteristic of the Duty of Legality for All AGs ............................................... 366
  9.3.3 Possible Content of the Duty to Establish a Compliance Department ...................................................... 370
  9.3.4 Legal Consequences of a Violation of the Duty to Establish a Compliance Department: Applicability of the Business Judgment Rule ........................................ 373
9.4 The Role of the Supervisory Board ................................ 376
  9.4.1 The Underlying Principle ...................................... 376
  9.4.2 Scope of the Monitoring Function ............................ 377
  9.4.3 Delegation to the Audit Committee ........................... 379
  9.4.4 Transmission Duties of the Compliance Department to the Supervisory Board in the Event of an Involvement of the Management Board ........................................ 380
9.5 Selected Specific Issues ............................................. 381
  9.5.1 Independence of the Compliance Department ............... 381
  9.5.2 Whistle-Blowing as a Necessary Part of a Compliance Department .......................................................... 383
  9.5.3 Particulars of Compliance Systems Within Company Groups .......................................................... 385
  9.5.4 Particularities for Investment Services Companies .......... 390
9.6 Summary: Corporate Governance and Corporate Compliance – A Conflicting Relationship? ........................................ 395

10 Corporate Governance in the EU, the OECD Principles of Corporate Governance and Corporate Governance in Selected Other Jurisdictions .......................................................... 399
10.1 Introduction ........................................................ 400
10.2 European Union ................................................... 401
  10.2.1 Enhancing Corporate Governance .......................... 401
  10.2.2 Reflections .................................................. 402
  10.2.3 Modernisation of the Regulatory Framework ............ 403
  10.2.4 The European Commission’s Projects .................... 403
  10.2.5 Internal Market and Convergence with Foreign GAAP .......................................................... 405
  10.2.6 European Corporate Governance Forum (ECGF) ........ 406
  10.2.7 The World Debt Crisis and Its Impact on the EU ...... 410
  10.2.8 Future Priorities .......................................... 411
  10.2.9 Regulatory Basics and Outlook ............................ 412
10.3 OECD Principles of Corporate Governance ...................... 413
10.3.1 Background to the OECD Principles of Corporate Governance ................................................ 413
10.3.2 Broad Aims and Application ................................................................. 415
10.3.3 Parts and Layout ........................................................................... 415
10.3.4 Ensuring the Basis for an Effective Corporate Governance Framework ................................... 416
10.3.5 Disclosure and Transparency ................................................................. 417
10.4 United States ......................................................................................... 418
10.4.1 Background to the Corporate Governance Debate in the USA ...................................................... 418
10.4.2 The American Law Institute’s Involvement in the Corporate Governance Debate ......................... 421
10.4.3 The Securities Exchange Commission .................................................... 423
10.4.4 The Sarbanes–Oxley Act of 2002: The USA Response to Collapses Like Enron and WorldCom .......... 424
10.4.5 Some Perspectives on SOX and Its Effect .................................................. 426
10.4.6 NYSE: Sections 303 and 303A – Corporate Governance Rules ..................................................... 428
10.4.7 Summary of the Most Important NYSE Corporate Governance Rules ........................................ 429
10.4.8 The Dodd–Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act (The Dodd–Frank Act) ............ 431
10.5 United Kingdom ...................................................................................... 433
10.5.1 Background to the Corporate Governance Debate in the United Kingdom .................................... 433
10.5.2 The Cadbury Report and the Unfolding of the Concept of ‘Corporate Governance’ in the United Kingdom ........ 433
10.5.4 The 2008 UK Combined Code and the 2010 UK Corporate Governance Code .............................. 449
10.6 Australia .............................................................................................. 452
10.6.1 Background to the Corporate Governance Debate in Australia ...................................................... 452
10.6.2 The Bosch Reports ........................................................................... 455
10.6.3 The Hilmer Report ........................................................................... 460
10.6.4 The Virtues of Good Corporate Governance in Australia Between 1991 and 1998 .................... 462
10.6.5 The IFSA Blue Book ........................................................................ 463
10.6.6 The Australian Securities and Investments Commission ............................................................ 465
10.6.7 The ASX Group ............................................................................ 469
10.7 Concluding Remarks ............................................................................. 473
European and German Provisions in English for Purposes of Chapter 7 ............................................................... 475

Index  .................................................................................................................. 493
German Corporate Governance in International and European Context
du Plessis, J.J.; Großfeld, B.; Luttermann, C.; Saenger, I.; Sandrock, O.; Casper, M.
2012, XLII, 502 p., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-642-23004-2