Contents

1 Discursive Strata ................................................................. 1
  1.1 Moral Strata ................................................................. 1
  1.2 Origins of Reflective Equilibrium ..................................... 3
  1.3 Problems with Reflective Equilibrium .............................. 5
    1.3.1 Moral Conservatism .............................................. 5
    1.3.2 Moral Diversity ................................................. 6
    1.3.3 The Moral Weight of Considered Judgments .................. 8
    1.3.4 The Nature of Considered Judgments .......................... 9
    1.3.5 Intuitionism ................................................... 10
  1.4 A Proposal for Wide Reflective Equilibrium ....................... 11
  1.5 Conclusion .............................................................. 14
References ........................................................................... 15

2 Saving the Moral Phenomena ............................................... 17
  2.1 Inductive Molding ....................................................... 17
  2.2 Core Classification ..................................................... 19
  2.3 Core Classification in Ethics .......................................... 21
    2.3.1 Prototype Theory ............................................... 21
    2.3.2 Washington’s Cherry Tree ...................................... 22
  2.4 A Standard for Analogy ................................................ 25
    2.4.1 Inductive Cogency ............................................... 26
    2.4.2 Analogy as Induction ........................................... 28
    2.4.3 Analogy and Inductive Strength ............................... 30
  2.5 Applying the Standard to Ethical Analogies ....................... 36
    2.5.1 Clash Points ..................................................... 36
    2.5.2 The Grain Merchant ............................................ 37
  2.6 Conclusion .............................................................. 41
References ........................................................................... 43

3 Comparative Decision Theory ............................................. 47
  3.1 Toward a Realistic Decision Theory .................................. 47
  3.2 How to Choose a Theory ............................................... 49
3.3 Decisions under Risk ......................................................... 54  
   3.3.1 The Basics ............................................................. 54  
   3.3.2 Adapting the Basics ............................................... 57  
3.4 Relative Disutility ......................................................... 64  
   3.4.1 The Hintikka-Pietarinen Proposal .............................. 64  
   3.4.2 Generalizing the Hintikka-Pietarinen Proposal ......... 65  
3.5 Comparative Decision Theory ......................................... 68  
   3.5.1 The Basic Binary Case ........................................... 68  
   3.5.2 The Full Binary Case ............................................. 72  
   3.5.3 The Finite General Case ......................................... 76  
3.6 Shoring Up the Foundations ........................................... 78  
   3.6.1 Transitivity ......................................................... 78  
   3.6.2 The Principle of Independence ................................. 81  
   3.6.3 Suspending Judgment ............................................ 87  
3.7 Conclusion ..................................................................... 89  
References ........................................................................... 90  

4 Working with Moral Means ............................................... 95  
   4.1 Moral Instrumentality .................................................. 95  
   4.2 Distinguishing Means .................................................. 96  
   4.3 Means, Ends, and Their Critics .................................... 97  
   4.4 Instrumental Moral Sentences ....................................... 99  
4.5 Practical Inference ........................................................ 101  
   4.5.1 The Practical Syllogism .......................................... 101  
   4.5.2 Assessing Practical Inference ................................... 106  
   4.5.3 Chaining Practical Inferences ................................. 113  
   4.5.4 The Kantian Alternative ......................................... 113  
4.6 Moral Theory Choice ...................................................... 117  
   4.6.1 Plausibility ............................................................. 118  
   4.6.2 Utility ................................................................. 123  
   4.6.3 Plausibilistic Expectation ....................................... 126  
4.7 Conclusion ..................................................................... 129  
References ........................................................................... 129  

5 Securing Our Moral Ends .................................................. 133  
   5.1 Moral Teleology ........................................................... 133  
   5.2 Distinguishing Ends ..................................................... 134  
   5.3 Justifying Ends ............................................................ 135  
   5.4 Teleological Moral Descriptions .................................... 138  
   5.5 Teleological Moral Directives ....................................... 141  
   5.5.1 Plausibility ............................................................. 143  
   5.5.2 Utility ................................................................. 144  
   5.5.3 Plausibilistic Expectation ....................................... 145  
   5.6 Amplifying Mixed Deontologism ................................. 147  
   5.7 Morality as an End ...................................................... 148
Contents

5.8 Why Coherence? ................................................................. 155
  5.8.1 Probabilistic Coherence .................................................. 155
  5.8.2 Plausibilistic Coherence ................................................ 158
  5.8.3 Coherence in Contemporary Epistemology .................... 165
5.9 Conclusion ........................................................................ 166
References ............................................................................. 166

6 Remedies for Reflective Disequilibrium .......................... 169
  6.1 Reflective Disequilibrium .................................................. 169
  6.2 Phenomenal Disequilibrium ............................................. 171
  6.3 Instrumental Disequilibrium ............................................. 176
  6.4 Teleological Disequilibrium ............................................. 178
  6.5 Extra-Moral Disequilibrium ............................................ 180
    6.5.1 Supererogation ......................................................... 181
    6.5.2 Moral Obligation ...................................................... 186
    6.5.3 Overridingness ......................................................... 190
  6.6 Conclusion ....................................................................... 190
References ............................................................................. 194

Index...................................................................................... 197
Moral Strata
Another Approach to Reflective Equilibrium
Welch, J.R.
2014, XI, 202 p. 17 illus., Hardcover
ISBN: 978-3-319-08012-3